

ZOOM MEETING OF THE BUSINESS AFFAIRS COMMITTEE OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES

**Community College of Philadelphia
Wednesday, March 24, 2021 - 9:00 A.M.**

Present for the Business Affairs Committee: Lydia Hernández Vélez, Esq., presiding, Mr. Rob Dubow, Mr. Harold Epps, Mr. Steve Herzog, and Mr. Michael Soileau

Present for the Administration: Dr. Donald Guy General, Mr. Jacob Eapen, Ms. Susan Hauck, Ms. Marsia Henley, Mr. Gim Lim, Dr. Shannon Rooney, Mr. Derrick Sawyer, Mr. Vijay Sonty, Mr. John Wiggins, and Victoria L. Zellers, Esq.

Guest: Ms. Sabrina Maynard, City of Philadelphia, Office of the Director of Finance

PUBLIC SESSION

AGENDA

Ms. Hernández Vélez called the meeting to order at 9:04 A.M. and asked Mr. Eapen to begin with first agenda item: Café Management (RFP).

PUBLIC SESSION

AGENDA

(1) Café Management (RFP) (Action Item):

Mr. Eapen stated that on February 12th, RFP #10138 was issued seeking a Tenant to lease and operate the new Library and Learning Commons Café using the e-bid platform, PennBid. There was a mandatory Pre-Bid/Site Tour held on February 22nd which yielded six companies: LeJeune and Associated, LLC (DBE); Saxby's; Starbucks; Canteen/Compass; Heartland Hospitality Group; and Uncle Bobbie's Coffee and Books (MBE). Proposals were due March 16th. Only Saxby's submitted a proposal. Below is a summary of Saxby's proposal.

Mr. Eapen reviewed the following Saxby's Proposal Components:

Saxby's Proposal Components

Lease & Retail Operations Summary:

- Lease – Five (5)-year lease; with two (2), two (2)-year mutually agreed-upon options.
- Rents - Greater of either five percent (5%) of gross annual sales or \$15,000, paid in monthly installments.
- Equipment – Saxby/s will provide the equipment, either new or used in good condition.

- Maintenance – Saxby's will be responsible for equipment and premise interior maintenance and repairs.
- Menu & Pricing – Saxby's will set menu options and pricing with College review. Saxby's will have the right to increase prices once per year. Average price increase will not exceed five percent (5%).
- Signage- Saxby's and the College will mutually agree on interior signage what can be seen from the exterior.
- Staffing – Saxby's will hire a Student Café Executive Officer (CEO) to paid a stipend/salary. The Café team will all be CCP students paid a minimum of \$9.50/hr.

Mr. Eapen then reviewed the following Experiential Learning Platform Summary:

Experiential Learning Platform (ELP) Summary

- Café Operations - Completely student operated with the CEO responsible for team development, financial management and community leadership with oversight and support from Saxby's Management team (VP of Operations, Head of Area Operations & other Saxby support team members).
- Academic Credit – The Student C.E.O. role will be filled by a current student who earns full academic credit (the equivalent of a full semester or 12 credits) through the College.
- Leadership – The Café will have other leadership positions such as Team Leads, Certified Trainers or Certified Recruiters.

Ms. Henley provided the demographics on Saxby's. She stated that Saxby's has 701 employees and 28% are diverse. Saxby's is based in Philadelphia.

Ms. Zellers pointed out that Mr. Nick Bayer is on the CCP's Foundation Board. However, the College followed its Conflict of Interest Policy, and Mr. Bayer disclosed this information in the Saxby's bid. Additionally, Ms. Zellers highlighted that Saxby's appears to be the only café operator that provides student experiential learning-type cafés.

Mr. Epps was curious as to why Saxby's only submitted a proposal. Mr. Eapen stated that he, Ms. Zellers and Ms. Henley participated in the pre-bid conference. He reported that there were six firms that participated; and staff got the impression the firms were interested but only one firm submitted a proposal. Mr. Eapen added that the College will be responsible for the build-out of the café.

Mr. Epps moved and Mr. Dubow seconded the motion that the Business Affairs Committee recommend to the full Board to enter into a lease with Saxby's to operate the new Library Learning Commons Café for five (5) years; with two (2), two (2)-year mutually agreed-upon options. The motion passed unanimously.

(2) Catto Scholarship Office Renovations (RFP) (Action Item):

Mr. Eapen reported that the College is renovating the former Student Academic Computer Center (SACC) spaces in the second floor of the Bonnell Building to accommodate the Catto

Scholarship hires. This renovation will require modification of the spaces (three classroom spaces) to include: minor wall relocation, installation of new office walls, door installations and replacements and installation of new finishes (flooring, ceiling and paint), minor electrical and data relocation, and new light fixture installations.

Mr. Eapen stated that the RFP # 10135 was issued February 3rd, a Pre-bid Meeting was held on February 17th where seven General Contractors attended and bid on all trades, four of which were DBEs: Bittenbender (WBE); New Age Development (DBE); The Riff Group (WBE); and LSN (MBE). The RFP yielded 3 responses. See Attachment A for pricing results.

Mr. Eapen stated that the cost of the project is \$313,950. He pointed out that staff budgeted \$480,000 for renovations, and that the College will have to spend roughly \$25,000 for additional HVAC work and also pay for the architect. The furniture costs for the project are separate and are currently being bid.

Ms. Henley spoke to the demographics on Bittenbender. She stated that the Bittenbender is a WBE firm located in Philadelphia. Bittenbender has 49 employees, of which 12% are diverse.

Mr. Dubow moved and Mr. Herzog seconded the motion that the Business Affairs Committee recommend to the full Board to enter into a contract with the lowest responsible bidder, Bittenbender Construction LP, for the Catto Scholarship Office Renovations for the base bid amount of \$313,950 which shall be paid from the Catto funds from the City. The motion passed unanimously.

(3) Purchase of Kaltura Software Platform (Action Item):

Mr. Eapen summarized from the below description on the Kaltura Software Platform by stating that Kaltura is a cloud-based video platform that powers video on demand and live experiences. He stated that Kaltura is a tool needed for faculty by driving student engagement and providing interactive learning. He stated that the Kaltura's tools integrates well with Canvas, the College's Learning Management System. He mentioned that a critical use for video content has been in recording classes for subsequent asynchronous viewing by students. (Please refer to the below description of the Kaltura Software Platform.)

Community College of Philadelphia Educational Need:

Kaltura is a cloud-based video platform that powers video on demand and live experiences increasingly used by faculty in all disciplines to drive student engagement and provide interactive learning. The abrupt switch to all online courses stimulated an immediate and massive acceleration in the use of video as an instructional tool. Common uses for this technology include desktop capture, live streaming, student-produced content, centrally managed video lessons for a wide variety of courses, and archived videos and resources for administrative purposes. This amplified new reality greatly exacerbated the longstanding need for a video management system.

Benefit to Students

Kaltura tools are tightly integrated within the Canvas learning management system (LMS), allowing students to access media galleries as part of a specific course or through the video portal.

Students can use it to view recorded presentations, supplementary materials, communicate with their instructors, and more. Kaltura enables students to record content for assignments and share with their instructor and/or fellow students. This is one of many features that Kaltura provides in the base product, instead of an add-on option as with other video management solutions.

A critical use for video content has been in recording classes for subsequent asynchronous viewing by students. The ease of use of Kaltura for lecture capture is a strong Kaltura feature that also provides basic editing capabilities, another feature that is not available in most other products. And since all courses must be accessible to and usable by individuals with disabilities, Kaltura's ability to provide automated machine captioning for all content is invaluable and unique, as it is only available at an added cost with other products. Kaltura has a unique integration with Zoom, enabling automatic ingestion of recorded Zoom sessions for centralized management and publishing. Moreover, Kaltura has the unique ability to share this content across multiple sites, and the capacity to leverage its unlimited storage.

Why Kaltura Specifically?

The purchase of Kaltura will ensure a robust and accessible utilization of video campus-wide that no other product can provide, while providing a cloud-based solution to the College's critical video storage requirements. Kaltura is the only solution on the Market that is an open-source video platform. The significance is protection against vendor lock-in, open documentation and APIs, ability to customize and integrate, and a cost-effective pricing model. As the market leader in the EDU space, it continues to deliver new technologies, rolling out frequent updates to their video software and administrative tools.

Mr. Eapen stated that other products assessed were Panapto (3-year total \$287,207) and Echo 360 (3-year total \$342,000) and came in significantly higher than Kaltura (3-year total \$120,780). He stated that Kaltura was the best product for the College's environment. Mr. Eapen reported that institutional CARES Act dollars will be used for the first year. However, the second and third year is subject to the DOE (Department of Education).

Ms. Henley reported on the demographics of Kaltura. She stated that Kaltura is based in New York. Kaltura has 134 employees, of which 23% are diverse.

Mr. Epps moved and Mr. Herzog seconded the motion that the Business Affairs Committee recommend to the full Board the purchase of a 36-month license for the Kaltura software platform in the amount of \$120,780. The motion passed unanimously.

(4) Marketing and Website RFP (Action Item):

Mr. Eapen stated that in January 2021, the College issued an RFP for branding, marketing and website services. A total of 16 agencies bid on the project, and the RFP evaluation committee asked 5 to conduct presentations on their work before identifying two finalists. Dr. General's met with both finalists and agreed with the committee's unanimous recommendation to award the work to the South Philadelphia-based firm P'unk Ave. The engagement is expected to last up to 18 months and the estimated investment over that engagement is an amount not exceed \$759,441. Deliverables from the project include extensive research and reporting about market

opportunities and the College's reputation as well as a new visual identity system and a new website.

Please note the following attachments:

Attachment B – Evaluation Committee

Attachment C – Evaluation Criteria

- Narrowing 16 Bidders to 5 Bidders
- Narrowing 5 Bidders to 2 Finalists

Attachment D – Price Breakdown for Five Bidders

Dr. Rooney recapped that the project was presented in a Board session in the Fall. She stated that this is a 3-phase project. The first phase entails that the firm do a qualitative and quantitative marketing analysis and perception study of the College among faculty, staff, students, alumni, citizens, City officials, and business partners. The second and third phases will produce a new logo and brand book. Dr. Rooney mentioned that given the scope of this work, the Evaluation Committee had a very engaged RFP process. She stated that the decision from the Evaluation Committee was unanimous, and that Dr. General concurred that P'unk Ave brings a unique understanding of the City of Philadelphia.

Mr. Soileau stated that this project will support the various organizations across the College, deliver a meaningful Capital Campaign, enable the College to reach the aspirations related to the Aspen, and enable the College to engage our alumni in a meaningful way. He stated that he was impressed by the passion and enthusiasm that P'unk Ave displayed on the role that community college plays.

Mr. Epps suggested that the remaining Board members would benefit from viewing the presentation. The Committee concurred.

Ms. Henley provided the demographics on P'unk Ave. She stated that P'unk Ave has 27 employees, of which 25% are diverse. P'unk Ave has five owners, one of whom is African American which makes the company 20% African-American owned. Ms. Henley stated that the firm is based in South Philadelphia.

P'unk Ave's cost proposal was discussed with the Committee. Mr. Soileau requested that a 10% contingency be built into the approved amount of \$759,441. Mr. Epps asked if the project was budgeted. Mr. Eapen responded that \$250,000 is budgeted this year; and that the remaining amount will be budgeted in FY 2022. Mr. Dubow asked if the company was okay to be paid the \$250,000 in this year, and the remaining amount in the following year. Dr. Rooney responded in the affirmative.

Mr. Epps moved and Mr. Herzog seconded the motion that the Business Affairs Committee recommend to the full Board to enter into a contract with P'unk Ave for the Marketing and Website RFP in an amount of \$759,441 plus a 10% contingency for a period of up to 18 months. The motion passed unanimously.

(5) Data Center Network Infrastructure Upgrade Contract with Graybar Electric Company, Inc. for \$598,816 (Action Item):

The data center is serving a critical role in expanding capabilities for the enterprise networking. This architecture consists of core routers, aggregation routers, and access switches. Getting CCP ready for hybrid cloud and modern cloud applications will require us to modernize all aspects of our IT framework: Infrastructure, Networks, Applications, and Data Center.

Current Landscape:

- Updated network and security requirements leaves the current network deficient
- Aging equipment that are/approaching end of life

Risks Identified:

- Multiple single points of failure resulting in prolonged outages
- Security deficiencies leaves data and systems vulnerable

Our goal is to replace both end-of-life Cisco 6509 Catalyst Core Switches and the Cisco 3705X-48 Edge Switches at the Main Campus and Northeast regional center data centers allowing for high availability, high performance, and increased ease of management.

On October 31, 2020 Cisco announced the end-of-sale and end-of-life dates for our Core and Edge Switches. The last date that Cisco Engineering may release any final software maintenance releases or bug fixes is October 30, 2021. After this date, Cisco Engineering will no longer develop, repair, maintain, or test the product software.

The RFP bid consists of hardware/software/support to replace our current Cisco 6509 switches and Cisco Catalyst 3750X-48 located at Main Campus and NERC and added 35 new wireless access points. The only responsible bid was received from Graybar Electric Company, Inc.

Mr. Eapen requested that Mr. Sonty report on the item. Mr. Sonty stated that the College's current network infrastructure is approximately 12-13 years old. It is actually near end of life. As of September of this year, the infrastructure in place will no longer be supported. He stated that the current system has many networking components. Mr. Sonty stated that this proposal entails the upgrade of the Data Center network infrastructure, as well as the Core and Edge switches and 35 new wireless access points. Overall, Mr. Sonty stated that this a cost-effective proposal and will give the College 10-15 years of life with built-in safety mechanisms.

Mr. Eapen stated that this purchase can be accomplished using CARES Act institutional dollars including a three-year maintenance and support.

Ms. Henley reported on the demographics of Graybar. She stated that Graybar is a national company with a local office in Philadelphia. Graybar's local demographics are: 78 employees, of which 18% are diverse.

Mr. Soileau asked who is the manufacturer of the equipment. Mr. Sonty responded that it is Cisco. Mr. Epps requested that Mr. Sonty talk more about the life span of the equipment. Mr. Sonty stated that in a higher education setting, the network infrastructure life's span is 10 years, and that the College's system is around 12-13 years old. Mr. Epps asked why only one bid was received. Ms. Henley stated that the second bid was non-compliant. The firm did not submit any documentation that was requested through the College's bid process posted *via* PennBid. Additionally, Ms. Henley stated that the second bid was not the lowest bid.

In response to a question posed by Mr. Dubow, Mr. Eppen stated that if the College was not able to use CARES Act institutional dollars, then the College was planning to use funds from the reserve for technology.

Mr. Herzog moved and Mr. Epps seconded the motion that the Business Affairs Committee recommend to the full Board that the Data Center Network Upgrade Project be awarded to Graybar Electric Company, Inc. at the total cost of \$598,816 which includes a three-year maintenance and support. The purchase shall be made using CARES Act institutional dollars. The motion passed unanimously.

The Public Session adjourned at 9:28 A.M.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

An Executive Session followed the Public Session involving various legal matters.

JE/lm

ATTACHMENT A
Pricing Results
Catto Scholarship Office Renovations RFP

Reference Number	Description	UOM	Quantity	Bittenbender Construction LP. (WBE)	PARKOROURKE Assoc.	New Age Development Group (DBE)
Base Bid Summary				\$313,905.00	\$379,375.00	\$408,006.00
100	General Construction for RFP#10135	Lot	1	\$148,675.00	\$161,375.00	\$155,166.00
200	HVAC for RFP#10135	Lot	1	\$66,765.00	\$79,800.00	\$112,447.00
300	Fire Suppression for RFP#10135	Lot	1	\$7,650.00	\$15,400.00	\$20,727.00
100	Electrical Construction for RFP#10135	Lot	1	\$90,815.00	\$122,800.00	\$119,666.00

ATTACHMENT B
**Evaluation Committee for the Marketing
and Website RFP**

Michael Soileau – Member of the Board of Trustees

Roz McPherson – Member of the Board of Trustees

Shannon Rooney - Vice President, Enrollment Management & Strategic Communications

David Thomas - Vice President, Strategic Initiatives & Community Engagement

Pam Carter - Dean of Business & Technology

Eve Markman - Executive Director of Creative Services

Kris Henk – Executive Director of Marketing

Vijay Sonty - Associate Vice President for Information Technology

Carol de Fries - Director, Academic and Student Success Operations

ATTACHMENT C
Evaluation Criteria for the Marketing and Website RFP
Narrowing 16 Bidders to 5 Bidders

Evaluation Criteria*

Project Team - Experience, Qualifications & Commitment to Project Goals

Firm - Experience and Past Project Performance on similar projects within the last 7 years.

Method for Accomplishing the Scope of Work - Organization of work, Unique Capabilities, Understanding appropriate level of effort required (hrs./tasks) etc.

Mission alignment with College's values

Capacity to do work that is innovative in the field

Commitment to Diversity & Inclusion

Price (Financial Proposal)

Quality and thoroughness of proposal

Evaluation Criteria for the Marketing and Website RFP – Narrowing 5 Bidders to 2 Finalists

Evaluation Criteria*

Project Team: Does team exude interest in and understanding of this project? Do they demonstrate the capacity to connect with our constituents? Does the agency and their subcontractors have the breadth and depth of expertise we need for all elements of the project? Are they folks we'd like to work with?

Firm: *Has this agency done other relevant work? Did they convey an understanding of similar projects or mission alignment?*

Project Plan: Did the agency convey an understanding of breadth of work? Does their plan for completion seem sound? Is it adequately in-depth in each phase?

Mission alignment: Did the agency convey an understanding of CCP's fundamental values and needs?

Creative quality: Did the agency's creative work (design and copy) inspire or excite you? Was it unique in the field?

Conceptual quality: Did the concept(s) behind the case studies and shared work from the agency convey capacity for innovative work?

ATTACHMENT D
Price Breakdown for Five Bidders
Marketing and Website RFP

Below is the price breakdown for five bidders:

LevLane: \$836,800.00

P'unk: \$759,441.00

JPL Paskill Stapleton & Lord: \$473,900.00

VisionPoint: \$309,377.50

Littlem Giant Creative: \$112,100.00