

# Community College *of* Philadelphia

---

## STUDENT OUTCOMES COMMITTEE OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES

Thursday, June 6, 2019  
1:30 p.m.  
Conference Room M2-34

### AGENDA

- (1) 1:30 p.m. Executive Session
- (2) Public Session
  - (a) Approval of the Minutes of May 2, 2019 (A)
  - (b) Academic Program Reviews (A)
    - A.A.S. in Accounting
    - Accounting Paraprofessional Proficiency Certificate
    - Entrepreneurship Proficiency Certificate
  
    - What is the role of the Programs in the context of Guided Pathways?
    - What changes in the Program have occurred as a result of assessment?
    - To what extent does the Committee agree with the Program Review findings and recommendations?
    - What is the Committee's action recommendation to the full Board?
  - Guests: Dr. Pam Carter, Dean of Business and Technology  
Mr. Richard Saxton, Department Head, Business Administration
  - (c) Board Dashboard – Workforce Development (D)
    - What are the trends?
    - What are the factors that are influencing the trends?
    - What are the projected future trends?
  - (d) New Business

#### Attachments:

Minutes of May 2, 2019  
A.A.S. in Accounting  
Accounting Paraprofessional Proficiency Certificate  
Entrepreneurship Proficiency Certificate

**STUDENT OUTCOMES COMMITTEE OF THE  
BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

**MINUTES**

**Thursday, May 2, 2019  
1:30 p.m.  
Conference Room M2-34**

**Presiding:** Ms. Hernández Vélez

**Committee**

**Members:** Ms. Fulmore-Townsend, Ms. Jean-Baptiste, Ms. McPherson, Ms. Posoff (via phone)

**College**

**Members:** Mr. Coleman, Ms. de Fries, Dr. Gay, Dr. Generals, Dr. Hirsch, Dr. Roberts

**Guests:** Ms. Frizell, Ms. Gordon, Dr. Nagaswami, Ms. Quinn, Dr. Sweet

**(1) Executive Session**

The committee discussed recent promotion portfolios.

**(2) Public Session**

**(a) Approval of the Minutes of February 7, 2019**

The minutes were approved unanimously.

**(b) Academic Program Reviews: A.A. in Theater, Acting Proficiency Certificate, Technical Theater Proficiency Certificate**

Ms. Frizell, from the Office of Academic Assessment, provided an overview of the Theater A.A. program. She explained that many of the recommendations have already been addressed as the program began instituting program revisions throughout the review. Enrollment has decreased in the program, in part because of a recent large graduating class. The program has 1-2 percentage points more students on probation than the College average, but has a higher retention rate. Ms. Quinn, the program coordinator, commented on the program analysis. The program has many developmental English and ESL students. Many students go directly into the professional field upon graduation. Ms. Quinn would like to increase this, in addition to opportunities beyond acting and the visibility of the program. The program has made connections between students and the community. An example of this is working with the Greater Philadelphia Annual Auditions Student Program for students to audition for agents and theater companies; Ms. Quinn made the case for them to allow more two-year students to audition. The field is in a good position with

the expansion of TV programming, such as Netflix, Amazon, etc., of which College students have been part. Ms. Quinn provided some highlights from a survey of recent graduates and students who have transferred, including work experience and continued studies (70 out of 86 former students responded). Students are also involved with CCPTV and the Digital Video Production program. Dr. Gay noted that Ms. Quinn received a community award from the Irish Echo, that organizations with which Ms. Quinn works have received grants, and that these organizations have hired CCP students/alumni.

Ms. Quinn discussed how the Technical Theater proficiency certificate resulted from students who were not majors but were interested in Theater. This program addresses costumes, lighting, sound, set-building, new technology, crew jobs, and stage management. The program has found it challenging to run an advanced technical theater course, which is an option but not a requirement for the A.A. program. The program is attempting to run the course and will alert students who had not been able to take it in the past. Students are very interested in the PC programs. The faculty are planning to revise some program learning outcomes. Ms. McPherson noted that there are skills that are transferable to other areas, such as exhibition design. Ms. Quinn added that students perform in many ways outside of traditional acting roles, including acting out symptoms for medical students and performing at the National Constitution Center; such jobs are very flexible and offer an alternative to working in the service industry. Ms. McPherson commented that the program can encourage persons of color since they are still underrepresented in these exciting adjacent fields.

**Action: The Student Outcomes Committee unanimously recommended that the Board of Trustees accept the program reviews with approval for five years.**

**(c) Board Dashboard**

Dr. Hirsch presented the periodic update of the Board Dashboard, focusing on Student Success metrics. There has been a slight decline in Fall admissions for both full- and part-time first-time students, although the declines decreased for 2018-19. Dr. Hirsch explained that with the steady economy, fewer adults attend college part-time; this is a national issue for both two- and four-year institutions. To address this, the College has developed accelerated programs and short-term trainings, is recruiting more former students to return and complete their studies, and is promoting giving credit for work experience. Ms. McPherson asked about community colleges trying to position themselves as an economical choice for full-time students before transferring to a four-year institution. Dr. Hirsch noted that this is a smaller pool of students and that other institutions have seen larger declines. Dr. General added that in this competitive market, the four-year institutions have become more aggressive by adapting practices traditional to community colleges, such as admitting developmental education students and developing certificates. In the Fall, the College will be marketing online programs for students in rural counties with fewer educational options (such as Pike county).

Dr. Hirsch provided an updated Academic Pathways brochure to committee members. He explained that another strategy the College has undertaken is to develop new programs and opportunities, such as those in the Business, Entrepreneurship, and Law Academic Pathway: Tourism and Hospitality Management A.A., Fashion Merchandising and Marketing A.A.S., and Business Leadership A.A.S. The Liberal Arts and Communications Academic Pathway also has new programs, including two new post-baccalaureate ASL proficiency certificates and the new transfer Black Studies A.A. program. Under Health Care is a new accelerated Nursing program. Interest in the accelerated Nursing program has been so great, in part due to social media marketing, that the program was able to secure more clinical sites and expanded from 24 spots to over 30.

Regarding persistence metrics, the College is looking at Fall-to-Fall persistence for new full-time students to see if the recent decrease is an anomaly after the significant increase for 2016-17. The IPEDS three-year completion metric and the total percentage of satisfactory student outcomes (1.7 and 1.9) have moved in a positive direction, with the completion rate increasing to 16% for the 2015 cohort. The six-year completion rate has remained steady. For developmental education, the goal is to decrease the percent of students who place into developmental education; this decreased from 37% to 30% for Developmental English. This decrease occurred after the College recalibrated the placement test and instituted a co-requisite model. First-year success in the highest Developmental English course has increased, while the achievement gaps for first-year success in Developmental English have decreased.

Section 4.0 and additional momentum data will be presented at an upcoming meeting.

**(d) New Business**

There was no new business.

**Next Meeting**

The next meeting of the Student Outcomes Committee of the Board is scheduled for June 6, 2019 at 1:30 p.m. in Conference Room M2-34.

**Attachments:**

Minutes of February 7, 2019  
A.A. in Theater Program Review  
Acting Proficiency Certificate Program Review  
Technical Theater Proficiency Certificate Program Review  
Dashboard  
2018-19 Academic Pathways

Academic Program Review:  
AAS in Accounting  
Executive Summary

TERESA FRIZELL, RUQAYYAH ARCHIE, ELIZABETH GORDON

# 1. Executive Summary

## A. Key Findings for the period Fall 2013-Fall 2018:

### **Summary of Key findings**

In the period studied, enrollment and retention decreased. Students are meeting benchmarks on all assessments. On average, 24% of students failed or withdrew from courses. This indicates that the assessments may not be yielding useful data. During the period studied the Program added two full-time faculty members. In 2017 the Business Administration Department created BUSL 101, the Business, Entrepreneurship, and Law Pathway First Year Experience Course, which includes introductory information about the Accounting AAS. The Program and Dean plan to conduct an internal education campaign to ensure students are correctly informed of Accounting options within and outside of the Pathway community.

### **Enrollment and Demographics**

1. Full-time Program enrollment decreased by 52%, from 122 students in Fall 2013 to 59 in Spring 2018. Part-time enrollment decreased by 25%, from 234 students in Fall 2013 to 174 in Spring 2018. College-wide, full-time enrollment increased and part-time enrollment decreased by 19%, respectively.
2. Program enrollment averaged around 22% people who identified as Black Females, compared to 30% College-Wide. Program enrollment averaged 11% people who identified as Asian Females compared to 4% College-wide.
3. In 2016 and 2017 completions in the Accounting AAS at the College decreased by 5% while they increased at Bucks and Delaware County Community Colleges by 12.5% and 27%, respectively. 19 students completed the program at CCP, 18 at Montgomery, and 14 at Delaware.
4. The AAS can be completed entirely online.

### **Retention**

5. On average fall to fall, six percentage points more Accounting students returned to a different program than did across the College as a whole. The Program had a four percentage points lower graduation than the College.
6. 57% of students who declared Accounting as a major left the Program before they had earned 12 credits.

### **Success/Graduation**

7. The Program awarded 95 AAS degrees during the period under review. After an unusually large graduating class of 28 in 2015, the number of degrees awarded decreased by to 20 in 2016 and nine in 2018.

### **Transfer**

8. As an AAS, the program is designed to allow students to enter the workforce with an Associate degree. Students who wish to transfer can do so to a baccalaureate-completion program.

### **Advisory Committee**

9. The Business and Accounting Advisory Committee is comprised of more than 50% women and/or people of color.

### **Workforce Development**

10. The College alumni survey does not yield actionable data regarding career placement.

### **Assessment**

11. The Program has utilized a common assessment template to document the measurement Course Learning Outcomes as well as Program Level Outcomes. The Course Learning Outcomes are mapped on to the Program Learning Outcomes and tracked through spreadsheets.

12. Students are meeting the benchmark on all of the assessments.

13. An average of 24% (1,329) students failed or withdrew from Accounting 101 and 102, which are major requirements as well as service courses.

### **Cost**

14. At \$112 per credit hour in 2016-2017, the Program cost \$24 less per credit hour than the Business and Technology Division and \$69 less per credit hour than the College.

### **Prior Audit: 2014**

1. Clarification of the program's future directions given the current challenges: should the program continue to offer an AAS or is some other combination of degree and certificates more appropriate? The deadline for decisions about the future of the program will be completed by the end of Fall 2014. Changes will be implemented by Spring 2015.

Action taken: The faculty decided to keep the program as an AAS with the addition of a Post Baccalaureate Accounting Proficiency Certificate. It also decided to continue

with the Accounting Paraprofessional Proficiency Certificate.

2. Sustain and update the program management plan with participation of all faculty.

Action taken: The faculty decided to adopt a faculty advising activity by cohort, with each faculty being assigned to reach out to Accounting students to make sure they understood the transferability of the program and other opportunities. In 2017 the program added a First-Year Experience Course, BUSL 101. This course embeds conversations with faculty, counseling, and advising in the course content.

3. The program needs to continue to follow its plan for assessing student learning outcomes.

Action taken: The faculty adopted Pearson's Mylab for Accounting and continues to use this to assess student outcomes.

4. The program should further promote its proficiency certificate program.

Action taken: This has been included as a topic in BUSL 101 as one of the opportunities for students interested in Accounting.

5. In support of recommendation 1, above, the program needs to collect data appropriate for the decisions to be made including from alumni, practitioners, current students, and advisory board members.

Action taken: The Program built a larger, more complete, well-rounded advisory committee. Additionally, the Program hired 2 new faculty based on their continued to work in the field and membership in outside professional organizations. In these ways the Program ensures the delivery of curriculum that meets the needs of the workforce.

6. The program must, by Fall 2014, demonstrate that they are communicating to Accounting students upon entry into the College about the options for transfer and workforce entry and advise them about the best programmatic options for them at that time.

Action taken: We have changed our first semester sequence so students who enroll in Accounting AAS and take the proper sequence will meet with Advisors and Counselors as well as be part of BUSL 101 to help make sure students learn as soon as possible their options. We will conduct an internal education campaign to ensure the information being transmitted is correct and complete.

## B. Action Items

The Office of Assessment and Evaluation makes the following recommendations for the Program.

### **Enrollment and Demographics**

1. Explore the reasons peer Accounting AAS program completions are growing. Assess and apply appropriate tactics.



## Retention

2. Investigate reasons students depart the Program within the first twelve credits. Apply appropriate remediation.
3. Survey faculty and staff in the Business, Entrepreneurship, and Law Pathway and across the College about their perceptions of students' goals and work and transfer options. Correct misconceptions if found.
4. Survey students on their post-graduation transfer or work goals. Inform faculty per recommendation #3, above.
5. Review the BUSL 101 curriculum to ensure that students are correctly being informed of their work and transfer options. Correct if necessary.
6. Implement an education campaign to all internal stakeholders to ensure students are being correctly informed of their work and transfer options.
7. Utilize information gathered from students and faculty to create and implement a plan to meet the three- and five-year retention goals set by the Division and Program.

	3 Year		5 Year	
Headcount	310	60	350	100
	# increase/ decrease	% increase/ decrease	# increase/ decrease	% increase/ decrease
Returned to Same Program	132	42.45%	175	50%
Returned to Different Program	60	19.42%	35	10%
Graduated	29	9.45%	70	20%
Did Not Persist	89	28.68%	70	20%

8. Ensure all instructors are using Starfish early warning system. Conduct or request professional development if not.

## Workforce Development

9. Survey alumni regarding career placement.

## **Assessment**

10. Analyze the assessment for Accounting 101 in light of the fact that students in that course meet the benchmark for the assessment but a large number of students fail or withdraw from the course. If appropriate, make changes based on the analysis.

## **C. Narrative**

Accounting is the language of business, providing students with the fundamental ability to communicate financial information to both internal and external users of financial information.

By offering the AAS in Accounting degree, the college remains competitive and consistent with the programs that are offered at various surrounding community colleges as well as four-year universities. The community gains individuals who are able to satisfy the entry-level accounting needs of area employers. The program allows students to begin their career in accounting and gain valuable experience that will allow them to be successful in various business settings. The Key Performance Indicators show a decrease in the number of AAS in Accounting degrees awarded. According to the Program Coordinator, this can be attributed to the fact that students who are interested in transferring to institutions that are accredited by the Association to Advance Collegiate Schools in Business are advised to major in the Business General degree program in order to ensure that they will receive transfer credit for all of the courses that they have completed; however, this is a miscommunication that requires additional discussion with both internal and external parties of the college to ensure that students are receiving accurate information as it relates to their own personal goals and options for transfer if they so choose.

# Community College *of* Philadelphia

## Academic Program Review: Accounting Paraprofessional Proficiency Certificate

Teresa Frizell, Ruqayyah Archie

Spring 2019

# **1. Executive Summary**

## **A. Key Findings for the Period Fall 2013-Spring 2018**

### **Enrollment and Demographics**

1. Eighteen students are currently pursuing only the Certificate, with no other major declared. Nearly all are part-time.
2. The certificate enrolled 10 percentage points more people who identify as Black Males and a three percentage points fewer people who identify as Asian Females than the AAS.
3. The age demographics trended to the older end of the scale, with 50% of Certificate students aged 30+.

### **Retention**

4. Fall to fall 20% fewer Certificate-only students returned to the same Program than across the College. This discrepancy was mainly accounted for by the 57% of Certificate students who did not return to the College. Because of the small number of Certificate-only students, these figures amount to 1-2 students who returned to the Certificate Fall to Fall, and five students who did not return to the College Fall to fall.

### **Success/Graduation**

5. Forty-nine students have earned the Certificate since 2015.

### **Advisory Committee**

6. The Advisory Committee is comprised of more than 50% people of color or women.

### **Assessment**

7. Students are meeting the benchmark on all assessments.

## **B. Action Items**

**The Office of Assessment and Evaluation makes the following recommendations for the Certificate:**

### **Retention**

1. Explore retention programs targeted to working adults and Black Males.

### **Workforce Development**

2. Survey Certificate holders to assess alignment between earning the Certificate and becoming employed in the accounting field.

### **Assessment**

3. Investigate the discrepancy between the prediction of success made by performance on assessment instruments and the lack of success and persistence in the courses and Certificate program. Adjust assessment or curriculum as necessary to improve retention and completion.

### **C. Narrative**

Upon completion of the certificate program, students will be able to explain the contents of the financial statements in accordance with Generally Accepted Accounting Principles (GAAP), analyze and record accounting transactions, use computerized general ledger software, demonstrate the knowledge and skills that are required of entry-level accounting positions, and effectively communicate with users of financial information both in oral and written format. This set of knowledge and skills will prepare students for paraprofessional positions including a tax clerk, bookkeeper, or accounting clerk.

# Community College *of* Philadelphia

Academic Program Review:

## Entrepreneurship Proficiency Certificate

TERESA FRIZELL

## 1. Executive Summary

### A. Key Findings for the period

#### **Enrollment and Demographics**

1. Three students were pursuing only the Entrepreneurship Proficiency Certificate as of Spring 2018; all were part-time.

#### **Retention**

2. Between Fall 2016 and Spring 2018, zero students persisted at the College from Fall to Fall. One student persisted within the Certificate Program Fall-Spring for each of the previous two years.
3. All three students enrolled in the Certificate were in Good Academic Standing as of Spring 2018.

#### **Success/Graduation**

4. One student earned the Certificate. That person completed the Certificate Program in 2018.
5. ENTR 140, a required course, has run one time, in Summer 2018. As such, completion of the Certificate was not possible until this time.

#### **Assessment**

6. A majority of students met benchmarks with assessment scores of 75 or above for all course and Program learning outcomes.

#### **Special Expenditures and Resources**

7. The Entrepreneurship Proficiency Certificate costs to deliver per FTE are 21% less than the College's average cost per FTE and 12% less than the Business and Technology Division average.

## B. Action Items

The Office of Assessment and Evaluation makes the following recommendations for the Certificate Program:

### **Enrollment and Demographics**

1. Work with the Business Leadership Associate degree program faculty and the Business, Entrepreneurship, and Law Pathway community to promote the Entrepreneurship Certificate Program and to integrate Certificate smoothly into new degree program.
2. Conduct a needs assessment study to determine likely audiences for recruitment and the entrepreneurship educational requirements of those audiences.

### **Retention**

3. Survey students in ENTR 110 to establish a baseline of interest in enrollment in the Certificate Program and gather data on student expectations of entrepreneurship education.
4. Establish relationships with non-credit College programs focused on small businesses to create a network of opportunities for Entrepreneurship students.

### **Success/Graduation**

5. Monitor effects of integration into Business Leadership Associate degree program on Certificate completion rates.

### **Assessment**

6. Investigate the discrepancy between student success on assessment instruments, DFW rates in ENTR courses, and lack of persistence in the Certificate program. Adjust assessments or curriculum as necessary to foster student success.

## C. Narrative

The Entrepreneurship Proficiency Certificate was created to provide students with basic knowledge and skills to navigate their way through an ever-changing market place and job market. Entrepreneurial skills give individuals a competitive advantage in the job market and also enable them to apply the skills to effectively starting their own part-time or full-time ventures. According to the Program Coordinator, the Certificate Program faced a number of significant challenges in recruiting students and maintaining enrollment during its first years, primarily due to its placement within the Business and Technology Division. Effective Fall 2018, ENTR 150 was added to the Certificate Program, expanding the Program from twelve to sixteen credits so that students could receive financial aid for the courses. There are two



significant initiatives that can contribute to the Certificate's success in the future. The Division's new Business Leadership Associate degree will be launched during Fall 2019 and students will be able to enroll in the Entrepreneurship Proficiency Certificate and have the courses applied to the new Associate degree. For the first time, the Certificate will have a "home." The Division is also in dialogue with Drexel University's Close School of Entrepreneurship about using the existing articulation agreement between the schools to enable CCP students to transfer their entrepreneurship course credits to the Close School if they are accepted into a new degree Program that the Close School is offering. The Entrepreneurship Team continues to meet regularly to monitor enrollment, review course content, and discuss ways to improve the courses and the Certificate.