Community College *of* Philadelphia

STUDENT OUTCOMES COMMITTEE OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES

Thursday, October 4, 2018
1:30 p.m.
Conference Room M2-34

AGENDA

(1)   1:30 p.m.   Executive Session

(2)   Public Session

    (a) Approval of the Minutes of September 6, 2018   (A)

    (b) Academic Program Review Update: (A)
- Computer Information Systems- Information Technology
- Network and Systems Administration Proficiency Certificate
- Computer Science
- Computer Programming and Software Development Proficiency Certificate

- Does the Committee agree that sufficient documented evidence of student learning outcomes has been provided?
- Is the Committee satisfied with the plan to increase female students in the Programs?
- What is the Committee's action recommendation to the full Board?

      Guests: Dr. Pam Carter, Dean, Division of Business and Technology
          Ms. JoeWana Freeman, Department Head, Computer Technologies

    (c) Committee Orientation

- Student Demographics
- Board Dashboard
- CCRC-AACC Pathways Project Momentum Data
- Guided Pathways Areas of Focus
- Academic Program Review Process

    (d) New Business

Attachments:
Minutes of June 7, 2018
2018 Executive Summary Template APR
APR 2018 Table of Contents
Dashboard
KPI Data for Pathways Project

STUDENT OUTCOMES COMMITTEE OF THE
BOARD OF TRUSTEES

MINUTES

Thursday, September 6, 2018
1:30 p.m.
Conference Room M2-34

Presiding: Ms. Hernández Vélez

Committee
Members: Ms. Fulmore-Townsend, Rep. Roebuck

College
Members: Ms. de Fries, Dr. Gay, Dr. Generals, Dr. Hirsch, Dr. Roberts, Ms. Zellers

Guests: Mr. Bertram, Dr. Carter, Ms. Freeman, Ms. Frizell, Dr. Sweet

(1)   <u>**Executive Session**</u>

There were no agenda items for the Executive Session.

(2)   <u>**Public Session**</u>

(a) Approval of the Minutes of June 7, 2018
The minutes were approved unanimously.

(b) Academic Program Reviews: Building Science, Architecture, Interior Design,
Energy Conservation Academic Certificate

Ms. Frizell provided a brief overview of the review. She described how the
enrollments for the Architecture and Interior Design programs have increased and are
expected to continue to increase. The programs have a thorough assessment plan
under the current department head, with aligned assessments and data collection to
apply to program improvement. Regarding increasing enrollments, Dr. Sweet
explained that both are select programs and have been growing. Architecture is a
well-respected program in the community and had its highest enrollments in Fall
2018. Both programs have strengthened articulation agreements with four-year
institutions and have active advisory boards, with the goal of having students who are
well-prepared to transfer. She added that enrollment growth may be due to fine tuning
the coursework, a different direction under the current department head, and internal
marketing that highlights career possibilities. The academic pathway also has a
dedicated advisor assigned to it. Additionally, the programs will no longer require

2

that students pass a required introductory course before being able to enroll in the program. Removing this barrier should further increase enrollments.

Regarding the Building Science degree and the Energy Conservation Academic Certificate, Ms. Frizell noted that they are not performing as well. The coordinator position was vacant for a time and while the position was filled last year, it is vacant again. The programs have not been able to make progress on curricular edits, increasing industry connections, and strengthening marketing efforts. Per an action item in the reviews, the programs should examine their viability within the next academic year. Mr. Bertram explained that because enrollments are so small for these programs, increasing viability is the focus, as opposed to the make-up of the student population. Mr. Bertram also indicated that the programs would be interested in pursuing connections with high school programs, when possible.

Action: The Student Outcomes Committee unanimously recommended that the Board of Trustees accept the program review with approval for five years for the Interior Design and Architecture programs. The Committee deferred action for the Building Science and Energy Conservation programs; the programs should submit a follow-up report addressing the review recommendations for the November 2018 meeting.

(c) **Academic Program Review Update: Computer Information Systems-Information Technology, Network and Systems Administration Proficiency Certificate, Computer Science, Computer Programming and Software Development Proficiency Certificate**

Dr. Hirsch explained that when the academic program reviews were discussed at the last meeting, the Committee noted the lack of assessment materials submitted for the review and as such delayed action. Ms. Freeman gave an overview of the status of assessment in the programs. Many faculty have turned in course assessments, so that approximately fifty percent of outstanding reports were recently submitted and are being put into the department's Canvas repository. Any remaining reports should be submitted by the end of September. Ms. Freeman explained that because of the "state of things," she will do the program learning outcomes submission. Dr. Carter agreed that there has been an increase in submissions and is optimistic the assessments will be completed and that Ms. Freeman will complete the program learning outcomes assessments.

Action: The Student Outcomes Committee unanimously recommended the program submit a detailed report on the status of the assessments for the October 2018 meeting. The report should also include an update on efforts to increase the number of female students.

(d) **New Business**
    There was no new business.

<u>Next Meeting</u>
The next meeting of the Student Outcomes Committee of the Board is scheduled for
October 4, 2018 at 1:30 p.m. in Conference Room M2-34.

<u>Attachments</u>:
Minutes of June 7, 2018
Interior Design Program Review
Architecture Program Review
Building Science Program Review
Energy Conservation Certificate Program Review

Executive Summary

I.   The Executive Summary portion of the report include a bullet-pointed *Key Indicators* and *Action Items* portion, prior to the narrative report. These include a formal template of language; which would be utilized on every *APR*.

A. Key Findings – findings that are aligned with action items.

Enrollment and Demographics
Retention
Success/Graduation

Transfer
Assessment
Cost

B. Action Items "The Office of Assessment and Evaluation makes the following recommendations for the Program."

Enrollment and Demographics
Retention
Graduation

Transfer
Assessment
Cost

C. Narrative
A brief summary of key elements found in the report.

Body of the Report

II.   Program Analysis – this section is intended to allow faculty and program leadership to give a thoughtful view of the program with a goal of program improvement.

III. Program Description
A. Statement of Mission Alignment
B. Catalog Description
C. History and Revision to Curriculum
D. Curriculum Sequence

IV.   Chart of Program Faculty

Name	Rank	Courses Taught

V. Key Performance Indicators - 5 Years of Program Data
   A. Headcount
   B. Full-time/part-time enrollment
   C. Major/ New major
   D. Class Standing (dev, freshman, sophomore)
   E. Demographics (gender, race/ ethnicity, age
   F. Outcomes data: five-year trend (standing, retention, success at departure, outcomes)
   G. Degrees awarded
   H. Transfer at departure

	Did Not Transfer	Transferred	Grand Total
Total number of first-time enrolled students			
Earned 0-11 credits			
Earned 12-23 credits			
Earned 24-44 credits			
Earned 45 or more credits			
Graduated			
Total			

   I. Section Operating Efficiency
   J. Student Satisfaction Survey (optional**)
VI. Learning Outcomes and Assessment
   A. Curriculum Map
   B. Assessment Cycle Plan
   C. Course and Program Assessment Status (faculty contribution)
   D. Supported-Program Assessment (overview of assessments conducted to support learning outcomes of shared curricular programs and/or General Education competencies.)
VII. Environmental Scan
   A. Future Directions of the Program/Field (program contribution)
   B. Expected Job Growth
   C. Educational Attainment
   D. Peer Educational Programs
   E. Transfer Programs
VIII. Special Expenditures and Resources (faculty contribution and cost data)

Executive Summary

The Executive Summary portion of the report include a bullet-pointed *Key Indicators* and *Action Items* portion, prior to the narrative report. These include a formal template of language; which would be utilized on every *APR*.

A. Key Findings

For the period Fall 2013-Spring 2018:

Enrollment and Demographics

Retention

Success/Graduation

Transfer

Assessment

Cost

B. Action Items

The Office of Assessment and Evaluation makes the following recommendations for the Program.

Enrollment and Demographics
Retention
Success/Graduation
Transfer
Assessment
Cost

II.   Narrative

A brief summary of key elements found in the report.

Community College *of* Philadelphia

Dashboard

1.0   Student Success

Indicator of Success									
		2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	CCP Trend	Aspirational Cohort	CCP to Aspirational Cohort	5-Year Goal 2020
	Increase Enrollment								+3 to 5% pts
1.1	First-time Full-time (FTIC) Students (Fall Admission)	1,346	1,611	1,615	1,526	→			
1.2	First-time Part-time Students (Fall Admission)	2,940	2,744	2,442	2,174	↘			
1.3	Total Fall Credit Hours	158,471	160,972	152,326	147,244	↘			
	Increase Persistence	Fall 2014 to Fall 2015	Fall 2015 to Fall 2016	Fall 2016 to Fall 2017	Fall 2017 to Fall 2018				+5 to 7% pts
1.4	Fall to Fall New Full-time Students	53.5%	55.3%	58.5%	Data Available Nov. 2018	↗	61%	↗	
1.5	Fall to Fall New Part-time Students	40.8%	43.0%	42.7%	Data Available Nov. 2018	→	45%	↗	
1.6	Fall to Spring (All first-time) Students[1]	70.6%	72.0%	72.3%	Data Available Nov. 2018	→	Data Not Reported		

---

[1] All New Students (FTIC, Non-Degree Seeking, and Transfer)

Community College *of* Philadelphia

		2011 Cohort 2014	2012 Cohort 2015	2013 Cohort 2016	2014 Cohort 2017	2015 Cohort 2018	CCP Trend	Aspirational Cohort	CCP to Aspirational Cohort	5-Year Goal 2020
	Increase 3-Year CCP Completion									+7 to 10% pts
1.7	3-Yr Cohort, Full-time, First-time College Associate Degree/Certificate Awards (IPEDS)	10%	12%	12%	13%	16%	↗	25%	↘	
1.8	New Full-time Students Who Left the College Prior to Earning a Degree and Transferred within 3 years (IPEDS)	27%	25%	24%	21%	Available Summer 2019	↘	17.1%	↗	
1.9	Total percentage of satisfactory student outcomes[2]	37%	37%	36%	34%	Available Summer 2019	→	42.1%	↘	

		FTIC Cohort 2008	FTIC Cohort 2009	FTIC Cohort 2010	FTIC Cohort 2011*	CCP Trend	Aspirational Cohort	CCP to Aspirational Cohort	5-Year Goal 2020
	Increase 6-Year CCP Completion								+7 to 10% pts
1.10	6-Yr Cohort, Full-time, First-time College Associate Degree/Certificate Awards (National Community College Benchmark Project)	20%	19%	22%	21%	→	Data Not Reported		
1.11	New Full-time Students Who Left the College Prior to Earning a Degree and Transferred within 6 years	32%	31%	32%	30%	→	Data Not Reported		
1.12	Total percentage of satisfactory student outcomes	52%	50%	54%	51%		Data Not Reported		

*Projected data

		Grad Year 2015	Grad Year 2016	Grad Year 2017	Grad Year 2018	CCP Trend
	Increase Completion					
1.13	Unduplicated Number of Completers by Graduation Year	2,103	2,046	2,074	Data Available Nov. 2018	→

---

[2] Sum measures 1.7 + 1.8

Community College *of* Philadelphia

		2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	CCP Trend	5-Year Goal 2020
	Improve Success Rates of Students in Developmental English						+7% pts
1.14	Placed Developmental English (Decrease annually)	54.9%	46.6%[3]	36.8%[3]	Data Available Nov. 2018	↗	
1.15	First-Year Success in ENGL 098 (Increase annually)	63.8%	64.1%	63.6%	Data Available Nov. 2018	⇒	
1.16	Completed ENGL 101 within two years (Improve annually)	44.0%	40.9%	Data Available Dec. 2018	Data Available Dec. 2019		
	Improve Success Rates of Students in Developmental Math						+7% pts
1.17	Placed Developmental Math (Decrease annually)	46.4%	44.0%	51.5%[3]	Data Available Nov. 2018	↘	
1.18	First-Year Success in Foundational Math 017 (Increase annually)	35%	41%	52%	Data Available Nov. 2018	↗	
1.19	Completed FNMT 118 within two years (Improve annually)	17.0%	18.9%	Data Available Dec. 2018	Data Available Dec. 2019		
	Improve Achievement Gap in First Year Success in Developmental English						+5% pts
1.20	All First-time	63.8%	64.1%	63.6%	Data Available Nov. 2018	⇒	
1.21	Black	59.7%	58.6%	59.5%	Data Available Nov. 2018	⇒	
1.22	Hispanic	65.4%	64.9%	66.7%	Data Available Nov. 2018	↗	
1.23	White	73.2%	77.1%	76.6%	Data Available Nov. 2018	⇒	

[3] Reflects changes in placement cut-off scores

Community College of Philadelphia

	Improve Career Preparation and Employment	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	5-Year Goal 2020
1.24	Career Program Job Placement Rates[4]	85.2%	87.6%	84.9%	90%
1.25	Career Program Graduates' Wages and Wage Growth	$43,123	$41,253	$43,173	Rate of Inflation
1.26	Licensure Exam Pass Rates				
	Clinical Laboratory Technology	100%	86%	100%	90%
	Dental Hygiene	100%	100%	100%	100%
	Diagnostic Medical Imaging	100%	100%	100%	100%
	Nursing	67.1%	83.2%	87.5%	90%
	Respiratory Care Technology	100%	100%	100%	100%

2.0   Facilities

2.0	Facilities	Updates	Target Completion	Progress	5-Year Goal 2020
	Projects				
2.1	Facilities Master Plan	Master Plan for Board Approval	October, 2017	100%	100%
2.2	The Hamilton	Construction Started	August/December 2018	50%	100%
2.3	Expansion of West Regional Center	Project Finalization	Summer 2018	25%	100%
2.4	Mint Steps Replacement	Completed	October/November 2017	100%	100%
2.5	Biology Lab Renovations	Work Progressing	Summer 2018	95%	100%
2.6	Library/Learning Commons	HDR Design Progressing	Spring/Summer 2018	25%	100%
2.7	Public Art	Footing/Installation of Artwork	Summer 2018	20%	100%

[4] For Indicators 1.24 and 1.25, data are obtained via graduate surveys conducted six months after graduation.

Community College *of* Philadelphia

3.0   Finance

3.0	Finance	Quarterly Report September 2017 (In Millions)	Quarterly Report December 2017 (In Million)	Quarterly Report March 2018 (In Millions)	Quarterly Report June 2018 (In Millions)	
3.1	Operating Budget Status 2017-2018	$29.5M	$31.6M	$33.8M	$35.5M	
3.2	Operating Cash Position 2017-2018	$18M	$35M	$40M	$20M	
3.3	Long Term Cash Investments 2017-2018	$22M	$22M	$22M	$22M	
		FY 17-18	FY 18-19	FY 19-20	FY 20-21	FY 21-22
3.4	Stabilize % of Operating Revenues from Student Sources	57%	57%	57%	57%	57%
3.5	Stabilize Reserve Balance as % of Operating Budget	28%	28%	28%	28%	28%
3.6	Liquidity as % of Operating Budget	34%	34%	34%	34%	34%

4.0   Workforce Development

4.0	Workforce Development	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	5-Year Goal 2020
4.1	Annual Enrollments – Contract Training, Open Enrollment, Corporate College	2,904	3,031	3,298	+3-5% (3,093)
4.2	Revenue (after expenses)	$1,166,266	$1,306,304	$1,614,183	+35%
4.3	Number of Unique Clients Served (WedNet, Contract Training, Corporate College)	43	50	31*	90

* New Business Development Director Hired

Community College *of* Philadelphia

		2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	5-Year Goal 2020
4.4	10KSB # of Businesses Served Annually (Cohorts)*	83 (Cohorts 9, 10, 11)	64 (Cohort 12, 13, 14 Graduation)	91 (Cohort 15, 16, 17 Graduation)	90
4.5	10KSB Retention Rate	99% (Cohorts 1-10)	99% (Cohorts 1-13)	99% (Cohorts 1-16)	99%
4.6	10KSB % Scholars Who Increased Revenues at 6 months	72% (Cohorts 1-8)	71% (Cohorts 1-11)	Update Nov. 2018	+2% Nat'l Average
4.7	10KSB % Scholars who created Jobs at 6 months	52% (Cohorts 1-8)	53% (Cohorts 1-11)	Update Nov. 2018	+2% Nat'l Average
4.8	Career Connections Total Student Contacts	4,512	3,399	Update Nov. 2018	+20%
4.8a	Career Connections Number of Student Career Related Activities/Participants	82/1,349	168/2851	Update Nov. 2018	+20%
4.9	Career Connections Number of Employer Engagement Opportunities/Participants/Employers	2/354/75 Career Fairs Only	54/1,188/155	Update Nov. 2018	+20%
4.9a	Students Interviewed/Students Hired	Not Previously Tracked	Not Previously Tracked	Update Nov. 2018	+10%
4.10	Career Connections – Technology Tool Usage: Jobs/Internships Posted, Student Registrations, Big Interview and Virtual Job Shadow	Not Previously Tracked	Not Previously Tracked	Update Nov. 2018	+5%
4.11	Career Connections - Experiential Learning Opportunities Created	Not an existing activity	Not an existing activity	Update Nov. 2018	+5%

*10KSB Grant Renewal through September 2018

5.0   Community Relationships

5.0	Community Relationships	2016-17	2017-18	5-Year Goal 2020
5.1	Number of College-community partnerships	30	43	50
5.2	Number of student volunteer hours	86	2,260	10,000
5.3	Monetary value of faculty/staff volunteer hours	$1,120	$59,717	$500,000
5.4	Number of visitors for events open to the public	1,200	1,600	3,000

AACC Pathways Project

INSTITUTION: Community College of Philadelphia

CCRC COMMUNITY COLLEGE RESEARCH CENTER
TEACHERS COLLEGE, COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY

	Fall 2010:		Fall 2011:		Fall 2012:		Fall 2013:		Fall 2014:		Fall 2015:		Fall 2016:		Fall 2017:	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
Total FTEIC Students in cohort*	**4,066**	100%	**4,139**	100%	**4,105**	100%	**4,244**	100%	**4,289**	100%	**4,358**	100%	**4,058**	100%	**3,700**	100%
Credit Momentum KPIs																
Earned 6+ college credits in 1st term	1240	30.5%	1236	29.9%	1209	29.5%	1194	28.1%	1157	27.0%	1,361	31.2%	1,609	39.7%	1,489	40.2%
Earned 12+ college credits in 1st term	251	6.2%	258	6.2%	226	5.5%	238	5.6%	229	5.3%	349	8.0%	414	10.2%	402	10.9%
Earned 15+ college credits in year 1	967	23.8%	885	21.4%	872	21.2%	872	20.5%	867	20.2%	1,044	24.0%	1,095	27.0%	1,002	27.1%
Earned 24+ college credits in year 1	250	6.1%	220	5.3%	232	5.7%	186	4.4%	221	5.2%	299	6.9%	347	8.6%	329	8.9%
Earned 30+ college credits in year 1	72	1.8%	74	1.8%	52	1.3%	63	1.5%	68	1.6%	92	2.1%	84	2.1%	106	2.9%
Attempted 15+ credits (any level) in the first term**	102	2.5%	102	2.5%	110	2.7%	98	2.3%	111	2.6%	138	3.2%	152	3.7%	155	4.2%
Attempted 30+ credits (any level) in the first year**	268	6.6%	216	5.2%	215	5.2%	187	4.4%	196	4.6%	226	5.2%	236	5.8%	294	7.9%
Gateway Math and English Completion KPIs																
Completed college math in year 1	1064	26.2%	1115	26.9%	1156	28.2%	1212	28.6%	1145	26.7%	1,344	30.8%	1,005	24.8%	929	25.1%
Completed college english in year 1	1363	33.5%	1379	33.3%	1329	32.4%	1470	34.6%	1572	36.7%	1,716	39.4%	1,776	43.8%	1,708	46.2%
Completed both college math and English in year 1	649	16.0%	675	16.3%	643	15.7%	737	17.4%	733	17.1%	893	20.5%	693	17.1%	712	19.2%
Persistence KPI																
Persisted from term 1 to term 2	3,024	74.4%	2,977	71.9%	2,994	72.9%	3,031	71.4%	3,089	72.0%	3,197	73.4%	2,989	73.7%	2,710	73.2%
College Course Completion KPIs																
Total College Credits Completed	33024	70.4%	32172	70.9%	31809	71.5%	31343	71.4%	31367	70.4%	35320	70.8%	35915	73.6%	33222	72.3%
Total College Credits Attempted	*46929*		*45365*		*44507*		*43891*		*44550*		*49901*		*48767*		*45922*	

*First-time Ever in College (FTEIC): A student who enrolls for the first time in college during the given fall term with no previous college level experience or credential.

**These KPIs were not included in the previous request for the fall 2010-2015 cohorts.

Student Demographics

	Fall 2010:		Fall 2011:		Fall 2012:		Fall 2013:		Fall 2014:		Fall 2015:		Fall 2016:		Fall 2017:	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
Total FTEIC Students in cohort	**4,066**	100%	**4,139**	100%	**4,105**	100%	**4,244**	100%	**4,289**	100%	**4,358**	100%	**4,058**	100%	**3,700**	100%
Placement unknown	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%
College-ready	928	22.8%	935	22.6%	982	23.9%	1018	24.0%	1017	23.7%	1260	28.9%	1165	28.7%	1005	27.2%
Referred to dev ed in 1 subject	908	22.3%	1020	24.6%	1078	26.3%	1111	26.2%	1113	26.0%	1150	26.4%	1313	32.4%	1033	27.9%
Referred to dev ed in 2 subjects	1147	28.2%	1318	31.8%	1263	30.8%	1298	30.6%	1225	28.6%	1034	23.7%	711	17.5%	924	25.0%
Referred to dev ed in 3 subjects	1083	26.6%	866	20.9%	782	19.0%	817	19.3%	935	21.8%	914	21.0%	869	21.4%	748	20.2%
Females	2365	58.2%	2383	57.6%	2297	56.0%	2382	56.1%	2433	56.7%	2440	56.0%	2254	55.5%	2112	57.1%
Traditional college age	2110	51.9%	2031	49.1%	1989	48.5%	2085	49.1%	2090	48.7%	2376	54.5%	2262	55.7%	1913	51.7%
Full-time	1782	43.8%	1486	35.9%	1413	34.4%	1358	32.0%	1347	31.4%	1617	37.1%	1616	39.8%	1526	41.2%