



MEETING OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES
Thursday, February 6, 2020 – 3:00 p.m.
Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom – M2-1

Table of Contents

(1)	Agenda	Pages 2-3
(2)	Proceedings and Minutes of Decisions and Resolutions Meeting of November 7, 2019	Pages 4-11
(3)	Gifts and Grants	Pages 12-14
(4)	Minutes of the November 7, 2019 and January 23, 2020 Student Outcomes Committee	Pages 15-34
(5)	Minutes of the November 20, 2019 and January 9, 2020 Combined Meetings of the Business Affairs and Executive Committees, and the January 29, 2020 Meeting of the Business Affairs Committee	Pages 35-58
(6)	February Calendar of Events	Pages 59-60

#####

MEETING OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES

AGENDA

Thursday, February 6, 2020 – 3:00 p.m.

Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom, M2-1

- (1) Meeting Called to Order
- (2) Public Comment
- (3) Report of the Business Affairs Committee
- (4) Report of the Student Outcomes Committee
- (5) Consent Agenda
 - (a) Proceedings and Minutes of Decisions and Resolutions
Meeting of November 7, 2019
 - (b) Gifts and Grants
 - (c) Mint Freight Elevator Modernization RFP and Recommendation to Award
 - (d) AV Equipment for Library and Learning Commons
 - (e) New Contract Date with Follett
 - (f) IT Infrastructure Equipment for Library & Learning Commons
 - (g) Authorization to Execute Lease for 4701 Chestnut Street, the Parking Lot
Location for the College's Career and Advanced Technology Center in
West Philadelphia
 - (h) Approval of Bids Received for the Career and Advanced Technology Center
 - (i) Approval of Structural Repairs for the Center for Business and Industry Parking
Garage
 - (j) Approval of Grant Thornton as the College's Independent Auditor for a Three-Year
Period with Two Option Years
 - (k) Approval of Benefits Consulting Services
 - (l) Amendment to the Lease Agreement for 1500 Spring Garden Street, 7th Floor
- (6) Report of the Chair
 - (a) CCP Gala and Board Commitment of 20K
- (7) Foundation Report
- (8) Report of the President

(9) New Business

(10) Next Meeting: Thursday, April 2, 2020 – 3:00 p.m.
Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom, M2-1

(11) Executive Session

Future Committee Meetings:

Business Affairs: Wednesday, February 19 and March 18, 2020
9:00 a.m. – Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom, M2-1

Student Outcomes: Thursday, April 2, 2020
1:00 p.m. – M2-34

Audit Committee: Thursday, March 26, 2020
12:00 noon – Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom

Upcoming Events

Community College National
Legislative Summit February 9-12, 2020
Marriott Marquis Hotel
901 Massachusetts Avenue, NW
Washington, DC

Spring Recess – College Closed March 2-7, 2020

Edward R. Becker Citizenship Award Ceremony Monday, March 16, 2020
8:30 a.m. – Center for Business and Industry
1751 Callowhill Street, Room C2-5

Pennsylvania Commission for Community
Colleges Annual Meeting and All-PA
Academic Awards April 6-7, 2020
Hilton Harrisburg
1 North 2nd Street
Harrisburg, PA

Lobby Day Tuesday, April 7, 2020
Capitol Building – Harrisburg

#####

COMMUNITY COLLEGE OF PHILADELPHIA
Proceedings of the Meeting of the Board of Trustees
Thursday, November 7, 2019 – 3:00 p.m.

Present: Mr. White, presiding; Mr. Dubow, Ms. Fulmore-Townsend, Ms. Hernández Vélez, Mr. Herzog, Ms. McPherson, Ms. Posoff, Representative Roebuck, Dr. Generals, Dr. Gay, Mr. Eapen, Dr. Hirsch, Ms. de Fries, Ms. DiGregorio, Ms. Rooney, Ms. Sessoms, Dr. Waller, and Ms. Zellers

(1) Meeting Called to Order

Mr. White called the meeting to order.

Mr. White introduced Mr. Rob Dubow, newly appointed member of the Board of Trustees.

Mr. Dubow stated that he has always had an interest in education in general as being a key element in the City of Philadelphia. He indicated that the City's focus has been on K-12, but that the City wanted to extend it to Community College of Philadelphia.

Members of the Board welcomed Mr. Dubow.

(2) Public Comment

There were no requests for Public Comment.

(3) Report of the Business Affairs Committee

At the request Mr. White, Mr. Eapen called attention to the following items that are listed in the Consent Agenda:

- Bookstore Management RFP – Mr. Eapen stated that the College issued an RFP for the management of the College's Bookstore since the contract with Barnes & Noble expires December 31, 2019. He stated that only two proposals were received namely from Barnes and Noble and Follett Higher Education. Mr. Eapen stated that the Committee was recommending that Follett Higher Education be awarded a five-year contract with two (2) one (1) year extension options effective January 1, 2020; and
- Request to Update the Commonfund Resolution – Mr. Eapen stated that the Commonfund has requested that the College provide an updated Resolution for the Commonfund specific accounts in which the College is currently invested and changing the authorized representative to Jacob Eapen and Gim Lim. He stated that this will be relevant for placing transactions into and out of the funds, as well as providing approval when signatures are required.

Mr. Eapen reported that the Committee had also discussed the Naming Rights for the Library and Learning Commons. The gift level was determined by 50% of the cost of the space and an assessment of how appealing each space might be to a donor.

(4) Report of the Student Outcomes Committee

Ms. Fulmore-Townsend reported that the Student Outcomes Committee had met on October 3, 2019. She stated that the Student Outcomes Committee is energized. Ms. Fulmore-Townsend stated that the academic program reviewed by the Committee, A.S. in Biology, is listed on the Consent Agenda. Ms. Fulmore stated that the Committee discussed the program's high retention rate, best practices, and diversity of faculty that contribute to successful student outcomes.

Ms. Fulmore-Townsend reported that the Committee had also discussed the dashboard. She stated that the dashboard should be fully explored by the Committee so that data is clearly accessible to all members of the Board. Ms. Fulmore-Townsend stated that the Committee was provided with an overview of workforce development and internship strategies. She stated that the conversation will be continued.

Mr. White stated that he would like to have a discussion of the dashboard at every meeting of the Board of Trustees beginning on February 6, 2020.

(5) Consent Agenda

Mr. White requested Board approval of the following Consent Agenda:

- (a) Proceedings and Minutes of Decisions and Resolutions
Meeting of October 3, 2019
- (b) Gifts and Grants
- (c) Academic Program Review: A.S. in Biology
- (d) Request to Update the Commonfund Resolution

Ms. Hernández Vélez moved, with Ms. Posoff seconding, that the Board approve the Consent Agenda. The motion carried unanimously.

(6) Report of the Chair

Mr. White stated that since the Board does not meet in December and January, he planned to schedule Executive Committee meetings during the months of December 2019 and January 2020.

(6a) Association of Community College Trustees
Annual Congress, October 9-11, 2019

Mr. White reported that he, Dr. General, Mr. Clancy, Ms. Ireland, Ms. Fulmore-Townsend, and Representative Roebuck had attended the Association of Community College Trustees Annual Congress in San Francisco on October 9-11, 2019. He stated that the Congress had a very good program especially for new Board members about the role of trustees in moving colleges forward.

Ms. Fulmore-Townsend reported that she had attended a number of workshops at the Congress. She stated that several of the workshops were related to the use of data and lack of digital literacy. Ms. Fulmore-Townsend stated that she had also attended a workshop on equity and the need for Boards to have serious conversations related to equity, and the need to articulate an equity agenda.

Dr. General stated that he had attended a workshop on the Higher Education Reauthorization Act which has implications for community colleges. He stated that he had also attended a workshop on the Promise Scholarship indicating that the number of city and state supported Promise scholarships are growing.

Mr. White stated that the issue of declining enrollment nationally was also a key topic at the Congress.

(6b) AACC/ACCT Community College
National Legislative Summit, February 9-12, 2020
Marriott Marquis Hotel, Washington, DC

Mr. White reported that the AACC/ACCT Community College National Legislative Summit is scheduled to take place February 9-12, 2020 at the Marriott Marquis Hotel, 901 Massachusetts Avenue, NW in Washington, DC. He stated that the Summit is an opportunity for trustees to advocate on behalf of the College at the federal level. Mr. White stated that the deadline for the early bird registration is December 20, 2019. Members of the Board interested in attending may contact the President's Office for meeting arrangements.

(7) Foundation Report

At the request of Mr. White, Dr. Waller, President, Foundation Board, reported that the Black and Gold Gala is scheduled for June 10, 2020 at the Crystal Tea Room. It was noted that there should be a target amount for Board participation.

Mr. Eapen reported that the Office of Institutional Advancement has retained a consultant for the implementation and execution of the College's capital campaign. He indicated that the campaign will highlight the College's 55-year Anniversary. Mr. Eapen stated that a comprehensive campaign will be undertaken to raise funds, and that the target will be set when the consultant is on board.

Mr. Eapen reported that representatives from the Lenfest Foundation will be visiting the West Philadelphia Regional Center on November 8, 2019 to discuss the Career and Advanced Technology Center project.

Mr. Eapen reported that \$200,000 in scholarships has been awarded to students, and \$77,000 has been awarded to students by the Joseph and Marie Field Scholarship.

At the request of Mr. Eapen, Ms. Bluestone reported that the Foundation hosted a salon dinner on October 21, 2019. She stated that the Foundation invited a selected group of donors and future donors to the event. Ms. Bluestone stated that the dinner had been successful, and that the group was very excited and engaged. She stated that verbal commitments at the dinner totaled \$55,000. Ms. Bluestone stated that she will be following up on participants in the dinner.

Ms. Posoff requested that members of the Board of Trustees be notified regarding future Foundation salon dinners.

Mr. Eapen reported that the College has retained the firm of Bridge Partners to conduct the search for the Vice President for Institutional Advancement. He stated that Mr. Soileau will participate in the review of candidates for the position.

(8) Report of the President

Dr. Generals called attention to his memorandum in the Board folder outlining activities in which he participated October 4 – November 7, 2019.

(8a) Career and Advanced Technology Center

Dr. Generals called attention to a binder containing information on the Career and Advanced Technology Center project at the West Regional Center. He stated that the binder will be helpful to everyone in articulating all aspects of the project. Dr. Generals stated that the Board will be provided with copies of updates for inclusion in the binder as the College moves forward with the project.

Representative Roebuck suggested that an article should be written regarding the Career and Advanced Technology Center so that the West Philadelphia community is updated on the project.

(8b) Off-Campus Events

Dr. Generals reported that he had attended the second Faith-Based Breakfast on November 4, 2019. He stated that about 25 community leaders attended. Dr. Generals stated that the breakfast is an opportunity to reach out and build relationships with the faith-based community. Dr. Generals thanked Dr. Waller for organizing the event.

Dr. Generals reported that he served as a panelist at the B.PHL. “Lightning Round on Education” on October 15, 2019. He stated that the session focused on innovation in public and higher education, generating equity and access, and why investing in education at all levels will always yield the greatest societal dividends. Dr. Generals stated that other panel members included William Hite, Superintendent, School District of Philadelphia; Donna Cooper, Executive Director, Public Citizens for Children and Youth; and Wendy Raymond, President, Haverford College.

(8c) Announcements

Dr. Generals congratulated Ms. Fulmore-Townsend on her being one of the honorees to receive The Promise of America Award from America’s Promise Alliance on October 24, 2019. The Promise of America Award is the organization’s highest honor, recognizing extraordinary individuals who have made an exceptional difference in the lives of young people.

Members of the Board congratulated Ms. Fulmore-Townsend on her achievement.

Dr. Generals reported that he had met with Richard Bliss, Professor, Babson College, on October 31, 2019 regarding the Goldman Sachs 10KSB Program. He stated that the visit was very positive.

Dr. Generals reported that two CCP students are in the finals for the America250PA Innovation Challenge. The final round is scheduled for November 19 when students will pitch their integrated

marketing campaigns to Governor Tom Wolf, PA Secretary of Education Pedro Rivera, and the US Postal Service for the celebration of the 250th Anniversary of America's Independence in 2026.

Dr. Generals stated that there are a number of activities underway at the College to prepare youth for the job market. He asked Dr. Thomas to discuss activities in his area.

Dr. Thomas, Associate Vice President, Strategic Initiatives and Dean, Access & Community Engagement, circulated and discussed the College's Dual Enrollment Programs and K-16 Partnerships as well as the Enhanced College and Career Preparation and Success initiatives.

At the request of Dr. Generals, Dr. Carter, Dean of Science and Technology, circulated and discussed the College's 2019 Girls STEM Transportation Summer Camp for middle school age grade students. She stated that the intent of the Camp is to introduce and teach basic STEM principles to young students while exposing them to careers in the transportation industry.

(8d) Upcoming Events

Dr. Generals reminded members of the Board regarding the reception and tour of the Library Commons project scheduled on Thursday, November 14, 2019 at 5:30 p.m., in the Mint Building Rotunda.

(9) New Business

There was no new business discussed.

(10) Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Board of Trustees is scheduled for Thursday, February 6, 2020 at 3:00 p.m. in the Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom, M2-1.

The meeting adjourned at 4:20 p.m.

The Board reconvened in Executive Session.

(11) Executive Session

The Executive Session was devoted to a discussion of real estate, litigation, and personnel matters.

COMMUNITY COLLEGE OF PHILADELPHIA
Meeting of the Board of Trustees
Thursday, November 7, 2019 – 3:00 p.m.
MINUTES OF DECISIONS AND RESOLUTIONS

Present: Mr. White, presiding; Mr. Dubow, Ms. Fulmore-Townsend, Ms. Hernández Vélez, Mr. Herzog, Ms. McPherson, Ms. Posoff, Representative Roebuck, Dr. General, Dr. Gay, Mr. Eapen, Dr. Hirsch, Ms. de Fries, Ms. DiGregorio, Ms. Rooney, Ms. Sessoms, Dr. Waller, and Ms. Zellers

(1) Meeting Called to Order

Mr. White called the meeting to order.

Mr. White introduced Mr. Rob Dubow, newly appointed member of the Board of Trustees.

Members of the Board welcomed Mr. Dubow.

(2) Public Comment

There were no requests for Public Comment.

(3) Report of the Business Affairs Committee

The Board was provided with a summary of the Business Affairs Committee items listed on the Consent Agenda.

(4) Report of the Student Outcomes Committee

The Board was provided with a summary on discussions held at the October 3, 2019 meeting of the Student Outcomes Committee.

(5) Consent Agenda

The Board approved the following Consent Agenda:

- (a) Proceedings and Minutes of Decisions and Resolutions
Meeting of October 3, 2019
- (b) Gifts and Grants
- (c) Academic Program Review: A.S. in Biology
- (d) Request to Update the Commonfund Resolution

(6) Report of the Chair

Since the Board does not meet in December and January, Mr. White is planning to schedule Executive Committee meetings during the months of December 2019 and January 2020.

(6a) Association of Community College Trustees
Annual Congress, October 9-11, 2019

Mr. White, Dr. Generals, Mr. Clancy, Ms. Ireland, Ms. Fulmore-Townsend, and Representative Roebuck attended the Association of Community College Trustees Annual Congress in San Francisco on October 9-11, 2019.

(6b) AACC/ACCT Community College
National Legislative Summit, February 9-12, 2020
Marriott Marquis Hotel, Washington, DC

The AACC/ACCT Community College National Legislative Summit is scheduled to take place February 9-12, 2020 at the Marriott Marquis Hotel, 901 Massachusetts Avenue, NW in Washington, DC. Members of the Board interested in attending may contact the President's Office for meeting arrangements.

(7) Foundation Report

The Black and Gold Gala is scheduled for June 10, 2020 at the Crystal Tea Room.

The Office of Institutional Advancement has retained a consultant for the implementation and execution of the College's capital campaign.

Representatives from the Lenfest Foundation will be visiting the West Philadelphia Regional Center on November 8, 2019 to discuss the Career and Advanced Technology Center project.

The Board was provided with an update of the amount of scholarships awarded to students.

The Board was provided with an update on the Foundation salon dinner held on October 21, 2019.

The College has retained the firm of Bridge Partners to conduct the search for the Vice President for Institutional Advancement.

(8) Report of the President

Dr. Generals called attention to his memorandum in the Board folder outlining activities in which he participated October 4 – November 7, 2019.

(8a) Career and Advanced Technology Center

The Board was provided with a binder containing information on the Career and Advanced Technology Center project at the West Regional Center.

(8b) Off-Campus Events

The second Faith-Based Breakfast took place on November 4, 2019.

Dr. Generals served as a panelist at the B.PHL. "Lightning Round on Education" on October 15, 2019. He stated that the session focused on innovation in public and higher education, generating equity and access, and why investing in education at all levels will always yield the greatest societal dividends.

(8c) Announcements

The Board congratulated Ms. Fulmore-Townsend on her being one of the honorees to receive The Promise of America Award from America's Promise Alliance on October 24, 2019.

Dr. Generals met with Richard Bliss, Professor, Babson College, on October 31, 2019 regarding the Goldman Sachs 10KSB Program.

The Board was informed that two CCP students are in the finals for the America250PA Innovation Challenge. The final round is scheduled for November 19, 2019.

The Board was provided with a number of activities underway at the College to prepare youth for the job market.

(8d) Upcoming Events

The reception and tour of the Library Commons project is scheduled on Thursday, November 14, 2019 at 5:30 p.m., in the Mint Building Rotunda.

(9) New Business

There was no new business discussed.

(10) Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Board of Trustees is scheduled for Thursday, February 6, 2020 at 3:00 p.m. in the Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom, M2-1.

The meeting adjourned at 4:20 p.m.

The Board reconvened in Executive Session.

(11) Executive Session

The Executive Session was devoted to a discussion of real estate, litigation, and personnel matters.

**Community College of Philadelphia
Office of Institutional Advancement
Record of Grants and Gifts
February 2020 Meeting of the Board of Trustees**

GRANTS

Summary by Grant Type:

	10/30/19 - 1/29/20	2020 FY Year-to-Date
Government/Public Grants		
Federal	\$ 23,694	\$ 438,169
State	\$ 62,916	\$ 2,202,226
Local	\$ -	\$ -
Private Grants		
Corporation	\$ -	\$ -
Foundation	\$ 232,875	\$ 238,681
Organization	\$ -	\$ -
Grant Total	\$ 319,485	\$ 2,879,076

GIFTS

Summary by Gift Type:

Gifts to the Foundation (\$5,000+)	Amount	Purpose
Wanamaker Institute of Industries	\$ 100,000	Scholarship - Restricted
The Scholler Foundation	\$ 50,000	Program - Restricted
Anonymous	\$ 50,000	Planned Gift
The John Alchin and Hal Marryatt Foundaton	\$ 25,000	Program - Restricted
Comcast NBCUniversal	\$ 12,500	Event Sponsorship
Private Individual Donor	\$ 10,000	Program - Restricted
PECO Energy Company	\$ 10,000	Scholarship - Restricted
Private Individual Donor	\$ 10,000	Program - Restricted
Private Individual Donor	\$ 10,000	Scholarship - Endowed
Private Individual Donor	\$ 5,000	Program - Restricted
Private Individual Donor	\$ 5,000	Scholarship - Restricted
Private Individual Donor	\$ 5,000	Scholarship - Restricted
Private Individual Donor	\$ 5,000	Program - Restricted
The Charitas Foundation	\$ 5,000	Scholarship - Restricted
Day & Zimmermann	\$ 5,000	Event Sponsorship
Private Donor Advised Fund	\$ 5,000	Unrestricted
Mosi Foundation	\$ 5,000	Scholarship - Restricted
Spring Point Partners, LLC	\$ 5,000	Program - Restricted
Gifts In-Kind (estimated value \$200+)		
Private Individual Donor	\$ 600	Photography Equipment
Private Individual Donor	\$ 500	Photography Equipment

**Community College of Philadelphia
Office of Institutional Advancement
Summary of Grants
February 2020 Meeting of the Board of Trustees**

Federal

The National Science Foundation awarded \$23,694 for year one of this five-year *Louis Stokes Alliance for Minority Participation* (LSAMP) grant from 8/1/2019 to 7/31/20. The College is a subcontractor on this grant funded through Drexel University. The LSAMP program directly supports approximately 100 first-year STEM students each year through mentoring and scholarship support, and reaches over 1,000 students through speakers and other broader activities.

State

The Pennsylvania Department of Health, through Health Promotion Council, Inc. (HPC), has awarded \$20,000 for a *Support. Empower. Learn. Parenting Health Initiative* (SELPHI) grant from 7/1/2019 to 6/30/20. This partnership between the College and HPC will help SELPHI to support expectant and parenting students who may be in need of additional supports.

Pennsylvania Department of Labor & Industry, through Philadelphia Works, Inc., awarded \$42,916 for the *PA Smart Southeast Pennsylvania Region Registered Apprenticeship Ambassador Network* grant from 9/1/19 to 6/30/20. The grant will provide partial salary and fringe benefits for two staff members designated as staff apprentices in the *Apprenticeship Navigator Registered Apprenticeship* (ANRA) program.

Private

Independence Foundation awarded \$25,000 to provide continuing support for the *19130 Zip Code Project* from 1/1/20 to 12/31/20. This grant will enable the College to provide health promotion and disease prevention services to vulnerable populations and maintain the data collection tool to collect and report on demographic and service data for six schools of nursing. The proposed activities will build on previous Independence Foundation-funded community-based care projects and expand mental health assessments. Serving vulnerable populations will expand to providing support in leadership development to select students.

Independence Public Media Foundation awarded a grant of \$25,000 to the College's Marketing Department for use at its discretion. The department was nominated for its work to advance creative media making in the Philadelphia region.

The Christian R. & Mary F. Lindback Foundation granted \$4,000 for the Lindback Distinguished Teaching Award. This award will be presented to a faculty member who exemplifies excellence and outstanding service to the teaching profession in the 2019-20 Academic Year.

New York Life Foundation awarded \$100,000 for the expansion of the *STEM College Experience* project from 6/1/19 to 5/31/21. This grant will support the creation of a science, technology, engineering, and mathematics summer enrichment program focused on robotics and drone technology for middle school students. This experience will serve as an expansion of the *College's Advanced College Experience (ACE)* program. The *STEM College Experience* will expand and enhance ACE to serve middle school students. A goal of the grant is to ease the uncertainty that often accompanies the transition from middle to high school, more specifically, 8th to 9th grade.

The Philadelphia Foundation awarded \$20,000 for the *Reentry Support Project* from 12/1/19 to 11/30/20. Funding will enable the Career Coach, Transition Coach, and Academic Support Coach to provide services to students throughout the year. This grant will also support the purchase of student supplies and office supplies.

The William Penn Foundation and the W.K. Kellogg Foundation awarded \$58,875 for the *Early Childhood Education Apprenticeship Program* from 1/1/20 to 12/31/20. The College will work on this project with subcontractor Philadelphia Hospital and Health Care District 1199C Training and Upgrading Fund to implement an apprenticeship program to accelerate associate degree attainment for ECE workers in Philadelphia.

**STUDENT OUTCOMES COMMITTEE OF THE
BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

MINUTES

Thursday, November 7, 2019

1:30 p.m.

Conference Room M2-34

Presiding: Ms. Fulmore-Townsend

Committee

Members: Ms. Hernández Vélez, Ms. McPherson, Ms. Posoff, Rep. Roebuck

College

Members: Ms. de Fries, Dr. Gay, Dr. Generals, Dr. Hirsch, Dr. Roberts

Guests: Ms. Frizell, Ms. Gordon, Dr. Khan, Mr. Musumeci, Dr. Sweet

(1) Executive Session

There were no agenda items for the Executive Session.

(2) Public Session

(a) Approval of the Minutes of October 3, 2019

The minutes were approved unanimously.

(b) Academic Program Review: International Studies, A.A. Degree

Ms. Frizell, from the Office of Academic Assessment, described the International Studies program as relatively small and closely related to the Liberal Arts degree. Until recently, the curriculum was part of the Liberal Arts degree and as a result, International Studies needs its own identity separate from Liberal Arts. The program also needs to make changes to its program learning outcomes so that they differ from the College's general education goals. The program has retention and graduation rates higher than the College average. Dr. Khan, the program curriculum coordinator, explained that people come to the program from different interdisciplinary experiences. The program is inter-cultural (with several foreign languages) and differs from Liberal Arts in that it gives students a firm foundation in global/international studies. The program includes special features such as study abroad and the recently-added "distinction" which notes specialization in Latin America, Africa, Middle East, or Asian studies. The program prepares students to transfer to a baccalaureate program, in addition to preparing students for the labor market. Enrollment has grown from 46 to 66 students; 47% are full-time (compared to 27% college-wide). The program has a 17% success rate, and 61 students have graduated with an AA degree since the program's inception.

A challenge is that retention rates are lower than the College average. Dr. Khan will be working more closely with four-year institutions, including Drexel, University of Pennsylvania, and Temple. He requested input from Drexel on how to stay in touch with alumni; suggestions included alumni happy hours, alumni newsletters, and talks on contemporary topics. Dr. Khan will track graduates and see how they progress in their studies.

To help establish its own identity, Dr. Khan suggested the program could create at least one course on International Studies. Ms. McPherson asked about the vision and mission for the program. Dr. Khan replied that the program wants to produce students who are accepted into baccalaureate programs and well-prepared for rigorous studies. Ms. McPherson noted that while the program has languages, it should also address cultural knowledge. Mr. Musumeci, the department head, explained that culture is incorporated into every language course and is one of the areas regularly assessed. Dr. Khan added that the program started with a strong focus on languages but the program has gone far beyond that, including the specializations that will give students an advantage.

In response to Ms. McPherson's question about providing students with specific niches within the program of study, Dr. Sweet explained there is a new effort to be more deliberate with the specializations for students who will transfer and those who will work. To Rep. Roebuck's query about contacts with the federal government, Dr. Khan said that he has been working on cultivating such connections. While the program is a transfer program, there is an awareness of workforce needs. Dr. Khan noted a decline in the federal government workforce has been countered by expansion in the private sector and that people fluent in more than one language have an advantage in the job market.

Action: The Student Outcomes Committee unanimously recommended the International Studies program should submit a follow-up report in one year providing an update on its progress. The follow-up report should address outreach to four-year institutions and the private sector; learning outcomes; relationships with businesses; labor market trends; tracking graduates; mapping the vision and mission to the curriculum and separating its curriculum from Liberal Arts; and progress on the program review's action items.

(c) Student Success Data

Dr. General explained that the strategic plan has three goals, one of which is to increase the graduation rate. This is important because by 2022, 68% of jobs will require a college degree. Dr. General also emphasized a continued commitment to access. This includes moving more students into college-level courses. Students need to progress through developmental education, and the College is providing the means for students to succeed beyond pre-college/remedial classes. Strategic directions

include fully implementing Guided Pathways, being intellectually rigorous, and increasing workforce development opportunities.

Dr. Hirsch provided the committee with an overview of the College's Guided Pathways website which contains updates on the student experience. Guided Pathways is focused on the student experience and student success. Highlights for how the College has transformed what it does include developing more prescriptive curricula and creating seven academic pathways around thematic groupings of programs. The College has also reviewed access points that may stop students, including placement into development courses. This area has seen dramatic changes, including realignment of measures (i.e., how students are placed), incorporating additional measures, and curricular alignment. By realigning the curriculum to allow for concurrent enrollment via the Accelerated Learning Program (ALP) for English, several hundred students per semester are able to begin taking college-level content courses sooner. There has also been a decrease in the percentage of students who place into developmental education and an increase in credit momentum.

Dr. Hirsch described other changes the College has made under Guided Pathways including creation of a department of full-time faculty advisors. There are currently 11 full-time advisors with two more positions to be filled and plans for additional positions each year. Advisors monitor students via an early alert system and work with students to develop academic plans. The College instituted first-year experience courses for several programs, which students are to take within their first 12 credits. In these courses (AH 101 for Allied Health; FYE 101 for Liberal Arts; BUSL 101 for Business programs), students develop educational, career, and financial plans. The Dashboard provides data on student success with 2018-19 the most current data available. Trends have included increased persistence rates, increased 3-year completion rates, decreases in the percent of students placed into developmental English, and some improvements in achievement gaps. Ms. Fulmore-Townsend noted that the committee can make changes to the Dashboard and should do so to make it as useful as possible.

(d) Workforce and Economic Innovation - Update

Ms. de Fries showed a new video from the Division highlighting welding students. One of the strategies with the program offering catalog is to incorporate more students' stories. It is anticipated the Division moving forward is to have a more robust marketing plan. Due to the meeting time constraint, the Division updates will continue at the next Committee meeting.

(e) New Business

There was no new business.

Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Student Outcomes Committee of the Board is scheduled for February 6, 2020 at 1:00 p.m. in Conference Room M2-34.

Attachments:

Minutes of October 3, 2019

Academic Program Review: International Studies

**STUDENT OUTCOMES COMMITTEE OF THE
BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

MINUTES

Thursday, October 3, 2019

1:30 p.m.

Conference Room M2-34

Presiding: Ms. Fulmore-Townsend

Committee

Members: Mr. Clancy, Ms. Hernández Vélez, Ms. McPherson, Ms. Posoff

College

Members: Ms. de Fries, Dr. Gay, Dr. Generals, Dr. Hirsch, Dr. Roberts

Guests: Dr. Celenza, Ms. Frizell, Ms. Gordon, Dr. Powell

(1) Executive Session

There were no agenda items for the Executive Session.

(2) Public Session

(a) Approval of the Minutes of September 5, 2019

The minutes were approved unanimously.

(b) Academic Program Review: A.S. in Biology

Ms. Frizell, from the Office of Academic Assessment, noted that the Biology degree was established in 2014 and has experienced consistent growth. Since 2016, 20 degrees have been conferred. The retention rate for the program is higher than the rate for the College. She said that the program has one of the most comprehensive course-level assessments. It is recommended that the program clarify how achievement of course learning outcomes relates to program learning outcomes.

In response to a question from Mr. Clancy about contributions to the above-average retention rates, Dr. Powell, the department head, suggested several factors: grants that support minority students in sciences, books stipends, peer tutoring, and research opportunities. Dr. Powell explained that the most fundamental factor to retention has been the Biology Open Lab. Students are able to study in labs when the labs are not in use for courses, and faculty hold office hours in the Open Lab so they are available to the students. In Fall 2018, 700 students came through the Open Lab; this increased to 1,337 in Spring 2019 (in part because of workshops offered by faculty). With this dedicated space, the department culture has shifted and it has the full support of faculty. Ms. Hernández Vélez asked about diversity in the program.

Dr. Powell explained that Biology attracts students because of the clear career paths and good salaries. About 30% of the students already have a Bachelor's degree. There are clubs associated with some of the grants. Dr. Powell also has connections with many other institutions; as a result, these institutions send students to Community College of Philadelphia to better their preparation. Dr. Celenza added that Dr. Powell intentionally hires for diversity. Ms. McPherson noted that the program's diversity is a contrast to a general lack of diversity she has seen on some boards.

Based on all the work that the program does, Ms. Posoff asked if the headcount projections were appropriate. Dr. Powell explained that enrollments have been steady with no need to cancel courses, which is in contrast to some programs seeing declines in enrollments. The program is also working on more options, including an A.A.S. degree in Biology, which would articulate to Biotechnology and Biopharmaceutical Bachelor's degrees.

Dr. Powell provided an overview of the AMP (Louis Stokes Alliance for Minority Participation) grant. The College has had this grant for 25 years. Through this grant, Dr. Powell has met leaders of other institutions, which has opened doors nationwide for the program and students. For instance, AMP-Penn and AMP-Delaware will come to the College for a course, and the College has reciprocal relationships with Temple and Drexel. The College has faculty who came from AMP programs. Before each semester, Dr. Powell meets with the AMP students, and alumni often come back for these meetings.

Dr. Powell commented on the growth in biology fields and the importance of ensuring the College is in the conversation and thus able to position students for positions that require an A.S. Dr. Celenza added that the quality level of the College's Biology graduates is high and that a challenge is addressing the misunderstandings regarding what A.S. graduates can do.

Action: The Student Outcomes Committee unanimously recommended that the Board of Trustees accept the program review with approval for five years.

(c) Power-Up: Update on Outcomes

Ms. de Fries provided an overview of the College's Power Up Your Business initiative. It came out of small businesses being hurt by the city's beverage tax. Additionally, the division saw with Goldman Sachs 10,000 Small Businesses (10KSB) that there were many businesses which were not at the necessary level for that particular program, so Power Up helps businesses stabilize themselves. A goal of this initiative is to strengthen neighborhood commercial corridors by supporting small business owners, particularly low-income owners, with free training. Partners include PIDC, the Free Library, and SCORE.

The program is structured with two tiers. The first is the shorter program and incorporates peer learning, improvement plans, and 3-6 hours of coaching for the year after graduation. For a business to be eligible, it must not have completed 10KSB,

must be located in Philadelphia, have at least one full-time employee, and have revenues less than one million dollars. Tier 2 is a store owner workshops series, in which workshops (available in Spanish) build on one another. Innovations include Philly iHub, for start-ups; Industry Best Practices, such as for early childhood education; and Finanta Mini-Peer Learning Experience (in Spanish). So far, 157 businesses have taken part, representing 39 zip codes. 91% of the businesses are minority-owned and 80% are women-owned. It has encompassed 258 full-time employees and 207 part-time employees. An annual report is sent to the City Council. The program developed a survey for cohort participants to complete one year after finishing the program. Within one year of having completed Power Up, 56% of businesses hired a new employee and 29% launched a new service or product. For every \$100,000 invested in Power Up, the economic impact over 10 years is \$22.1 million.

(d) CCRC Case Study: How Community College of Philadelphia Set the Pace for Guided Pathways Reform

Dr. Hirsch provided an overview of the College's Guided Pathways work. The College was in the original cohort of 30 institutions chosen in 2015. The Community College Research Center (CCRC) has visited the College several times to talk with faculty and staff. CCRC conducts these visits to get a sense of the impact Guided Pathways work is having and also to provide guidance. CCRC was interested in the College's work because it is an urban institution but also because it was in the midst of contract negotiations but was still able to accomplish a lot.

Five institutions have been highlighted by CCRC in case studies regarding implementation and outcomes to date. The case studies examine the four pillars of Guided Pathways reforms and their components: clarifying the paths, helping students get on a path, helping students stay on their path, and ensuring that students are learning. The authors highlighted the new advising model, changes to developmental education to help students reach college-level sooner, first-year experience courses, and our next set of initiatives. CCRC collects data on key performance indicators, including those related to credit momentum, completion of gateway courses, placement, and changes in developmental education. The College has seen an incremental upswing for these metrics, which will then produce improved retention rates.

Dr. Hirsch went through the Board Dashboard. There is a section on student success, which includes metrics on enrollment, persistence, and completion. The aspirational group is comprised of like institutions who have been finalists for the Aspen Prize; the median for this group is used as a target. The data for increasing persistence has been inching up, and preliminary data for the Fall 2018 cohort is positive. The 3-year completion rate increased for the Fall 2015 cohort. Dr. Hirsch described possible drivers of the positive outcomes. Developmental education innovations have led to moving more students through the pipeline more quickly and then retaining more students. The Accelerated Learning Program for English is now fully at scale.

Another reform includes full-time advisors; programs with assigned full-time advisors saw an increase in retention rates after the department was established in Fall 2016.

(e) New Business

There was no new business.

Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Student Outcomes Committee of the Board is scheduled for November 7, 2019 at 1:30 p.m. in Conference Room M2-34.

Attachments:

Minutes of September 5, 2019

Academic Program Review: Biology A.S. Program – Executive Summary

CCRC Balancing Urgency and Patience: How Community College of Philadelphia Set the Pace for Guided Pathways Reform

Community College *of* Philadelphia

Academic Program Review: AA in International Studies Executive Summary

Authors:

Mak Khan, Teresa Frizell

Fall 2019

1. Executive Summary

A. Key Findings

It is difficult to distinguish this Program from the Liberal Arts AA in terms of curriculum and assessment. The Program does not control any courses. Faculty designed Program Learning Outcomes (PLOs) according to a practice that is no longer utilized at this College, and so the PLOs should be revised and assessed. The Program has a higher rate of graduation than the College overall.

Enrollment and Demographics

1. Program headcount ranged between 46 and 66. It averaged 47% full-time students, in contrast to the College's 27% full-time enrollment.
2. Program enrollment averaged 21% people who identified as Black Females, which was 10 percentage points lower than the average enrollment for the same group across the College. This difference was mainly accounted for by higher enrollment of people who identified as Hispanic.
3. Program enrollment averaged 85% students between the ages of 16-29. This is 10 points higher than the College average for the same group.

Retention

4. At 22.5%, the proportion of International Studies students who returned to the Program from Fall to Spring semester in the same academic year (Fall to Spring) averaged four percentage points lower than the proportion of students who returned to the same program across the College, Fall to Spring.
5. At 38%, the proportion of International Studies students who did not return to the College from one Fall semester to the next Fall semester (Fall to Fall) averaged eight percentage points lower than the proportion of students who did not return to the College, Fall to Fall.

Success and Graduation

6. At 17%, the average proportion of International Studies students who graduated each Spring was seven points higher than the College average.
7. The Program has awarded 61 AA degrees since 2014.

Assessment

8. The Program does not control any courses.
9. Three out of the five PLOs are General Education requirements, which is not aligned with best assessment practice.
10. PLO Assessment only included PLO 1 and 2.
11. The Program rotated assessment of analyzing culture, speaking, listening, reading, and writing in another language across all language courses. Faculty analyzed assessment results and read and applied appropriate teaching techniques from peer-reviewed journals in response.
12. The benchmarks for PLO 1 and 2 are, respectively, a mean score of 60% on the assessment instrument across courses.

13. There were notable differences in assessment results between languages, e.g., 67.5% in French 101 and 86% in Arabic 101.

Cost

14. Cost is tracked by Foreign Languages, not International Studies. Foreign Languages cost averaged \$147.88 per credit hour compared to Liberal Studies average cost per credit hour of \$174.54 and the Colleges’ average of \$177.84.

B. Prior Audit - 2014

Recommendations from Prior Audit and Program Response:

1. Make a determination about the coherence of explicit curricular pathways in the program.
Program Response: The Program did not move forward due to concerns over viability of an introductory course. The Program courses were mapped to liberal arts courses that included an international focus specifically in order to allow students flexibility in choosing courses.

2. Explore ways to increase program size through a program management plan.
Program Response: In order to grow the program, the program coordinator intends to market International Studies as follows:

- **First, enhancing the visibility of the program within the College**
- **Second, adding an annual lecture series on International Studies**
- **Third, adding German and Urdu as language course offerings**

3. Further refine Program Student Learning Outcomes.
Program Response: The program did not refine its learning outcomes, now called Program Learning Outcomes.

C. Action Items

The Office of Assessment and Evaluation makes the following recommendations for the Program.

Enrollment and Demographics

1. Increase enrollment and retention according to departmental goals listed on the table below.

	Fall 2018	Fall 2019	Fall 2020	Fall 2023	Fall 2021	Fall 2022	Fall 2023
Headcount	59	60	69	74	79	85	90
Returned to Same Program	30.8%	31%	40%	45%	50%	55%	60%
Returned to Different Program	5.8%	5.8%	4.5%	4%	3.5%	3%	2.5%
Graduated	32.7%	33%	40%	45%	50%	55%	60%
Did Not Persist	30.8%	30.6%	25%	20%	15%	10%	10%

2. Implement curricular changes to distinguish an AA in International Studies from an AA in Liberal Arts.

Transfer

3. The office of Institutional Research will provide the Program with data on transfer students' areas of study, time to completion, and graduation rates.

Assessment

4. Revise Program Learning Outcomes so they reflect current practices in International Studies and at the College.
5. Revisit 60% benchmark for Foreign Language courses using peer reviewed research or examples from other institutions to ensure best practice.
6. Analyze assessment results to formulate explanations for differences between languages in mean scores on the assessment instrument. Apply appropriate techniques to increase scores in the languages with lower scores.

D. Narrative

Although relatively new, the International Studies Program is growing and the students are performing well. At 17%, the Program's graduation rate was seven points higher than the College average graduation rate. The program's Fall to Fall retention is also stronger than that of the general student body at the College. The program's outcomes assessment will be revised further to strengthen student learning and to better define the mission of the program.

Considering the shifting directions in the field of International Studies towards understanding international, translational and global affairs, the program will be focusing on key areas of development. Through in-depth conversations with colleagues and faculty here at CCP and at other institutions, and an analysis of the current trends in the labor market for IS graduates, the Program has developed the following strategy to further enhance the relevance and quality of the Program:

1. Promote a recently added feature of graduating with "Distinction in International Studies," which offers an opportunity for students to graduate the program with "Distinction" with a General focus, or with a concentration in Latin America, Africa/Middle East, or Asia Studies.
2. Develop network with institutions of higher education and non-governmental organizations working in the field.
3. In order to develop strong, sustaining, student connections within the program, IS will institute an annual guest lecture series in which the academic community and industry professionals in the field of International Studies will be invited to speak to CCP's IS community.
4. Design and implement an introductory course to International Studies, which will be a foundational course in the curriculum.

**STUDENT OUTCOMES COMMITTEE OF THE
BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

MINUTES

Thursday, January 23, 2020

1:00 p.m.

Conference Room M2-34

Presiding: Ms. Fulmore-Townsend

Committee

Members: Ms. Hernández Vélez, Ms. Ireland, Ms. Posoff, Rep. Roebuck

College

Members: Ms. de Fries, Dr. Gay, Dr. Generals, Dr. Hirsch, Dr. Roberts

Guests: Ms. Chrestay, Mr. Coleman, Ms. Washington,

(1) Executive Session

There were no agenda items for the Executive Session.

(2) Public Session

(a) Approval of the Minutes of November 7, 2019

The minutes were approved unanimously.

(b) Workforce Development Presentation

Ms. de Fries brought the senior leaders in the Workforce and Economic Innovation (WEI) division: Mr. Coleman (Assistant Vice President, Workforce and Economic Innovation), Ms. Chrestay (Executive Director, Goldman Sachs 10,000 Small Businesses), and Ms. Washington (Director, Career Connections). The division was established in 2015, encompassing some already-existing units. Ms. de Fries led the committee through the division's vision and mission statements and guiding principles. She described how the division's work falls into three buckets: Corporate Solutions, entrepreneurship programs, and Career Connections.

Mr. Coleman provided an overview of Corporate Solutions, which has thirteen full- and part-time staff members. Within this area is Corporate College, which works with organizations and businesses in the City (such as Einstein Healthcare Center and Horizon Health Services) to bring credit programs at the College to them. The instructors are from the academic departments, and the courses are the same as those

on campus. The cohort structure of the program helps with retention. Corporate College seeks out employers who offer its employees tuition reimbursement.

Another program is Contract Training. This is more flexible with the employer informing Corporate Solutions of their needs and then Corporate Solutions creating a customized training program for the employer. An example is WedNET, which receives funds from the PA Department of Community and Economic Development and provides central skills and technical skills training. Employees have one year to finish this non-credit program. Next Mr. Coleman described Continuing Education, which is the unit's largest area and includes occupational training programs. Professional Development and Personal Enrichment are two additional areas. Apprenticeship/Pre-Apprenticeship Programs is a growing area. Lastly, the Testing Center offers high-stakes testing, including certifications for TSA, social workers, pharmaceutical techs, real estate, and teachers.

Ms. Chrestay oversees the Goldman Sachs 10,000 Small Businesses (GS10KSB) program. This program is for businesses that have been in operation for at least two years, have the equivalent of at least four full-time employees, and at least \$150,000 in revenues the previous year. The current cohort has 30 enrollees; the goal is 90 enrollees per year across three cohorts. Outcomes show growth in the percent of alumni who increased revenue and created jobs post-graduation. All the teachers are trained by Babson College, and Goldman Sachs pays the cost of the program. So far, 129 individuals have graduated.

Ms. de Fries described the Power Up Your Business program, which has 40 participants a year and impacts businesses through workshops. Power Up Your Business was an outgrowth of the GS10KSB but has a less rigorous application process. The Power Up Your Business program is designed for small businesses and goes into communities, offers evening sessions, and has a 12-week workshop series and individual workshops. It recently included a 100% Spanish-language cohort. The City pays for Power Up Your Business.

Ms. Washington provided information about Career Connections. They offer employer services, such as recruiting opportunities and career fairs. The unit has worked with employers to recalibrate its workshops to meet employers' needs. By engaging more with employers, the employers are then more ready to help with opportunities such as internships and interviews. Career Connections also provides student services. Personnel do classroom presentations that began with the first-year experience courses and expanded into other courses. This has increased student engagement. The unit now has three pathway coordinators. Faculty and academic supports are also available. There is now a kiosk in the Bonnell lobby. Career Connections has six staff members, including one dedicated to employer partnerships.

The WEI administrators were asked what was most important. Ms. de Fries said goals and outcomes, including revenues, enrollments, and businesses served (all have increased since 2015-16). Goals are part of the College's strategic plan. The SOC

Dashboard contains the high-level key performance indicators for each unit. More information was requested regarding the top ten companies and the division's structure. Ms. de Fries announced that the College started a Massage Therapy program at the Northeast Regional Center, which is the non-credit program that qualifies for financial aid. The College is also considering additional programs to qualify for financial aid.

(c) Improving Committee Efficiency

Ms. Fulmore-Townsend explained that there have been recent conversations about the committee's role and the use of meeting time. The chair of the Board of Trustees wants the committee to consider if workforce development should have its own committee. She had discussed with almost everyone how to effectively use meeting time and how to strike a balance with academic program reviews. Regarding program reviews, Dr. Hirsch explained the stages a review goes through before it reaches the committee. There is an annual calendar and the College is mandated to review programs on a five-year cycle; a calendar of reviews will be sent. The program reviews includes actions based on recommendations from the last review, data analysis (e.g., retention and enrollment), student learning outcomes assessment, and economic trends. Faculty and deans provided feedback. Reviews now include enrollment and retention projections and strategies to achieve them. The committee can ask program personnel to come back; for instance, if they did not adequately assess outcomes. For programs with external reviews (such as Nursing accreditation), they coordinate these with the program review schedule.

Assessment and Evaluation staff provide data and analysis for the review, but do not make recommendations regarding approval; the committee makes these recommendations. If the committee approves a program for five years, this goes to the Board of Trustees for a full vote. However, the committee could decide instead that the program personnel should return in a year with updates on progress (and again, if necessary). Dr. General used the Computer Information Systems-Information Technology program review as an example of a follow-up. The committee asked program personnel to do more on assessment; program personnel came back with appropriate assessment documentation and had a leadership change after the review.

Ms. Fulmore-Townsend asked Ms. de Fries what the committee could do for workforce development. Ms. de Fries said the committee could help with employer partnerships, priorities for programmatic development, and the professional development area. The committee discussed if other Board of Trustee members should be brought in. It was noted that the committee has still not discussed reviewing policies to impact students and regular data review, possibly indicating the committee might not have the time for workforce development and a dedicated group might be needed for this area. This will be discussed further. Dr. General added that some Board of Trustee members, including the chair, have mentioned they would like more information on the topics on which they vote.

(d) New Business

There was no new business.

Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Student Outcomes Committee of the Board is scheduled for February 6, 2020 at 1:00 p.m. in Conference Room M2-34.

Attachments:

Minutes of November 7, 2019

**STUDENT OUTCOMES COMMITTEE OF THE
BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

MINUTES

Thursday, November 7, 2019

1:30 p.m.

Conference Room M2-34

Presiding: Ms. Fulmore-Townsend

Committee

Members: Ms. Hernández Vélez, Ms. McPherson, Ms. Posoff, Rep. Roebuck

College

Members: Ms. de Fries, Dr. Gay, Dr. Generals, Dr. Hirsch, Dr. Roberts

Guests: Ms. Frizell, Ms. Gordon, Dr. Khan, Mr. Musumeci, Dr. Sweet

(1) Executive Session

There were no agenda items for the Executive Session.

(2) Public Session

(a) Approval of the Minutes of October 3, 2019

The minutes were approved unanimously.

(b) Academic Program Review: International Studies, A.A. Degree

Ms. Frizell, from the Office of Academic Assessment, described the International Studies program as relatively small and closely related to the Liberal Arts degree. Until recently, the curriculum was part of the Liberal Arts degree and as a result, International Studies needs its own identity separate from Liberal Arts. The program also needs to make changes to its program learning outcomes so that they differ from the College's general education goals. The program has retention and graduation rates higher than the College average. Dr. Khan, the program curriculum coordinator, explained that people come to the program from different interdisciplinary experiences. The program is inter-cultural (with several foreign languages) and differs from Liberal Arts in that it gives students a firm foundation in global/international studies. The program includes special features such as study abroad and the recently-added "distinction" which notes specialization in Latin America, Africa, Middle East, or Asian studies. The program prepares students to transfer to a baccalaureate program, in addition to preparing students for the labor market. Enrollment has grown from 46 to 66 students; 47% are full-time (compared to 27% college-wide). The program has a 17% success rate, and 61 students have graduated with an AA degree since the program's inception.

A challenge is that retention rates are lower than the College average. Dr. Khan will be working more closely with four-year institutions, including Drexel, University of Pennsylvania, and Temple. He requested input from Drexel on how to stay in touch with alumni; suggestions included alumni happy hours, alumni newsletters, and talks on contemporary topics. Dr. Khan will track graduates and see how they progress in their studies.

To help establish its own identity, Dr. Khan suggested the program could create at least one course on International Studies. Ms. McPherson asked about the vision and mission for the program. Dr. Khan replied that the program wants to produce students who are accepted into baccalaureate programs and well-prepared for rigorous studies. Ms. McPherson noted that while the program has languages, it should also address cultural knowledge. Mr. Musumeci, the department head, explained that culture is incorporated into every language course and is one of the areas regularly assessed. Dr. Khan added that the program started with a strong focus on languages but the program has gone far beyond that, including the specializations that will give students an advantage.

In response to Ms. McPherson's question about providing students with specific niches within the program of study, Dr. Sweet explained there is a new effort to be more deliberate with the specializations for students who will transfer and those who will work. To Rep. Roebuck's query about contacts with the federal government, Dr. Khan said that he has been working on cultivating such connections. While the program is a transfer program, there is an awareness of workforce needs. Dr. Khan noted a decline in the federal government workforce has been countered by expansion in the private sector and that people fluent in more than one language have an advantage in the job market.

Action: The Student Outcomes Committee unanimously recommended the International Studies program should submit a follow-up report in one year providing an update on its progress. The follow-up report should address outreach to four-year institutions and the private sector; learning outcomes; relationships with businesses; labor market trends; tracking graduates; mapping the vision and mission to the curriculum and separating its curriculum from Liberal Arts; and progress on the program review's action items.

(c) Student Success Data

Dr. General explained that the strategic plan has three goals, one of which is to increase the graduation rate. This is important because by 2022, 68% of jobs will require a college degree. Dr. General also emphasized a continued commitment to access. This includes moving more students into college-level courses. Students need to progress through developmental education, and the College is providing the means for students to succeed beyond pre-college/remedial classes. Strategic directions

include fully implementing Guided Pathways, being intellectually rigorous, and increasing workforce development opportunities.

Dr. Hirsch provided the committee with an overview of the College's Guided Pathways website which contains updates on the student experience. Guided Pathways is focused on the student experience and student success. Highlights for how the College has transformed what it does include developing more prescriptive curricula and creating seven academic pathways around thematic groupings of programs. The College has also reviewed access points that may stop students, including placement into development courses. This area has seen dramatic changes, including realignment of measures (i.e., how students are placed), incorporating additional measures, and curricular alignment. By realigning the curriculum to allow for concurrent enrollment via the Accelerated Learning Program (ALP) for English, several hundred students per semester are able to begin taking college-level content courses sooner. There has also been a decrease in the percentage of students who place into developmental education and an increase in credit momentum.

Dr. Hirsch described other changes the College has made under Guided Pathways including creation of a department of full-time faculty advisors. There are currently 11 full-time advisors with two more positions to be filled and plans for additional positions each year. Advisors monitor students via an early alert system and work with students to develop academic plans. The College instituted first-year experience courses for several programs, which students are to take within their first 12 credits. In these courses (AH 101 for Allied Health; FYE 101 for Liberal Arts; BUSL 101 for Business programs), students develop educational, career, and financial plans. The Dashboard provides data on student success with 2018-19 the most current data available. Trends have included increased persistence rates, increased 3-year completion rates, decreases in the percent of students placed into developmental English, and some improvements in achievement gaps. Ms. Fulmore-Townsend noted that the committee can make changes to the Dashboard and should do so to make it as useful as possible.

(d) Workforce and Economic Innovation - Update

Ms. de Fries showed a new video from the Division highlighting welding students. One of the strategies with the program offering catalog is to incorporate more students' stories. It is anticipated the Division moving forward is to have a more robust marketing plan. Due to the meeting time constraint, the Division updates will continue at the next Committee meeting.

(e) New Business

There was no new business.

Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Student Outcomes Committee of the Board is scheduled for February 6, 2020 at 1:00 p.m. in Conference Room M2-34.

Attachments:

Minutes of October 3, 2019

Academic Program Review: International Studies

**COMBINED MEETING OF THE BUSINESS AFFAIRS AND
EXECUTIVE COMMITTEES OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES
Community College of Philadelphia
Wednesday, November 20, 2019 – 9:00 A.M.**

Present for the Business Affairs Committee: Lydia Hernández Vélez, Esq. (Chair), Mr. Harold Epps, Mr. Steve Herzog (Teleconference); and Mr. Michael Soileau (Teleconference)

Present for the Executive Committee: Lydia Hernández Vélez, Esq., Mr. Harold Epps and Ms. Chekemma Fulmore-Townsend

Present for the Business Affairs and Executive Committees: Lydia Hernández Vélez, Esq., and Mr. Harold Epps

College Administration: Donald Generals, Ed.D., Mr. Jacob Eapen, Mr. Gim Lim, Mr. James P. Spiewak and Victoria Zellers, Esq.

AGENDA

PUBLIC SESSION – Business Affairs Committee

(1) Mint Freight Elevator Modernization RFP and Recommendation to Award (Action Item):

Discussion: Mr. Eapen reported that the freight elevator in the Mint Building has had protracted operational issues and overall unreliable performance during the past few years. An RFP for the turn key construction for a complete modernization of this unit was issued on October 17th, 2019 to secure competitive bids. Fifteen (15) contractors specializing in Elevator Modernization, General Construction and related sub-specialties of mechanical, electrical and technical related controls and safety fields expressed an interest in the solicitation.

Mr. Eapen stated that on November 6, 2019, three (3) complete bids were received. Staff conducted a bid and scope review with the two lowest bidders, Code Elevator Inc. and Schindler Elevator Company. The review was conducted in concert with Zipf Elevator Consultants, Inc., a professional elevator consulting firm with over forty (40) years of experience who was retained by the College for technical assistance in developing specifications, design and performance criteria. The results of the bids were as follows:

Code Elevator, Inc.	\$550,349
Schindler Elevator Company	\$593,700
Smith Construction	\$685,000

Mr. Eapen informed the Committees that while the cost of this modernization involves a significant capital investment, the finished product will provide for a robust, reliable unit with a useful life of thirty-five to forty years (35-40). In response to questions he noted that the timeline for the completion of the modernization project will be approximately thirty-two (32) weeks and that Code Elevator, Inc had excellent references. Mr. Eapen also noted that this is a freight elevator and is not used by students. He stated that staff recommend that the Business

Affairs Committee and Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees approve the awarding of the Mint Freight Elevator Modernization contract to Code Elevator, Inc. in the amount of \$550,349.00.

Action: Mr. Epps moved and Mr. Soileau seconded the motion that the Business Affairs Committee recommend that the Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees approve the awarding of the Mint Freight Elevator Modernization contract to Code Elevator, Inc. in the amount of \$550,349.00. The motion passed unanimously.

(2) AV Equipment for Library and Learning Commons (Action Item):

Discussion: Mr. Eapen stated that the College issued an RFP for the purchase and installation of audio visual equipment to be utilized in the new Library Learning Commons space. He noted that The Library and Learning Commons space will have three computer classrooms and two active learning classrooms, seven group study rooms, a one button studio, one conference room, and one clean/dry makerspace. Each of these spaces incorporates technology to varying degrees, respective to the needs of the user.

Mr. Eapen stated that spaces will all have a Cleartouch interactive display and that the active learning classrooms will have additional monitors for each table of 4 students. He noted that the equipment to be purchased and installed was for all three phases of the Library Learning Commons project. He informed the Committee that the College received three responses to the RFP as follows:

Visual Sound, Inc.(WBE)	\$271,577.40
SOLUTIONZ, Inc.	\$281,148.00
Applied Video Technology	\$396,542.00

Mr. Eapen stated that staff recommend that the Business Affairs Committee and Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees approve the awarding of this bid to Visual Sound, Inc. in the amount of \$271,578.

Action: Mr. Epps moved and Mr. Soileau seconded the motion that the Business Affairs Committee recommend that the Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees approve the awarding of the contract for Audio Visual Equipment for the Library and Learning Commons to Visual Sound, Inc. in the amount of \$271,578. The motion passed unanimously.

(3) New Contract Date with Follett (Action Item):

Discussion: Mr. Eapen stated that on November 4th, the Board of Trustees approved the College to enter into an agreement with Follett Higher Education Group (Follett) for bookstore services starting January 1, 2020. However, he discussed that due to the complexities and logistics of the bookstore management transition, Follett and the College have agreed to have the Agreement start on or around December 2, 2019 as opposed to January 1, 2020. A time table has been developed in cooperation with Follett, Barnes and Noble Education (B&N) and the College that has the bookstore closed December 2 through December 4, 2019. This will allow B&N to vacate the premises and allow Follett to begin to receive textbooks and other merchandise for the Winter and Spring semesters, as well as set up and test their POS systems. Mr. Eapen stated that staff recommends that the Business Affairs Committee and the

Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees approve to have the Agreement with Follett start on or around December 2, 2019.

Action: Mr. Soileau moved and Mr. Epps seconded the motion that the Business Affairs Committee recommend that the Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees approve to have the Agreement with Follett start on or around December 2, 2019. The motion passed unanimously.

(4) IT Infrastructure Equipment for the Library & Learning Commons (Action Item):

Discussion: Mr. Spiewak stated that the College posted an RFP on PennBid for the Cisco core infrastructure/network equipment to be utilized in connecting the new Library Learning Commons space to the College network. He noted that the additional IT equipment is necessary to support the technology that is going into the renovated Library Learning Commons space. As noted in the agenda, there will be three computer classrooms, two active learning classrooms, and group study rooms, a one button studio, and a conference room equipped with ClearTouch technology. Additionally, another seventy-five computers will be positioned throughout the space as well as computers in the offices of the librarians and learning lab faculty. The equipment will also allow for a significantly more robust wireless network and brings the College up to the newest wireless standards.

Mr. Spiewak stated that the College received four responses to the RFP as follows:

Worldwide Services, LLC	\$111,037
Graybar.com	\$114,000
CNI Sales, Inc.	\$161,679
Saitech, Inc.	\$161,896

Mr. Spiewak stated that staff recommends that the Business Affairs Committee and the Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees approve the awarding of this bid to Worldwide Services, LLC in the amount of \$111,037.

Action: Mr. Epps moved and Mr. Soileau seconded the motion that the Business Affairs Committee recommend that the Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees approve the awarding of the contract for IT Infrastructure Equipment for the Library and Learning Commons to Worldwide Services, LLC in the amount of \$111,037. The motion passed unanimously.

PUBLIC SESSION – Executive Committee

Ms. Hernández Vélez called to order the meeting of the Executive Committee of the Board. Mr. Epps moved that the Executive Committee approve the four (4) recommendations made by the Business Affairs Committee. This motion was seconded by Ms. Chekemma Fulmore-Townsend. The motion passed unanimously.

(5) Next Meeting Date:

The next meeting of the Business Affairs Committee was rescheduled to Wednesday, January 29, 2020 at 9:00 A.M. in the Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom, M2-1.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

An Executive Session followed the Public Session.

JE/lm

**COMBINED PHONE MEETING OF THE BUSINESS AFFAIRS AND
EXECUTIVE COMMITTEES OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES
Community College of Philadelphia
Thursday, January 9, 2020 – 11:00 A.M.**

**Dial-In Number: 1-888-675-6779
Participant Passcode: 5410073#**

Present for the Business Affairs Committee: Lydia Hernández Vélez, Esq. (Chair), Mr. Harold Epps, Mr. Steve Herzog, and Mr. Jeremiah J. White, Jr.

Present for the Executive Committee: Lydia Hernández Vélez, Esq., Mr. Harold Epps, Ms. Mindy Posoff and Mr. Jeremiah J. White, Jr.

Present for the Business Affairs and Executive Committees: Lydia Hernández Vélez, Esq., Mr. Harold Epps, and Mr. Jeremiah J. White, Jr.

College Administration: Donald Generals, Ed.D., Mr. Michael Fohner, Mr. James P. Spiewak and Victoria Zellers, Esq.

PUBLIC SESSION
Business Affairs Committee Meeting

(1) Authorization to Execute Lease for 4701 Chestnut Street, the Parking Lot Location for the College’s Career and Advanced Technology Center in West Philadelphia. (Action Item):

Ms. Lydia Hernández Vélez called to order the meeting of the Business Affairs Committee of the Board of Trustees. Ms. Zellers stated that the College requires parking spaces for the new Career and Advanced Technology Center and has negotiated the terms for a lease of property located at 4701 Chestnut Street from District Council No. 33, American Federation of State, County, and Municipal Employees AFL-CIO 9 (“DC 33”). She reported that the lease is for a three-year term, with one option at the College’s discretion for a three-year renewal term.

Ms. Zellers discussed the negotiating process and the final terms agreed upon by both parties. The annual amount of the lease is \$50,000 per year during the Initial 3-year term, with a 3% increase, to \$51,1500 per year, during the 3-year Renewal Term. She stated that the College will be responsible for real estate and use and occupancy taxes, maintenance of the lot, and any utilities. The College will also be responsible for improvements to the lot as required for appropriate zoning and use of the lot. The lease also provides DC 33 with exclusive use of 22 of the 72 parking spaces in the lot. At this time, improvements to the lot are estimated to cost the College between \$100,000 and \$150,000.

Mr. Fohner identified the improvements to be putting down asphalt, improving lighting and providing landscaping. The lease also contains the right for the College to use the property for staging purposes during the construction of the Career & Advanced Technology Center and to add a temporary structure for the College’s automotive program if needed. Mr. Fohner noted that the site will definitely be utilized as a staging area during the construction period but that the College had identified an alternate solution for the College’s automotive program

during the construction period. The lease also contains mutual insurance obligations and mutual indemnification obligations for both District 33 and the College.

Action: Mr. Epps moved and Mr. Herzog seconded the motion that the Business Affairs Committee recommend that the Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees authorize the College to execute the lease for 4701 Chestnut Street with DC 33 for the parking lot location for the College's Career and Advanced Technology Center at its West Regional Center. The motion passed unanimously.

PUBLIC SESSION
Executive Committee Meeting

(1) Approval of Execution of Lease for 4701 Chestnut Street based on Business Affairs Committee Recommendation

Mr. White called to order the meeting of the Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees. Ms. Hernández Vélez moved that the Executive Committee authorize the College to execute the lease for 4701 Chestnut Street with DC 33 for the parking lot location for the College's Career and Advanced Technology Center at its West Regional Center as recommended by the Business Affairs Committee. This motion was seconded by Mr. Epps. The motion passed unanimously.

JPS/lm

**MEETING OF THE BUSINESS AFFAIRS COMMITTEE
OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES
Community College of Philadelphia
Wednesday, January 29, 2020– 9:00 A.M.**

Present: Lydia Hernández Vélez, Esq. (Chair), Mr. Rob Dubow, Mr. Harold Epps, Mr. Steve Herzog (via teleconference), Mr. Michael Soileau (via teleconference), Mr. Jeremiah White (via teleconference), Dr. Donald Guy Generals, Mr. Jacob Eapen, Mr. Michael Fohner, Ms. Lisa Hutcherson, Mr. Gim Lim, Mr. James P. Spiewak, Victoria Zellers, Esq., and Ms. Sarah de Wolf (Guest, City Finance Department)

Ms. Lydia Hernández Vélez convened an executive session to discuss real estate matters.

AGENDA

PUBLIC SESSION

(1) Approval of Bids Received for the Career and Advanced Technology Center (Action Item):

Discussion: Mr. Eapen explained that the Career & Advanced Technology Center project consists of the construction of a new 3-story 75,000 sf building on the corner of 48th Street and Market Streets. This project will transform the Community College of Philadelphia's West Philadelphia Regional Center, supporting advanced high-quality academic and technology programs for students preparing to enter the region's workforce. He noted that the design started in February 2019 and construction documents were completed in December 2019. The project was bid as a multi-prime contract (General Construction, Mechanical, Electrical, Plumbing & Fire Protection). Mr. Eapen stated that there were pre-bid meetings held on Tuesday, December 10th at the Enterprise Center and again on Friday, January 3rd at the College's West Regional Campus. Construction documents were initially posted on PennBid on October 29, 2019 for interest generation, and were continually updated through the posting of construction documents in December. Additionally, to further inform W/MBE firms of this opportunity, the following agencies received information concerning this project to share with their members: African American Chamber of Commerce of Pennsylvania, New Jersey & Delaware; Greater Philadelphia Hispanic Chamber of Commerce; Urban Affairs Coalition (formerly GPUCA); Eastern Minority Supplier Development Council; Office of Economic Opportunity, City of Philadelphia; Minority Business Development Agency Business Center

Pennsylvania; Women's Business Enterprise Council (WBEC) PA-DE-sNJ; the federal Small Business Administration; and Goldman Sachs 10,000 small businesses. Bids were due on Tuesday, January 21st. General Contractor and Plumbing & Mechanical meetings were held with all low bidders on January 22, 2020 and January 23, 2020. Mr. Eapen provided a summary of the bids received as shown below. He explained that the low bidders for each contract were interviewed by College staff, the architect and the construction manager to ensure that the bids received were fully compliant with the architect's design and the RFP requirements. The electrical bidder was interviewed by the College staff. Mr. Eapen provided a brief description of each low bid contractor's experience with working with Philadelphia-based entities, their workforce demographics and the location of their primary office. Mr. Eapen stated that the bids came in about \$5 million less than estimated. In response to questions from Committee members, staff noted that the construction budget was \$30 million which included a \$1 million contingency for design uncertainties and a \$1.4 million project contingency. The bid responses totaled approximately \$25 million. Staff expressed confidence that the electrical contract bid amount met the project scope. In response to the EOP filed with the City, its goals are for 20-25% minority owned participation and 10-15% women owned participation in construction costs and 50% Philadelphia residents for the workforce. The construction manager hired by the College, Greyhawk, will track and coordinate these efforts with the contractors. Subject to any delays related to zoning issues, it is expected that construction activities will begin on or about May 1, 2020 with a completion date of August, 2021. Mr. White inquired about discussions held with local community groups and was assured that contacts and updates are on-going. Dr. Generals noted that an informational binder is continually updated and is available for review. Mr. White also noted that at an upcoming meeting, the Board should review the budgetary impact related to this project.

Bids Received	Contract	Company		Base Bid Amount
8	General Construction	Ernest Bock & Sons		\$15,985,000.00
		Rycon Construction, Inc.		\$16,267,000.00
		New Age Development Group		\$16,276,910.74
		The Bedwell Company		\$17,127,000.00
		PJ Dick Mid-Atlantic		\$17,490,000.00
		Smith Construction, Inc.		\$17,964,000.00
		IMC Construction		\$18,800,000.00
		Bittenbender Construction, LP		\$19,311,000.00
6	Mechanical	Dolan Mechanical, Inc.		\$3,648,000.00
		Edward J. Meloney, Inc.	Bid Withdrawn	\$2,920,000.00
		Falasca Mechanical, Inc.		\$3,806,000.00
		PT Mechanical Group		\$3,998,605.00
		Devine Brothers		\$4,087,100.00
		Eagle Mechanical, Inc.		\$4,498,000.00
3	Electrical	McGoldrick Electric, Inc.		\$3,358,000.00
		Madden Electric		\$5,412,540.00
		Mulhearn Electric Company		\$5,744,926.00
4	Plumbing & Fire Protection	Dolan Mechanical, Inc.		\$1,738,000.00
		Eagle Mechanical, Inc.		\$1,749,000.00
		Lima Company		\$1,780,450.00
		Devine Brothers		\$2,261,200.00
			Total Base Bid	\$24,729,000.00

	Alternate 3 – West & North Elevation Window logos	Alternate 4 – Epoxy flooring for diesel & auto labs	Alternate 5 – Dimensional Lettering Sign
General Construction	\$74,500.00	\$95,000.00	\$67,500.00
Mechanical	\$0	\$0	\$0
Electrical	\$0	\$0	\$0
Plumbing & Fire Protection	\$0	\$0	\$0
Fire Protection	\$0	\$0	\$0
		Total Alternates	\$237,000.00

Mr. Eapen stated that the staff is requesting that the Committee recommend to the full Board awarding the contracts to the low respondents as follows:

- General Construction to be awarded to **Ernest Bock & Sons** in the amount of **\$16,222,000**.
- Mechanical to be awarded to **Dolan Mechanical, Inc.** in the amount of **\$3,648,000**.
- Electrical to be awarded to **McGoldrick Electric, Inc.** in the amount of **\$3,358,000**.
- Plumbing & Fire Protection to be awarded to **Dolan Mechanical, Inc.** in the amount of **\$1,738,000**.

Action: Mr. Epps moved and Mr. Dubow seconded the motion that the Committee recommend to the full Board to award the contracts to the low respondents for the Career and Advanced Technology Center as follows:

- General Construction to be awarded to **Ernest Bock & Sons** in the amount of **\$16,222,000**.
- Mechanical to be awarded to **Dolan Mechanical, Inc.** in the amount of **\$3,648,000**.
- Electrical to be awarded to **McGoldrick Electric, Inc.** in the amount of **\$3,358,000**.
- Plumbing & Fire Protection to be awarded to **Dolan Mechanical, Inc.** in the amount of **\$1,738,000**.

The motion passed unanimously.

(2) Approval of Structural Repairs for the Center for Business Industry Parking Garage (Action Item):

Discussion: Mr. Fohner informed the Committee that water and salt have infiltrated and are causing deterioration to the garage's steel decks. He noted that while the current conditions do not represent any significant or immediate safety concerns, the scheduled repairs will rectify any known issues and ensure that the useful life of the facility is extended and remains in a reliable state of repair, thus avoiding any significant, foreseeable and expensive capital repairs. An engineering firm was hired to fully investigate the extent of the problem and to develop the appropriate remedial actions. In response to Committee questions, Mr. Fohner stated that current industry practices do not necessarily involve treating steel and concrete in parking garages.

Mr. Fohner stated that the focus of the repairs will be to address compromised areas which are allowing water and salt intrusion, and contributing to an accelerated deterioration of the composite steel decking for the floors, concrete spalling (both overhead and on the driving surfaces), waterproofing sealants and some minor electrical conditions.

Mr. Eapen explained that the comprehensive repair program was designed by Philadelphia-based, structural and specialty repair engineering firm Keast and Hood. An RFP was issued which had three bid respondents. Upon completion of a thorough bid and scope review which included the participation of Keast and Hood, College staff recommends awarding Quinn Construction, Inc. of Essington, PA, who is the lowest responsible bidder, to repair structural damages to the Center for Business and Industry parking garage in the amount of \$715,000. Additional bids were received from the Premier Building Restoration in the amount of \$829,000 and Platinum Scaffolding Services in the amount of \$1,475,000. Mr. Fohner responded to a question concerning the variance in bid response values by stating that, most likely, Quinn Construction, Inc. bid with a lower profit and overhead margin in order to avoid layoffs of its workforce. The College has had no experiences with Platinum Scaffolding Services and staff cannot explain why their bid was so high in relation to the other two.

Mr. Fohner stated that the schedule for the project is to commence with some early phase work in April 2020 and continuing through late August 2020 in order to have the project completed for the start of the Fall Term. Upon completion, the finished product will render a safe and well maintained facility with an extended useful life. Additional highlights are that the aesthetics of the facility will be enhanced from the protective coating system on the ramp and first floor. This system will protect against further salt and water intrusion.

Mr. Eapen stated that the staff is requesting that the Committee recommend to the full Board to award the contract to Quinn Construction, Inc. in the amount of \$715,000 to repair the structural damages to the Center for Business and Industry parking garage.

Action: Mr. Epps moved and Mr. Dubow seconded the motion that the Committee recommend to the full Board to award the contract to Quinn Construction, Inc. in the amount of \$715,000 to repair the structural damages to the Center for Business and Industry parking garage. The motion passed unanimously with Mr. Herzog abstaining from the vote because his neighbor is the owner of Quinn Construction, Inc.

(3) Approval of Grant Thornton as the College's Independent Auditor for a Three Year Period with Two Option Years (Action Item):

Discussion: Mr. Eapen stated that Grant Thornton has served as the College's external auditors since fiscal year 2014. An RFP process was used to solicit proposals for the College's audit, tax and accounting services for a three-year period of time.

The following services are expected to be provided by the external auditors:

- Annual Financial Audit
- State Annual Tuition Compliance Agreed Upon Procedures
- Annual Uniform Guidance Audit
- Foundation 990 and 990-T Returns
- Agreed Upon Procedures for grants (as needed)
- Bond Issue Acknowledgement Letter
- Attend Audit Committee Meetings and Provide Industry Updates

Mr. Eapen explained that the College invited fifteen local and national accounting firms, that had higher education experience, to submit a bid. Please refer to Attachment A.

The College received bid proposals from:

1. Baker Tilly Virchow Krause LLP
2. RSM US, LLP
3. Clifton Larson Allen LLP
4. Grant Thornton LLP

The Audit Committee selection team consisting of Anthony Simonetta, Chair of the Audit Committee, Lydia Hernández Vélez, Chair of the Business Affairs Committee, Jim Spiewak and Gim Lim met on December 11, 2019 to review the above bids. The team reviewed each bid proposal based on their audit approach, team knowledge and experience, firm’s location in Philadelphia, firm’s support for diversity, partnership with MBE, and pricing. It was the general consensus that Grant Thornton LLP with their minority partner, The Meridian Group, best meets all criteria. Mr. Eapen reviewed Grant Thornton’s annual costs of the audit, noting that the initial year is \$8,000 more than the current contract amount. The contract provides an option to renew for two additional years.

Below are the proposed fees:

FY 2019-2020	\$134,000
FY 2020-2021	\$134,000
FY 2021-2022	\$138,200

For FY 2018-2019, the dollar amount should be \$126,000.

Mr. Eapen stated that the staff is requesting that the Committee recommend to the full Board the approval of a three-year contract at a total cost of \$406,000 with an option to renew for two additional years. In response to Committee members’ questions, staff noted that a new partner was placed on the account last fiscal year so there is no need for a partner rotation at this time. Mr. White stated that in addition to providing excellent audit work, Grant Thornton provided valuable industry trends and information to staff and the Board.

Action: Mr. Dubow moved and Mr. Epps seconded the motion that the Committee recommend to the full Board the approval of a three-year contract with Grant Thornton at a total cost of \$406,000 with an option to renew for FY 2022-23 – \$138,200 and FY 2023-24 - \$142,450. The motion passed unanimously.

(4) Approval of Benefits Consulting Services (Action Item):

Discussion: Mr. Eapen stated that in 2019, the College ended its agreement with Alliant as our benefits broker for our medical and prescription plans. This change provided an opportunity to re-assess our needs based on the strategic direction of the College and evaluate alternative solutions to help reduce the expense of health insurance. He stated that staff would benefit by hiring a benefits consultant on a fixed fee to assist the College in navigating various aspects of the healthcare industry, including assisting with vendor contract negotiations and bidding and providing other cost containment solutions.

The RFP was sent to Pentra (Alera Group), Trion Group, Exude and BeneServ. The College received bids from Pentra and Trion Group. Pentra provided a quote of \$120,000 and the Trion Group provided a quote of \$150,000 for their core services and \$25,000 for Benefits Administrative Services. Although the Trion Group was not the lowest bidder, they were able to offer competitive pricing which includes a robust data analytics platform and COBRA administration. The Trion Group has the experience, technology and expertise needed to assist the College in creating and implementing short- and long-term strategies to reduce healthcare costs, maintain compliance, and help our employees in becoming educated healthcare consumers. Please refer to Attachment B which contains the services to be provided by the Trion Group. In response to questions, staff noted that Exude, a minority vendor, did not submit a bid because their ownership did not feel they had the depth to service an account the size of the College's account.

Mr. Eapen stated that the Trion Group is a wholly-owned subsidiary of the Marsh & McLennan Companies, Inc., a publicly traded company with a strong financial rating.

Mr. Eapen stated that the staff is requesting that the Committee recommend to the full Board the approval of the proposal made by the Trion Group for the period of April 1, 2020 to March 31, 2021 in the amount \$175,000 with an option to renew for two years at the same cost.

Action: Mr. Dubow moved and Mr. Epps seconded the motion that the Committee recommend to the full Board the approval of the proposal made by the Trion Group for the period of April 1, 2020 to March 31, 2021 in the amount \$175,000 with an option to renew for two years at the same cost. The motion passed unanimously.

(5) Amendment to the Lease Agreement for 1500 Spring Garden Street, 7th Floor
(Action Item):

Discussion: Mr. Eapen provided background information on the lease stating that the College has been leasing 10,932 square feet from 1500 Net-Works Associates, L.P. since April 2005. The Division of Marketing and Communications, the Division of Institutional Advancement and the Foundation, and the Department of Human Resources are occupying the space at 1500 Spring Garden Street. There is no available space for these three areas at the 1700 Spring Garden Street location so a renewal of the lease with 1500 Net-Works Associates, L.P. is necessary.

The current lease is \$24,424 per month at an annual cost of \$293,087. The renewal terms are:

Year 1 ending 7/31/2021	\$224,926 (includes 3 months of free rent)
Year 2 ending 7/31/2022	\$297,321
Year 3 ending 7/31/2023	\$306,164
Year 4 ending 7/31/2024	\$314,369
Year 5 ending 7/31/2025	\$322,592
Month ending 10/31/2025	\$ 82,380

Mr. Eapen noted that the proposed 63-month lease contains a .50 cents increase in base rent per square feet over current rate and a 2% yearly escalation in operating expenses and real estate taxes. The renewal also includes three months of free rent and \$109,320 in renovations to be paid by the landlord.

Mr. Eapen stated that the staff is requesting that the Committee recommend to the full Board approval of a 63-month lease with 1500 Net-Works Associates, L.P. starting August 1, 2020 with annual payments of \$224,926 – Year 1, \$297,321 – Year 2, \$306,164 – Year 3, \$314,309 – Year 4, \$322,592 – Year 5, and month ending 10/31/2025 - \$82,380. The lease will also include 3 months of free rent and \$109,320 in renovations to be done by the landlord.

Mr. Eapen also noted that, as College staff expands, additional space needs will arise. Committee members emphasized that staff need to take this into consideration as new buildings come online. Mr. Eapen stated that the Facilities Master Plan has incorporated these planning issues.

Action: Mr. Epps moved and Mr. Soileau seconded the motion that the Committee recommend to the full Board approval of a 63-month lease with 1500 Net-Works Associates,

L.P. starting August 1, 2020 with annual payments of \$224,926 – Year 1, \$297,321 – Year 2, \$306,164 – Year 3, \$314,309 – Year 4, \$322,592 – Year 5, and month ending 10/31/2025 - \$82,380. The lease will also include 3 months of free rent and \$109,320 in renovations to be done by the landlord. The motion passed unanimously.

(6) Other

Ms. Zellers informed the Committee on the status of Phase II of The Hamilton project. Committee members and staff discussed various aspects related to this property.

(7) Next Meeting

The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Committee will be held on **Wednesday, February 19th at 9:00 A.M.** in the Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom, M2-1.

JE/Im

Attachments

BAC\January 29, 2020MINUTES.DOC

ATTACHMENT A

**List of Fifteen Local and National Accounting Firms the College
Invited to Submit a Bid for the College's Audit, Tax and
Accounting Services for a Three-Year Period of Time,
with Two Option Years**

The College invited fifteen local and national accounting firms to submit a bid.

- BDO USA, LLP
- Baker Tilly Virchow Krause LLP
- Clifton Larson Allen LLP
- Deloitte LLP
- Eisner Amper LLP
- Ernst & Young
- Grant Thornton LLP
- Horsey, Buckner & Heffler LLP
- JT Goldstein, LLC
- KPMG
- Mitchell & Titus LLP
- Milligan and Company LLC
- PwC
- RSM US, LLP
- The Meridian Group, Ltd.

ATTACHMENT B

Benefit Consulting Services to be Provided by the Trion Group



Consulting Scope of Services

For

Community College *of* Philadelphia

1 Strategic Planning

Trion shall on an annual basis, facilitate a Strategic Planning process that will cover the following key components of CCOP's Health & Welfare programs:

Marketplace Overview

Trion will illustrate and provide observations and commentary based on information and data from a host of national and industry healthcare and employee benefits sources. The Marketplace Overview will provide a "high-level" view of the current state of benefits, as well as, an outlook for the future.

Business Objectives

Trion will work in partnership with CCOP to understand CCOP's environment, culture, strategy, obstacles and objectives. This will enable Trion to identify problems or opportunities, highlight consequences, projected potential impact, and work with CCOP more efficiently to develop solutions that meet CCOP's unique needs.

Plan Benchmarking

In order to identify CCOP's overall current competitive position, Trion will use various benchmark sources, which provide CCOP detailed comparative information on plan design and financial norms from national benefit surveys, to develop a benchmarking report of the CCOP's key benefit features.

Cost and Utilization Review

Trion will assist CCOP in understanding the efficiency, effectiveness and quality of health benefits by analyzing available claim, utilization and demographic data. Trion will facilitate carrier meeting on an annual basis.

Strategy Development and Plan Management

Trion will create a short- and long-term strategy based on the outcomes of the above components. The strategy design will incorporate both basic and advanced approaches to managing CCOP's benefits. Each proposed initiative will be accompanied by the financial impact, as well as the qualitative impacts to CCOP and CCOP's employees. Specifically, the strategy will address opportunities surrounding:

- Balance of valued benefits and employer/employee affordability.
- Cost.
- Plan designs.
- Product offerings.
- Vendors.
- Funding methodologies.
- Cost sharing.
- Health Management improvement initiatives.

Financial Modeling

Trion will illustrate the strategy with the aid of financial modeling tools. The tools will enable CCOP to assess the financial impact of short and long term initiatives while constructing a benefits strategy. The resulting strategy will become the foundation for a multi-year action plan that incorporates a broad, comprehensive look at CCOP's overall benefit delivery objectives in the context of CCOP's specific environment and financial constraints.

Strategic Planning Deliverables

Facilitate and coordinate a planning meeting, including assistance with preparation of CCOP's presentation to senior management (additional meetings are out of scope; applicable costs and travel related expenses may apply)

- Demographic analysis report.
- Comparative benchmarking report.
- Total Opportunity Matrix (TOM).
- Data Analytics
- Strategic planning document.
- Annual Calendar of Events.
- Stewardship report.

2 Renewal Management

Trion will use the CCOP's plan experience and working knowledge of the vendor's underwriting methods and acceptable current market cost factors to ensure fixed plan costs (administration and insurance costs) and projected variable plan costs (claims expenses) are reasonable.

Vendor Negotiations

- Request renewal based on agreed upon timeline.
- Review available experience, demographics, claims and employee contributions coverage.
- Analyze and validate vendor renewal terms.
- Negotiate renewals with respective vendors.
- Secure performance metrics, if applicable.
- Coordinate all related plan design and financial requests to vendor.

Design/Funding Options

- Plan Design / Funding Adjustments pricing alternatives, if applicable.

Budget Development

- Develop and document next plan year fees and budget rates in Trion's format with review by CCOP.
- Develop and document next plan year projected costs, split into total, employer and employee costs in Trion's format.
- Provide point in time ACA affordability review.
- Provide compliance wellness incentive review.

The negotiated next-year rates and fees of the incumbent insurers/vendors will be fully reported for your review and records. In addition, Trion will prepare premium-equivalency rates for self-funded plans and annual budget projections.

Employee Contribution Modeling

Once the final benefit rates have been agreed upon, Trion will assist CCOP to finalize a contribution strategy. The contribution strategy will take into account marketplace approaches that fit CCOP's strategic plan, along with the potential impact from both CCOP and the employee's perspective. After a contribution approach is selected, Trion will finalize the associated employee contribution rates by plan and tier of coverage.

Deliverables

- Facilitate/coordinate renewal presentation meeting (additional meetings are out of scope; applicable costs and travel related expenses may apply).
- Renewal report/presentation.
- Final rates and contributions in Trion's standard format.

3 Competitive Bidding

The outcome of the Strategic Planning and/or the Renewal Management phase may or may not require a new vendor selection. If warranted, Trion will seek new benefit plan vendor relationships through a competitive bidding process.

Objective Setting

- Prioritize selection criteria.
- Identifying target vendors.
- Proposal analysis.
- Vendor negotiations.
- Determine reasons to change, selection criteria, current market competitiveness and tipping point to change vendors.

RFP Development

- Identify target vendor market and critical components to address.
- Prepare and distribute a Request for Proposal (RFP) to the market.

Proposal Evaluation

- Leverage proprietary modeling tools to compare vendor responses and select the finalists.

Finalist Negotiation

- Drive best costs and provisions.
- Secure performance guarantees with metrics, if applicable.
- Select vendor decision notification.

Implementation Support

- Ensure plan changes are implemented accurately with the least amount of disruption to the Human Resource team/employees.
- Ensure vendor services match proposals and contracts.

Deliverables

- Facilitate/coordinate a market results presentation meeting (additional meetings are out of scope; applicable costs and travel related expenses may apply).
- Provide market results report/presentation.

- Facilitate, coordinate and participate in the finalist vendor meeting.

4 Vendor Management

Trion will work closely with CCOP and the vendors to verify that the benefit components Trion recommends and negotiated are accurately reflected in the contract, as well as ensure the vendor's quality, scope of services and pricing meet the CCOP's expectations. Services include:

Implementation Support

- Negotiate measurable key results with performance-based vendor service fees, if applicable.
- Schedule conference calls.
- Oversight of vendor's implementation teams.
- Assurance that vendor services match proposals and contracts.
- Issue resolution.
- Assistance with setting up group structure to support ongoing claims tracking and reporting as well as overall eligibility per group locations, divisions, collective bargaining units or other subgroups as defined by the CCOP.

Results Meetings

- Annual meeting with each healthcare vendor to review plan/vendor performance, agree on improvement strategies and discuss enhanced vendor capabilities.

Open Enrollment Coordination

- Coordinate the open enrollment process with your various vendors.

Deliverables

- Narrated Presentation
- On-site participation at CCOP's Open Enrollment (OE) meetings.

5 Financial Management

- Annual cost and utilization dashboard, if experience is available from the CCOP's carriers.
- Annual OE migration results (if data is available).
- Annual Incurred But Not Reported (IBNR) reserve estimate/calculation (ASO CCOPs only).

Other, if applicable

- Semi-annual: ASO cost re-projections.
- Semi-Annual executive dashboard of key financial metrics (ASO CCOPs only).
- Quarterly: total actual cost to budget report (ASO Plans only).

6 Compliance Assistance

Trion will update CCOP with federal government, (i.e. not city, state or local), reporting requirements and related routine compliance issues as they arise. Trion will provide a comprehensive set of federal legislative awareness, updates and position statements and on-going support with your federal Healthcare Reform and compliance issues and tasks.

Compliance

- Signature ready 5500, if applicable (only applicable if qualify based on filing 5500s, 100+ enrolled in a 5500 filed plan).
- Preparation of Summary Annual Report, if applicable (only applicable if qualify based on filing 5500s, 100+ enrolled in a 5500 filed plan).
- Provide Federal Employee Benefits Plans Compliance Checklist template on an annual basis (for groups under 100 employees enrolled in medical plan(s)).
- Conduct compliance review, including completion of Federal Employee Benefits Plans Compliance Checklist (for groups over 100 employees enrolled in medical plan(s))
- Provide the following standard language/notices:
 - Women’s Health and Cancer Rights Act (WHCRA) Notice.
 - Medicaid/SCHIP State Premium Assistance Subsidy Notice.
 - Medicare Part D Notice of Creditable Coverage.
 - HIPAA/SCHIP Special Enrollment Rights Notice.
 - HIPAA Non-Discrimination / Wellness Programs – Reasonable Alternative Standard Notice (if applicable).
 - Access to Provider Rights Notice / Notice of Patient Protections.
 - Exchange Notice.
 - General Notice of COBRA Coverage Notice (COBRA Initial Rights Notice).

Health Care Reform (HCR)

- Provide ongoing technical updates, seminars, and webinars.
- HCR Alerts and newsletters.
- Maintain latest info, Q&A, HCR archive on Trion's website.
- Review HCR Compliance at implementation utilizing Trion’s compliance checklist (if applicable with greater than 100 employees enrolled in the medical plan(s)).
- PCORI Count Calculation using various methodologies for CCOP consideration and CCOP submission, as required until no longer applicable.

Medicare Part D Electronic Certification Reminder

- CMS Medicare Part D Creditable Coverage annual filing reminder and instructions.

7 CCOP Services*

Trion CCOP Services will complement your internal resources in plan administration and plan management issues resolution and service delivery, including:

- Review of SPDs, contracts, policies to ensure consistency with plan provisions including covered benefit plans as outlined in contract with Trion only.
- Review of Benefit/Plan Summaries and Summary of Benefits and Coverage (SBC).
- Coordinate review of Trion specific CCOP documents, including Trion Business Associate Agreement (BAA)/Confidentiality Agreements.
- Coordination of reimbursement with stop-loss vendors including work with appropriate vendors to set up ongoing file feed or electronic reporting exchanges, if available.
- Assist with escalated claims issues.
- Support to resolve plan provisions, claims, eligibility and billing issues with vendors.
- Address provider network issues/questions.

- Report on negotiated performance metrics, if applicable.

** Covered Plans in Contract only*

8 Communications*

Our core consulting services include basic review and factual updating of employee-facing enrollment materials by our CCOP Service team. That includes either an update to using existing CCOP-provided communications or development of our Premium In-Scope Package, a full campaign that features the following components:

Benefit Communication Material

- Welcome letter
- Newsletter/Benefits Enrollment Guide (Trion standard format or edits to an existing template); choice of three (3) pre-written and pre-designed options, featuring CCOP's specific colors and logo.
- "What's New" Highlight Sheet.
- Announcement Poster and Postcard.
- Narrated Presentation.
- Access to TRION Narrated Benefits Video Library.

**One (1) English Version of each listed above. Two (2) rounds of revisions are included in-scope. Additional charge will apply for any added versions and/or revisions. Additional charge applies for administrative expenses such as taxes, postage, production, and shipping.*

9 iBenefits

iBenefits is an app that gives employees easy access to their company's benefits guide on their mobile devices:

- Native app is available on iOS and Android devices.
- Features the CCOP's specific content, branding, and login code built in a standard format.
- Employees simply "tap" to access third-party websites and call carriers, freeing up the CCOPs' Human Resources team.
- Year-round "push notifications" reach employees with important information and reminders.
- Standard communications support a successful roll out.

10 ThinkHR

The ThinkHR website provides you with tools to build an Employee Handbook, Job Description and Compensation tools among other helpful resources. ThinkHR offers many services including:

- ThinkHR Live, a team of HR experts standing by to answer your questions or provide advice. This phone-based support service is available from 8:00 a.m. to 7:00 p.m. Central Time Monday through Friday.
- ThinkHR Comply, an award-winning online resource center for all of your workforce issues.
- ThinkHR Learn provides training solutions (including tracking capabilities) for over 200 courses.
- ThinkHR provides a vast library of sample policies, procedures and other helpful template documents to be utilized by the CCOP. This includes an employee handbook builder, state law resource guide, compensation tool among others. CCOP can provide access to all Human Resources/Benefits team members at no additional charge.

February 2020 Events

Meditation Mondays

Every Monday in February | 9:00 a.m. – 6:00 p.m.
Winnet Student Life Building, Lobby
Refresh your mind each Monday with guided audio & visual meditation queues
Sponsored by the Office of Student Engagement

Architecture and Design Student Exhibition

February 1-28
Mint Building, Rotunda
Visit to experience the amazing exhibits of the Architecture and Design students

African American Children's Book Fair

February 1 | 1:00-4:00 p.m.
Athletics Center, Gymnasium
This external event is free and open to the public. One of the oldest and largest single day events for African American children's books in the country, parents, caregivers and educators join authors and illustrators who give presentations on their books. *Organized by The Literary*

Student Success Initiatives Info Session

February 4 | 9:00 a.m. – 1:00 p.m.
Center for Business & Industry, C3-05
Learn about the multitude of initiatives to help students remain successful. Staff and Students welcome. Sponsored by Student Outreach & Recruitment

Biomedical Technician Info Session

February 5 | 3:45 p.m. – 5:15 p.m.
West Building, W2-47
Hosted by the Biology Department

Café Live

February 7 | 4:00 p.m. – 8:00 p.m.
Winnet Student Life Building, Lobby
Join students as they unwind from the week featuring music and themed cuisine.
Sponsored by the Office of Student Engagement

Health Fair

February 12 | 9:00 a.m. – 3:00 p.m.
Bonnell Building, Lobby
Visit Providers and Departments to learn about opportunities in Healthcare
Sponsored by the Counseling Department

Women's Leadership Academy

February 12 | 4:00 p.m. – 6:00 p.m.
Center for Business & Industry, C2-05
Sponsored by the Counseling Department

African American Heritage Month Workshop

February 13 | 9:00 a.m. – 4:00 p.m.
Winnet Student Life Building, Lobby
Sponsored by the Office of Student Engagement

Valentine's Day Market Place

February 14 | 9:00 a.m. – 3:00 p.m.
Bonnell Building, Lobby
Sponsored by the Office of Student Life

Student Wellness Expo

February 14 | 11:00 a.m. – 2:00 p.m.
Winnet Student Life Building, Great Hall
Sponsored by D.A.C.E.

BLAS the Yard Event

February 17 | 10:00 a.m. – 2:00 p.m.
Pavilion Building, The Klein Cube
Experience the African American Culture as seen on many Historically Black Colleges and Universities. Greek Letter Performances, Cuisine, Music and Social Gatherings.
Sponsored by the Black Studies Program

Poets and Writers Festival

February 19 | 11:00 a.m. – 3:00 p.m.
Winnet Student Life Building, The Great Hall
Hosted by the English Department

African American Heritage Literary Pop Up

February 19 | 12:00 p.m. – 1:00 p.m.
Winnet Student Life Building, Lobby
Sponsored by the Office of Student Engagement

The Path to Possibilities™

Fireside Chat

February 20 | 3 – 4 p.m.

Winnet Student Life Building, Lobby

Join in the first Fireside Chat of the spring semester to engage in a conversation recognizing African American History Month. Share reflections on your favorite book, poem, song or any artistic expression.

Black Girl Magic

February 20 | 7:00 p.m. – 9:00 p.m.

Bonnell Building, Large Auditorium

Experience the popular & world renowned drag show, *Black Girl Magic*

Sponsored by the Marc David LGBTQ Center

Law and Society Week 2020

February 24 – 28

<https://www.ccp.edu/about-us/centers-excellence/fox-rothschild-center-law-and-society>

Presented by Fox Rothschild Center for Law and Society, this annual week of legal events, designed for the College and local community, will feature workshops, lectures, film screenings and panel discussions on a variety of current topics. Many events qualify for continuing legal education credits.

CME S-3 Series

February 28 | 12:00 p.m. – 2:00 p.m.

Winnet Student Life Building, Great Hall

Sponsored by the Center for Male Engagement

**Intercollegiate Athletics Schedule**

Men's and Women's Basketball Schedule

<https://www.ccp.edu/campus-life/athletics/intercollegiate-athletics>

#CCPpride Days

Every Tuesday

"Wear Your Black, Gold, or Lions Gear!"

The Path to Possibilities™