



MEETING OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
Thursday, November 1, 2018– 3:00 p.m.  
Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom – M2-1

Table of Contents

---

(1)	Agenda	Pages 2-3
(2)	Proceedings and Minutes of Decisions and Resolutions Meeting of October 4, 2018	Pages 4-11
(3)	Gifts and Grants	Pages 12-13
(4)	Minutes of the October 4, 2018 Student Outcomes Committee	Pages 14-29
(5)	Minutes of the October 16, 2018 Business Affairs and Executive Committees of the Board	Pages 30-31
(6)	Minutes of the October 24, 2018 Business Affairs Committee	Pages 32-51
(7)	List of College Events for November/December 2018	Pages 52-53

#####

MEETING OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES

AGENDA

Thursday, November 1, 2018– 3:00 p.m.

Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom, M2-1

- (1) Meeting Called to Order
- (2) Public Comment
- (3) Report of the Student Outcomes Committee
- (4) Report of the Business Affairs Committee
  - (a) Tierney Proposal – Marketing and Communications Consulting Services (Ratifying Decision of Business Affairs and Executive Committees) (A)
  - (b) Expressive Demonstration: Time, Place and Manner Policy (A)
- (5) Consent Agenda
  - (a) Proceedings and Minutes of Decisions and Resolutions Meeting of October 4, 2018
  - (b) Gifts and Grants
  - (c) Ellucian Constituent Relationship Management (CRM) Recruit Product Procurement
- (6) Report of the Chair
- (7) Foundation Report
- (8) Report of the President
- (9) New Business
- (10) Next Meeting: Thursday, February 7, 2019 – 3:00 p.m.  
Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom, M2-1
- (11) Executive Session

Future Committee Meetings:

Business Affairs:	Wednesday, November 28, 2018 10:00 a.m. – Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom, M2-1
Student Outcomes:	Thursday, February 7, 2019 1:30 p.m. – M2-34

Upcoming Events

Board of Trustees Retreat	Wednesday, November 14, 2018 8:30 a.m. – 2:30 p.m. Center for Business and Industry 1751 Callowhill Street, Room C2-5
Fall Pathways Magazine Breakfast	Monday, December 3, 2018 8:30 a.m. – 9:30 a.m. Pavilion Building, Klein Cube
College Wide Holiday Celebration	Tuesday, December 11, 2018 11:00 a.m. – Winnet Building Great Hall – S2-19

#####

COMMUNITY COLLEGE OF PHILADELPHIA  
Proceedings of the Meeting of the Board of Trustees  
Thursday, October 4, 2018 – 3:00 p.m.

Present: Mr. White, presiding; Ms. Biemiller, Mr. Clancy, Mr. Epps, Ms. Fulmore-Townsend, Ms. Hernández Vélez, Mr. Herzog, Ms. Ireland, Ms. Jean-Baptiste, Mr. Martz, Ms. Posoff, Representative Roebuck, Mr. Soileau, Dr. Generals, Ms. de Fries, Ms. DiGregorio, Mr. Eapen, Dr. Gay, Dr. Hirsch, Mr. Murphy, Ms. Hurst, and Ms. Zellers

(1) Meeting Called to Order

Mr. White called the meeting to order.

(2) Public Comment

Mr. White explained the process for Public Comment. He stated that Public Comment at Board of Trustees meetings is an opportunity for faculty, staff, students, and members of the community to give input to trustees on the direction of the College. Mr. White stated that today there will be one speaker who will provide Public Comment. The presenter will have three minutes to address the Board.

Mr. Junior Brainard, Assistant Professor of English and Secretary of the Federation, spoke regarding the status of collective bargaining negotiations. Mr. Brainard circulated copies of letters of support from several members of City Council as well as a copy of the Federation's vision for the College.

(3) Recognition of Service of Former Members of the Board

Dr. Generals and Mr. White presented a Resolution of Appreciation and a gift to Ms. Mary Horstmann, Dr. Judith Rényi, and Judge Stella Tsai for their service and commitment as members of the Board of Trustees. Dr. Generals thanked them for their support of the College and the vision that we laid out over the last six years.

Mr. White thanked Ms. Horstmann, Dr. Rényi, and Judge Tsai for their support and the leadership they provided during some very difficult times at the College.

Ms. Horstmann stated that it was a pleasure for her to have had the opportunity to be part of the Community College of Philadelphia Board of Trustees. She stated that she loves Philadelphia and that Community College of Philadelphia is a very large part of the future success of the City. Ms. Horstmann stated that there have been many changes in the last six

years. She thanked Dr. Generals and Mr. White for all their work in making the College an even greater success.

Dr. Rényi stated that it was an honor for her to have served as a member of the Board of Trustees. She stated that she was so proud of the energy and intelligence that Dr. Generals brought to his work at the College. Dr. Rényi thanked the Board for everything that they are doing and will continue to do on behalf of the College and students.

Judge Tsai stated that she was so proud of having been part of the team that brought Dr. Generals to the College and the initiative to focus on student success. Judge Tsai thanked the Board for transforming dreams into reality as that is what Community of Philadelphia does. Judge Tsai stated that she will continue to work on projects that will provide opportunities for the College's participation.

(4) Report of the Business Affairs Committee

Ms. Biemiller reported that the Committee had met on September 26, 2018. She stated that two action items, namely the Parking Garage Management Firm and High Speed Copiers, were discussed by the Committee, and are part of the Consent Agenda for Board approval.

(4a) Resolution Approving Salary Increase for Vice Presidents and General Counsel

Mr. White read the following Resolution for Board approval:

WHEREAS, on June 20, 2018, the Business Affairs Committee and Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees approved a two percent (2%) salary increase for the Community College of Philadelphia's Vice Presidents and General Counsel serving on the College's Cabinet to be effective July 1, 2018;

NOW THEREFORE, on this 4<sup>th</sup> day of October, 2018, the Board of Trustees hereby ratifies the decision of the Executive Committee approving a two percent (2%) salary increase for the Community College of Philadelphia's Vice Presidents and General Counsel serving on the College's Cabinet to be effective retroactively to July 1, 2018.

Ms. Hernández Vélez moved, with Mr. Soileau seconding, that the Board approve and ratify the above Resolution. The motion carried unanimously.

(5) Consent Agenda

Mr. White requested Board approval of the following Consent Agenda:

- (a) Proceedings and Minutes of Decisions and Resolutions  
Meeting of September 6, 2018

- (b) Gifts and Grants
- (c) Interior Design and Architecture Programs
- (d) Parking Garage Management Firm
- (e) High Speed Copiers

Ms. Soileau moved, with Ms. McPherson seconding, that the Board approve the Consent Agenda. The motion carried unanimously.

(6) Report of the Audit Committee

At the request of Mr. White, Mr. Eapen reported that the Committee had met on September 28, 2018 and had reviewed the financials and issues that may have occurred during business last year. Mr. Eapen stated that there were no issues, and that the College had received a clean audit for 2017-2018.

Mr. Soileau moved, with Ms. McPherson seconding, that the Board accept the report of the Audit Committee. The motion carried unanimously.

(7) Report of the Chair

(7a) Association of Community College Trustees  
Leadership Congress, October 24-27, 2018  
Marriott Marquis Hotel, New York

Mr. White reported that the Association of Community College Trustees (ACCT) Leadership Congress is scheduled for October 24-27, 2018 at the Marriott Marquis Hotel in New York. He stated that he, Dr. Generals, Ms. Posoff, Mr. Clancy, and Ms. Ireland will be attending. Mr. White stated that he planned to speak with Board members who are attending the meeting to ensure that the group attends a variety of workshops.

(7b) Board of Trustees Retreat

Mr. White reminded members of the Board of the Board Retreat which is scheduled for Wednesday, November 14, 2018, 8:30 a.m. – 2:00 p.m. in the Center for Business and Industry, located at 1751 Callowhill Street, in Room C2-5. The agenda and materials for the meeting will be forwarded in advance of the Retreat. Mr. White thanked members of the Board for their submissions of topics for the Retreat. He stated that he and Dr. Generals are scheduled to meet to discuss the agenda for the Retreat. Mr. White stated that a workshop on diversity and inclusion was to be part of the Retreat, but being that Ms. Fulmore-Townsend is unable to attend, the workshop will be held at a future meeting of the Board.

(8) Foundation Report

Mr. Murphy reported that in addition to the gifts and grants report included in the Board Packet, the College received a grant from the Department of Education for \$375,000 per year for five years for the Child Care Access Means Parents in College (CCAMPIS) grant. The grant provides money to pay for day-care for students who are custodial parents. Mr. Murphy thanked Drs. Hirsch and Curry for their work in securing the grant.

(9) Report of the President

Dr. Generals called attention to his memorandum in the Board folder outlining his activities September 7 through October 4, 2018.

(9a) Poverty Report

Dr. Generals discussed the recent poverty report. He stated that despite all efforts, Philadelphia's poverty numbers have not moved. Dr. Generals stated that we need to recommit ourselves to fighting poverty in the City. He stated that the Board is committed to this effort.

Dr. Generals reported that he had attended the Economy League of Greater Philadelphia's Leadership Exchange meeting in Seattle, and had the opportunity to observe the role of technology companies' impact on that city. Dr. Generals shared with the Board his observations on the economic impact of tech giants.

Mr. Epps stated that we need to escalate our voices to the Commonwealth regarding raising the State's minimum wage. He stated that Pennsylvania is the lowest in the region, and we need legislation to raise the level of the minimum wage. Mr. Epps stated that elections are coming up and we need to let our voices be heard.

There was a discussion about the College's role and potential next steps. A suggestion was made about offering a workshop to discuss what role the College can play in assisting the City in its poverty efforts.

(9b) On-Campus Events

Dr. Generals called attention to a list of campus events scheduled during the months of October and November.

(10) New Business

There was no new business discussed at the meeting.

(11) Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Board of Trustees is scheduled for Thursday, November 1, 2018 at 3:00 p.m. in the Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom.

The meeting adjourned at 4:10 p.m.

At this point, the Board reconvened in Executive Session.

(12) Executive Session

The Executive Session was devoted to a discussion of legal matters and labor negotiations.



COMMUNITY COLLEGE OF PHILADELPHIA  
Meeting of the Board of Trustees  
Thursday, October 4, 2018 – 3:00 p.m.  
MINUTES OF DECISIONS AND RESOLUTIONS

Present: Mr. White, presiding; Ms. Biemiller, Mr. Clancy, Mr. Epps, Ms. Fulmore-Townsend, Ms. Hernández Vélez, Mr. Herzog, Ms. Ireland, Ms. Jean-Baptiste, Mr. Martz, Ms. Posoff, Representative Roebuck, Mr. Soileau, Dr. Generals, Ms. de Fries, Ms. DiGregorio, Mr. Eapen, Dr. Gay, Dr. Hirsch, Mr. Murphy, Ms. Hurst, and Ms. Zellers

(1) Meeting Called to Order

Mr. White called the meeting to order.

(2) Public Comment

Mr. Junior Brainard, Assistant Professor of English and Secretary of the Federation, spoke regarding the status of collective bargaining negotiations. Mr. Brainard circulated copies of letters of support from several members of City Council as well as a copy of the Federation's vision for the College.

(3) Recognition of Service of Former Members of the Board

The Board recognized Ms. Mary Horstmann, Dr. Judith Rényi, and Judge Stella Tsai for their service and commitment as members of the Board of Trustees.

(4) Report of the Business Affairs Committee

The Committee met on September 26, 2018 and reviewed two items namely the Parking Garage Management Firm and High Speed Copiers which are part of the Consent Agenda for Board approval.

(4a) Resolution Approving Salary Increase for Vice Presidents and General Counsel

The Board approved and ratified the following Resolution:

WHEREAS, on June 20, 2018, the Business Affairs Committee and Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees approved a two percent (2%) salary increase for the

Community College of Philadelphia's Vice Presidents and General Counsel serving on the College's Cabinet to be effective July 1, 2018;

NOW THEREFORE, on this 4<sup>th</sup> day of October, 2018, the Board of Trustees hereby ratifies the decision of the Executive Committee approving a two percent (2%) salary increase for the Community College of Philadelphia's Vice Presidents and General Counsel serving on the College's Cabinet to be effective retroactively to July 1, 2018.

(5) Consent Agenda

The Board approved the following Consent Agenda:

- (a) Proceedings and Minutes of Decisions and Resolutions  
Meeting of September 6, 2018
- (b) Gifts and Grants
- (c) Interior Design and Architecture Programs
- (d) Parking Garage Management Firm
- (e) High Speed Copiers

(6) Report of the Audit Committee

The Committee met on September 28, 2018 and reviewed the financials and issues that may have occurred during business last year. Mr. Eapen stated that there were no issues and that the College had received a clean audit for 2017-2018.

The Board accepted the report of the Audit Committee.

(7) Report of the Chair

(7a) Association of Community College Trustees  
Leadership Congress, October 24-27, 2018  
Marriott Marquis Hotel, New York

Mr. White, Dr. General, Ms. Posoff, Mr. Clancy, and Ms. Ireland will be attending the Association of Community College Trustees (ACCT) Leadership Congress scheduled for October 24-27, 2018 at the Marriott Marquis Hotel in New York.

(7b) Board of Trustees Retreat

The Board Retreat is scheduled for Wednesday, November 14, 2018, 8:30 a.m. – 2:00 p.m. in the Center for Business and Industry, located at 1751 Callowhill Street, in Room C2-5. The agenda and materials for the meeting will be forwarded in advance of the Retreat.

(8) Foundation Report

The Board was informed that in addition to the gifts and grants report included in the Board Packet, the College received \$375,000 from the Department of Education for the Child Care Access Means Parents in College (CCAMPIS) grant.

(9) Report of the President

Dr. Generals called attention to his memorandum in the Board folder outlining his activities September 7 through October 4, 2018.

(9a) Poverty Report

The Board discussed the recent poverty report and the role the College can play in assisting the City in its poverty efforts.

(9b) On-Campus Events

Dr. Generals called attention to a list of campus events scheduled during the months of October and November.

(10) New Business

There was no new business discussed at the meeting.

(11) Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Board of Trustees is scheduled for Thursday, November 1, 2018 at 3:00 p.m. in the Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom.

The meeting adjourned at 4:10 p.m.

At this point, the Board reconvened in Executive Session.

(12) Executive Session

The Executive Session was devoted to a discussion of legal matters and labor negotiations.

Community College of Philadelphia  
Office of Institutional Advancement  
Record of Grants and Gifts  
November 2018 Meeting of the Board of Trustees

**GRANTS**

**Summary by Grant Type:**

		9/25/18 - 10/22/18	2019 FY Year-to-Date
<b>Government/Public Grants</b>			
	Federal	\$776,323	\$1,686,094
	State		\$2,335,276
	Local		
<b>Private Grants</b>			
	Corporation		
	Foundation	\$68,500	\$152,942
	Organization		\$17,500
<b>Other Grants</b>			
	<b>Grant Total</b>	<b>\$844,823</b>	<b>\$4,191,812</b>

**GIFTS**

**Summary by Gift Type:**

<b>Gifts to the Foundation (\$5,000+)</b>	<b>Amount</b>	<b>Purpose</b>
Wanamaker Institute of Industries	\$65,635	Restricted - Scholarships
Anonymous	\$10,000	Restricted - Scholarships
Private Donor	\$10,000	Restricted - Ceramics Dept
<b>Gifts In-Kind (estimated value \$200+)</b>		

**Community College of Philadelphia  
Office of Institutional Advancement  
Summary of Grants  
November 2018 Meeting of the Board of Trustees**

**Federal**

U.S. Department of Education has awarded \$375,000 to fund year one of four of *Child Care Access Means Parents in School* (CCAMPIS) from 10/1/18 through 9/30/19. The CCAMPIS program will enable the College to provide a minimum of 40 students per academic year with a maximum of \$833 per month in childcare stipends. Additionally, the grant will provide student-parents with assistance identifying an accredited childcare provider, as well as coordinating childcare arrangements throughout the academic year. Student-parents participating in the CCAMPIS program will also be offered student success workshops coordinated through the College's Women's Outreach and Advocacy Center, which serves both male and female students, as well as referrals to other support services on and off campus as needed.

U.S. Department of Education has awarded \$362,661 to fund year three of *Upward Bound* (a TRIO Program) from 9/1/18 through 8/31/19. The program provides 68 eligible secondary school students with the academic skills and motivation necessary for completion of secondary and postsecondary education. The College will partner with two persistently low achieving high schools in the School District of Philadelphia: Benjamin Franklin and South Philadelphia. This award includes one-time supplemental funding of \$40,000, which will enable the College's *Upward Bound* students to improve academic skills in mathematics and critical thinking by providing additional programming to support student mastery of key prerequisites to ensure success in STEM fields.

National Science Foundation has awarded \$38,662 to fund year three of *NNCI: Mid-Atlantic Nanotechnology Hub for Research, Education & Innovation* from 9/1/18 through 8/31/19. This grant is subcontracted by the University of Pennsylvania's Singh Center for Nanotechnology. The College is conducting a feasibility study to determine the need for and content of a nanotechnology technician program. Once a need is determined, the College will work with the Singh Center to develop and deliver this curriculum.

**Private**

The Lumina Foundation has awarded \$68,500 to fund the *Talent Hub* project from 9/1/17 through 12/31/20. The College will serve as one of four institutional partners to advance the goals of this project. Graduate! Philadelphia will lead the effort that builds on existing adult college completion programming for Comebackers (adults with some college, but no degree) and a partnership approach, with a targeted focus on low-income adults and veterans. Proposed activities focus on three major areas for expansion with the end goal of systemic changes in policies that are sustainable and can be scaled in order to support more Comebackers: reverse transfer, prior learning assessment and guided pathways.

**STUDENT OUTCOMES COMMITTEE OF THE  
BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

**MINUTES**

**Thursday, October 4, 2018**

**1:30 p.m.**

**Conference Room M2-34**

**Presiding:** Ms. Hernández Vélez

**Committee**

**Members:** Mr. Clancy, Ms. Fulmore-Townsend, Ms. Ireland, Ms. Jean-Baptiste, Ms. McPherson, Ms. Posoff, Rep. Roebuck

**College**

**Members:** Ms. de Fries, Dr. Gay, Dr. Generals, Dr. Hirsch, Dr. Roberts

**(1) Executive Session**

There were no agenda items for the Executive Session.

**(2) Public Session**

**(a) Approval of the Minutes of September 6, 2018**

The minutes were approved unanimously.

**(b) Academic Program Review Update: Computer Information Systems-  
Information Technology, Network and Systems Administration Proficiency  
Certificate, Computer Science, Computer Programming and Software  
Development Proficiency Certificate**

Due to an unexpected absence, the update and recommendation were postponed to the next meeting.

**(c) Committee Orientation**

Dr. Hirsch provided an overview of various College activities and initiatives to the Committee.

Academic Program Review Process: The Academic Program Review has gone through iterations over time based on Student Outcomes Committee members' input. The Student Outcomes Committee receives the Executive Summary; the full report

averages 20-30 pages. The report covers topics such as program analysis, program description, faculty, key performance indicators (such as headcount; full-time/part-time enrollment; demographics; five-year trend for retention, etc.; degrees awarded; and transfer at departure), learning outcomes and assessment, environmental scan, and resources. Dr. Gay explained that the report is a collaboration and results from conversations between the Assessment staff, program faculty, the dean, and the Academic and Student Success Council. A goal of the report is to give the Student Outcomes Committee the information they need to make decisions about the program. There is an abbreviated process for accredited programs, which builds on work they already do for accreditation.

**Student Demographics and Guided Pathways Areas of Focus:** Dr. Hirsch provided slides which summarized demographic data for the College's students. He highlighted the number of students enrolled at the College and the most popular programs. He noted that students have been getting younger since the recession peaked several years ago. The College disburses close to \$90 million annually in financial aid via grants and loans. The College has undertaken transformative work to move in a certain direction under the umbrella of Guided Pathways. For instance, academic programs are organized within the context of Academic Pathways and student services are more intentionally designed. Guided Pathways efforts also encompass "the Student Experience." Dr. Hirsch explained that the student experience begins before recruitment and runs through commencement and then through transfer and/or employment. The College's Guided Pathways work is comprised of four pillars: clarifying the path; helping students get on a path; helping students stay on their path; and ensuring students are learning. Dr. Hirsch highlighted several areas of work under each pillar. Clarifying the path encompasses work related to program maps; career and transfer outcomes; and aligning core coursework. To help students get on a path, the College has implemented first-year experience courses; redesigned the intake process; revamped its developmental education; and strengthened integrated supports. To help students stay on their path, the College has developed an intensive advising model and built systems to track students' progress and identify students at risk for possible interventions. Ensuring students are learning includes efforts related to assessment and faculty-led improvements of teaching practices. With these efforts, a goal is for students to have to tell their story only once. The communication tools that the College utilizes help support this goal.

**CCRC-AACC Pathways Project Momentum Data:** The Community College Resource Center is the premier research body for community colleges and is one of the partners in the Guided Pathways work. The focus of these data is credit momentum. CCRC has research that indicates that the more College credit that students earn early on, the more likely they are to succeed. The College has been making progress in increasing the number of students who are reaching key momentum points, such as earning 6+ or 12+ college credits in a student's first term; earning 24+ or 30+ college credits in a student's first year; completion of college-level math and English in the first year; persistence; and total college credits completed and earned. As pertains to completing college-level math and English in the first year, Rep. Roebuck said that remediation is

an important factor and that there needs to be a strong relationship between the College and the K-12 system in the city with more communication between the two. Dr. Generals noted that the College is actively addressing the K-16 pipeline, including dual enrollment, early college, pockets of faculty working with teachers to align programs, etc. These efforts are contributing to a shift in the paradigm. Regarding the increase in college-ready students as part of the momentum data, Dr. Generals noted that contributing factors include recalibrating placement exams and dual enrollment efforts.

Board Dashboard: Dr. Hirsch explained that the Dashboard was created over time based on critical indicators of success as identified by the Student Outcomes Committee. The Dashboard contains data related to enrollment and completion, among other areas. IPEDS data is used because it is a national benchmark. He highlighted some areas of focus, such as the three-year completion rate. This outcome has increased three points over the past year and the College expects continued improvements.

**(d) New Business**

There was no new business.

**Next Meeting**

The next meeting of the Student Outcomes Committee of the Board is scheduled for November 1, 2018 at 1:30 p.m. in Conference Room M2-34.

**Attachments:**

Minutes of September 6, 2018  
2018 Executive Summary Template APR  
Dashboard  
KPI Data for Pathways Project



**STUDENT OUTCOMES COMMITTEE OF THE  
BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

**MINUTES**

**Thursday, September 6, 2018  
1:30 p.m.  
Conference Room M2-34**

**Presiding:** Ms. Hernández Vélez

**Committee**

**Members:** Ms. Fulmore-Townsend, Rep. Roebuck

**College**

**Members:** Ms. de Fries, Dr. Gay, Dr. Generals, Dr. Hirsch, Dr. Roberts, Ms. Zellers

**Guests:** Mr. Bertram, Dr. Carter, Ms. Freeman, Ms. Frizell, Dr. Sweet

**(1) Executive Session**

There were no agenda items for the Executive Session.

**(2) Public Session**

**(a) Approval of the Minutes of June 7, 2018**

The minutes were approved unanimously.

**(b) Academic Program Reviews: Building Science, Architecture, Interior Design,  
Energy Conservation Academic Certificate**

Ms. Frizell provided a brief overview of the review. She described how the enrollments for the Architecture and Interior Design programs have increased and are expected to continue to increase. The programs have a thorough assessment plan under the current department head, with aligned assessments and data collection to apply to program improvement. Regarding increasing enrollments, Dr. Sweet explained that both are select programs and have been growing. Architecture is a well-respected program in the community and had its highest enrollments in Fall 2018. Both programs have strengthened articulation agreements with four-year institutions and have active advisory boards, with the goal of having students who are well-prepared to transfer. She added that enrollment growth may be due to fine tuning the coursework, a different direction under the current department head, and internal marketing that highlights career possibilities. The academic pathway also has a dedicated advisor assigned to it. Additionally, the programs will no longer require

that students pass a required introductory course before being able to enroll in the program. Removing this barrier should further increase enrollments.

Regarding the Building Science degree and the Energy Conservation Academic Certificate, Ms. Frizell noted that they are not performing as well. The coordinator position was vacant for a time and while the position was filled last year, it is vacant again. The programs have not been able to make progress on curricular edits, increasing industry connections, and strengthening marketing efforts. Per an action item in the reviews, the programs should examine their viability within the next academic year. Mr. Bertram explained that because enrollments are so small for these programs, increasing viability is the focus, as opposed to the make-up of the student population. Mr. Bertram also indicated that the programs would be interested in pursuing connections with high school programs, when possible.

**Action: The Student Outcomes Committee unanimously recommended that the Board of Trustees accept the program review with approval for five years for the Interior Design and Architecture programs. The Committee deferred action for the Building Science and Energy Conservation programs; the programs should submit a follow-up report addressing the review recommendations for the November 2018 meeting.**

**(c) Academic Program Review Update: Computer Information Systems-Information Technology, Network and Systems Administration Proficiency Certificate, Computer Science, Computer Programming and Software Development Proficiency Certificate**

Dr. Hirsch explained that when the academic program reviews were discussed at the last meeting, the Committee noted the lack of assessment materials submitted for the review and as such delayed action. Ms. Freeman gave an overview of the status of assessment in the programs. Many faculty have turned in course assessments, so that approximately fifty percent of outstanding reports were recently submitted and are being put into the department's Canvas repository. Any remaining reports should be submitted by the end of September. Ms. Freeman explained that because of the "state of things," she will do the program learning outcomes submission. Dr. Carter agreed that there has been an increase in submissions and is optimistic the assessments will be completed and that Ms. Freeman will complete the program learning outcomes assessments.

**Action: The Student Outcomes Committee unanimously recommended the program submit a detailed report on the status of the assessments for the October 2018 meeting. The report should also include an update on efforts to increase the number of female students.**

(d) **New Business**

There was no new business.

**Next Meeting**

The next meeting of the Student Outcomes Committee of the Board is scheduled for October 4, 2018 at 1:30 p.m. in Conference Room M2-34.

**Attachments:**

Minutes of June 7, 2018

Interior Design Program Review

Architecture Program Review

Building Science Program Review

Energy Conservation Certificate Program Review

## **Academic Program Review Format**

### Executive Summary

I. The Executive Summary portion of the report include a bullet-pointed *Key Indicators* and *Action Items* portion, prior to the narrative report. These include a formal template of language; which would be utilized on every *APR*.

A. Key Findings – findings that are aligned with action items.

**Enrollment and Demographics**

**Retention**

**Success/Graduation**

**Transfer**

**Assessment**

**Cost**

B. Action Items “The Office of Assessment and Evaluation makes the following recommendations for the Program.”

**Enrollment and Demographics**

**Retention**

**Graduation**

**Transfer**

**Assessment**

**Cost**

C. Narrative

A brief summary of key elements found in the report.

### Body of the Report

II. Program Analysis – this section is intended to allow faculty and program leadership to give a thoughtful view of the program with a goal of program improvement.

III. Program Description

A. Statement of Mission Alignment

B. Catalog Description

C. History and Revision to Curriculum

D. Curriculum Sequence

IV. Chart of Program Faculty

Name	Rank	Courses Taught

V. Key Performance Indicators - 5 Years of Program Data

A. Headcount

- B. Full-time/part-time enrollment
- C. Major/ New major
- D. Class Standing (dev, freshman, sophomore)
- E. Demographics (gender, race/ ethnicity, age)
- F. Outcomes data: five-year trend (standing, retention, success at departure, outcomes)
- G. Degrees awarded
- H. Transfer at departure

	<b>Did Not Transfer</b>	<b>Transferred</b>	<b>Grand Total</b>
<b>Total number of first-time enrolled students</b>			
<b>Earned 0-11 credits</b>			
<b>Earned 12-23 credits</b>			
<b>Earned 24-44 credits</b>			
<b>Earned 45 or more credits</b>			
<b>Graduated</b>			
<b>Total</b>			

- I. Section Operating Efficiency
  - J. Student Satisfaction Survey (optional\*\*)
- VI. Learning Outcomes and Assessment
- A. Curriculum Map
  - B. Assessment Cycle Plan
  - C. Course and Program Assessment Status (faculty contribution)
  - D. Supported-Program Assessment (overview of assessments conducted to support learning outcomes of shared curricular programs and/or General Education competencies.)
- VII. Environmental Scan
- A. Future Directions of the Program/Field (program contribution)
  - B. Expected Job Growth
  - C. Educational Attainment
  - D. Peer Educational Programs
  - E. Transfer Programs
- VIII. Special Expenditures and Resources (faculty contribution and cost data)

## Executive Summary

The Executive Summary portion of the report include a bullet-pointed *Key Indicators* and *Action Items* portion, prior to the narrative report. These include a formal template of language; which would be utilized on every *APR*.

### **A. Key Findings**

**For the period Fall 2013-Spring 2018:**

**Enrollment and Demographics**

**Retention**

**Success/Graduation**

**Transfer**

**Assessment**

**Cost**

### **B. Action Items**

The Office of Assessment and Evaluation makes the following recommendations for the Program.

**Enrollment and Demographics**

**Retention**

**Success/Graduation**

**Transfer**

**Assessment**

**Cost**

## II. Narrative

A brief summary of key elements found in the report.

# Community College *of* Philadelphia

## Dashboard

### 1.0 Student Success

Indicator of Success									
		2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	CCP Trend	Aspirational Cohort	CCP to Aspirational Cohort	5-Year Goal 2020
	<b>Increase Enrollment</b>								+3 to 5% pts
1.1	First-time Full-time (FTIC) Students (Fall Admission)	1,346	1,611	1,615	1,526	→			
1.2	First-time Part-time Students (Fall Admission)	2,940	2,744	2,442	2,174	↘			
1.3	Total Fall Credit Hours	158,471	160,972	152,326	147,244	↘			
	<b>Increase Persistence</b>	Fall 2014 to Fall 2015	Fall 2015 to Fall 2016	Fall 2016 to Fall 2017	Fall 2017 to Fall 2018				+5 to 7% pts
1.4	Fall to Fall New Full-time Students	53.5%	55.3%	58.5%	Data Available Nov. 2018	↗	61%	↗	
1.5	Fall to Fall New Part-time Students	40.8%	43.0%	42.7%	Data Available Nov. 2018	→	45%	↗	
1.6	Fall to Spring (All first-time) Students <sup>1</sup>	70.6%	72.0%	72.3%	Data Available Nov. 2018	→	Data Not Reported		

<sup>1</sup> All New Students (FTIC, Non-Degree Seeking, and Transfer)

# Community College *of* Philadelphia

		2011 Cohort 2014	2012 Cohort 2015	2013 Cohort 2016	2014 Cohort 2017	2015 Cohort 2018	CCP Trend	Aspirational Cohort	CCP to Aspirational Cohort	5-Year Goal 2020
	<b>Increase 3-Year CCP Completion</b>									+7 to 10% pts
1.7	3-Yr Cohort, Full-time, First-time College Associate Degree/Certificate Awards (IPEDS)	10%	12%	12%	13%	16%	↗	25%	↘	
1.8	New Full-time Students Who Left the College Prior to Earning a Degree and Transferred within 3 years (IPEDS)	27%	25%	24%	21%	Available Summer 2019	↘	17.1%	↗	
1.9	Total percentage of satisfactory student outcomes <sup>2</sup>	37%	37%	36%	34%	Available Summer 2019	→	42.1%	↘	

		FTIC Cohort 2008	FTIC Cohort 2009	FTIC Cohort 2010	FTIC Cohort 2011*	CCP Trend	Aspirational Cohort	CCP to Aspirational Cohort	5-Year Goal 2020
	<b>Increase 6-Year CCP Completion</b>								+7 to 10% pts
1.10	6-Yr Cohort, Full-time, First-time College Associate Degree/Certificate Awards (National Community College Benchmark Project)	20%	19%	22%	21%	→	Data Not Reported		
1.11	New Full-time Students Who Left the College Prior to Earning a Degree and Transferred within 6 years	32%	31%	32%	30%	→	Data Not Reported		
1.12	Total percentage of satisfactory student outcomes	52%	50%	54%	51%	→	Data Not Reported		









\*Projected data

		Grad Year 2015	Grad Year 2016	Grad Year 2017	Grad Year 2018	CCP Trend
	<b>Increase Completion</b>					
1.13	Unduplicated Number of Completers by Graduation Year	2,103	2,046	2,074	Data Available Nov. 2018	→

<sup>2</sup> Sum measures 1.7 + 1.8



# Community College *of* Philadelphia

		2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	CCP Trend	5-Year Goal 2020
	<b>Improve Success Rates of Students in Developmental English</b>						+7% pts
1.14	Placed Developmental English (Decrease annually)	54.9%	46.6% <sup>3</sup>	36.8% <sup>3</sup>	Data Available Nov. 2018		
1.15	First-Year Success in ENGL 098 (Increase annually)	63.8%	64.1%	63.6%	Data Available Nov. 2018		
1.16	Completed ENGL 101 within two years (Improve annually)	44.0%	40.9%	Data Available Dec. 2018	Data Available Dec. 2019		
	<b>Improve Success Rates of Students in Developmental Math</b>						+7% pts
1.17	Placed Developmental Math (Decrease annually)	46.4%	44.0%	51.5% <sup>3</sup>	Data Available Nov. 2018		
1.18	First-Year Success in Foundational Math 017 (Increase annually)	35%	41%	52%	Data Available Nov. 2018		
1.19	Completed FNMT 118 within two years (Improve annually)	17.0%	18.9%	Data Available Dec. 2018	Data Available Dec. 2019		
	<b>Improve Achievement Gap in First Year Success in Developmental English</b>						+5% pts
1.20	All First-time	63.8%	64.1%	63.6%	Data Available Nov. 2018		
1.21	Black	59.7%	58.6%	59.5%	Data Available Nov. 2018		
1.22	Hispanic	65.4%	64.9%	66.7%	Data Available Nov. 2018		
1.23	White	73.2%	77.1%	76.6%	Data Available Nov. 2018		

<sup>3</sup> Reflects changes in placement cut-off scores

# Community College *of* Philadelphia

	<b>Improve Career Preparation and Employment</b>	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	5-Year Goal 2020
1.24	Career Program Job Placement Rates <sup>4</sup>	85.2%	87.6%	84.9%	90%
1.25	Career Program Graduates' Wages and Wage Growth	\$43,123	\$41,253	\$43,173	Rate of Inflation
1.26	Licensure Exam Pass Rates				
	Clinical Laboratory Technology	100%	86%	100%	90%
	Dental Hygiene	100%	100%	100%	100%
	Diagnostic Medical Imaging	100%	100%	100%	100%
	Nursing	67.1%	83.2%	87.5%	90%
	Respiratory Care Technology	100%	100%	100%	100%

## 2.0 Facilities

<b>2.0</b>	<b>Facilities</b>	Updates	Target Completion	Progress	5-Year Goal 2020
	<b>Projects</b>				
2.1	Facilities Master Plan	Master Plan for Board Approval	October, 2017	100%	100%
2.2	The Hamilton	Construction Started	August/December 2018	50%	100%
2.3	Expansion of West Regional Center	Project Finalization	Summer 2018	25%	100%
2.4	Mint Steps Replacement	Completed	October/November 2017	100%	100%
2.5	Biology Lab Renovations	Work Progressing	Summer 2018	95%	100%
2.6	Library/Learning Commons	HDR Design Progressing	Spring/Summer 2018	25%	100%
2.7	Public Art	Footing/Installation of Artwork	Summer 2018	20%	100%

<sup>4</sup> For Indicators 1.24 and 1.25, data are obtained via graduate surveys conducted six months after graduation.

# Community College *of* Philadelphia

## 3.0 Finance

3.0	Finance	Quarterly Report September 2017 (In Millions)	Quarterly Report December 2017 (In Million)	Quarterly Report March 2018 (In Millions)	Quarterly Report June 2018 (In Millions)	
3.1	Operating Budget Status 2017-2018	\$29.5M	\$31.6M	\$33.8M	\$35.5M	
3.2	Operating Cash Position 2017-2018	\$18M	\$35M	\$40M	\$20M	
3.3	Long Term Cash Investments 2017-2018	\$22M	\$22M	\$22M	\$22M	
		FY 17-18	FY 18-19	FY 19-20	FY 20-21	FY 21-22
3.4	Stabilize % of Operating Revenues from Student Sources	57%	57%	57%	57%	57%
3.5	Stabilize Reserve Balance as % of Operating Budget	28%	28%	28%	28%	28%
3.6	Liquidity as % of Operating Budget	34%	34%	34%	34%	34%

## 4.0 Workforce Development

4.0	Workforce Development	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	5-Year Goal 2020
4.1	Annual Enrollments – Contract Training, Open Enrollment, Corporate College	2,904	3,031	3,298	+3-5% (3,093)
4.2	Revenue (after expenses)	\$1,166,266	\$1,306,304	\$1,614,183	+35%
4.3	Number of Unique Clients Served (WedNet, Contract Training, Corporate College)	43	50	31*	90

\* New Business Development Director Hired

Updated September 28, 2018

# Community College *of* Philadelphia

		2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	5-Year Goal 2020
4.4	10KSB # of Businesses Served Annually (Cohorts)*	83 (Cohorts 9, 10, 11)	64 (Cohort 12, 13, 14 Graduation)	91 (Cohort 15, 16, 17 Graduation)	90
4.5	10KSB Retention Rate	99% (Cohorts 1-10)	99% (Cohorts 1-13)	99% (Cohorts 1-16)	99%
4.6	10KSB % Scholars Who Increased Revenues at 6 months	72% (Cohorts 1-8)	71% (Cohorts 1-11)	Update Nov. 2018	+2% Nat'l Average
4.7	10KSB % Scholars who created Jobs at 6 months	52% (Cohorts 1-8)	53% (Cohorts 1-11)	Update Nov. 2018	+2% Nat'l Average
4.8	Career Connections Total Student Contacts	4,512	3,399	Update Nov. 2018	+20%
4.8a	Career Connections Number of Student Career Related Activities/Participants	82/1,349	168/2851	Update Nov. 2018	+20%
4.9	Career Connections Number of Employer Engagement Opportunities/Participants/Employers	2/354/75 Career Fairs Only	54/1,188/155	Update Nov. 2018	+20%
4.9a	Students Interviewed/Students Hired	Not Previously Tracked	Not Previously Tracked	Update Nov. 2018	+10%
4.10	Career Connections – Technology Tool Usage: Jobs/Internships Posted, Student Registrations, Big Interview and Virtual Job Shadow	Not Previously Tracked	Not Previously Tracked	Update Nov. 2018	+5%
4.11	Career Connections - Experiential Learning Opportunities Created	Not an existing activity	Not an existing activity	Update Nov. 2018	+5%

\*10KSB Grant Renewal through September 2018

## 5.0 Community Relationships

5.0	Community Relationships	2016-17	2017-18	5-Year Goal 2020
5.1	Number of College-community partnerships	30	43	50
5.2	Number of student volunteer hours	86	2,260	10,000
5.3	Monetary value of faculty/staff volunteer hours	\$1,120	\$59,717	\$500,000
5.4	Number of visitors for events open to the public	1,200	1,600	3,000

Updated September 28, 2018

**AACC Pathways Project**

**INSTITUTION:** Community College of Philadelphia



	Fall 2010:		Fall 2011:		Fall 2012:		Fall 2013:		Fall 2014:		Fall 2015:		Fall 2016:		Fall 2017:	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
<b>Total FTEIC Students in cohort*</b>	<b>4,066</b>	100%	<b>4,139</b>	100%	<b>4,105</b>	100%	<b>4,244</b>	100%	<b>4,289</b>	100%	<b>4,358</b>	100%	<b>4,058</b>	100%	<b>3,700</b>	100%
<b>Credit Momentum KPIs</b>																
Earned 6+ college credits in 1 <sup>st</sup> term	1240	30.5%	1236	29.9%	1209	29.5%	1194	28.1%	1157	27.0%	1,361	31.2%	1,609	39.7%	1,489	40.2%
Earned 12+ college credits in 1 <sup>st</sup> term	251	6.2%	258	6.2%	226	5.5%	238	5.6%	229	5.3%	349	8.0%	414	10.2%	402	10.9%
Earned 15+ college credits in year 1	967	23.8%	885	21.4%	872	21.2%	872	20.5%	867	20.2%	1,044	24.0%	1,095	27.0%	1,002	27.1%
Earned 24+ college credits in year 1	250	6.1%	220	5.3%	232	5.7%	186	4.4%	221	5.2%	299	6.9%	347	8.6%	329	8.9%
Earned 30+ college credits in year 1	72	1.8%	74	1.8%	52	1.3%	63	1.5%	68	1.6%	92	2.1%	84	2.1%	106	2.9%
Attempted 15+ credits (any level) in the first term**	102	2.5%	102	2.5%	110	2.7%	98	2.3%	111	2.6%	138	3.2%	152	3.7%	155	4.2%
Attempted 30+ credits (any level) in the first year**	268	6.6%	216	5.2%	215	5.2%	187	4.4%	196	4.6%	226	5.2%	236	5.8%	294	7.9%
<b>Gateway Math and English Completion KPIs</b>																
Completed college math in year 1	1064	26.2%	1115	26.9%	1156	28.2%	1212	28.6%	1145	26.7%	1,344	30.8%	1,005	24.8%	929	25.1%
Completed college english in year 1	1363	33.5%	1379	33.3%	1329	32.4%	1470	34.6%	1572	36.7%	1,716	39.4%	1,776	43.8%	1,708	46.2%
Completed both college math and English in year 1	649	16.0%	675	16.3%	643	15.7%	737	17.4%	733	17.1%	893	20.5%	693	17.1%	712	19.2%
<b>Persistence KPI</b>																
Persisted from term 1 to term 2	3,024	74.4%	2,977	71.9%	2,994	72.9%	3,031	71.4%	3,089	72.0%	3,197	73.4%	2,989	73.7%	2,710	73.2%
<b>College Course Completion KPIs</b>																
Total College Credits Completed	33024	70.4%	32172	70.9%	31809	71.5%	31343	71.4%	31367	70.4%	35320	70.8%	35915	73.6%	33222	72.3%
Total College Credits Attempted	46929		45365		44507		43891		44550		49901		48767		45922	

\*First-time Ever in College (FTEIC): A student who enrolls for the first time in college during the given fall term with no previous college level experience or credential.

\*\*These KPIs were not included in the previous request for the fall 2010-2015 cohorts.

**Student Demographics**

	Fall 2010:		Fall 2011:		Fall 2012:		Fall 2013:		Fall 2014:		Fall 2015:		Fall 2016:		Fall 2017:	
	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%	N	%
<b>Total FTEIC Students in cohort</b>	<b>4,066</b>	100%	<b>4,139</b>	100%	<b>4,105</b>	100%	<b>4,244</b>	100%	<b>4,289</b>	100%	<b>4,358</b>	100%	<b>4,058</b>	100%	<b>3,700</b>	100%
Placement unknown	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%
College-ready	928	22.8%	935	22.6%	982	23.9%	1018	24.0%	1017	23.7%	1260	28.9%	1165	28.7%	1005	27.2%
Referred to dev ed in 1 subject	908	22.3%	1020	24.6%	1078	26.3%	1111	26.2%	1113	26.0%	1150	26.4%	1313	32.4%	1033	27.9%
Referred to dev ed in 2 subjects	1147	28.2%	1318	31.8%	1263	30.8%	1298	30.6%	1225	28.6%	1034	23.7%	711	17.5%	924	25.0%
Referred to dev ed in 3 subjects	1083	26.6%	866	20.9%	782	19.0%	817	19.3%	935	21.8%	914	21.0%	869	21.4%	748	20.2%
Females	2365	58.2%	2383	57.6%	2297	56.0%	2382	56.1%	2433	56.7%	2440	56.0%	2254	55.5%	2112	57.1%
Traditional college age	2110	51.9%	2031	49.1%	1989	48.5%	2085	49.1%	2090	48.7%	2376	54.5%	2262	55.7%	1913	51.7%
Full-time	1782	43.8%	1486	35.9%	1413	34.4%	1358	32.0%	1347	31.4%	1617	37.1%	1616	39.8%	1526	41.2%

**COMBINED MEETING OF THE BUSINESS AFFAIRS AND  
EXECUTIVE COMMITTEES OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

**Community College of Philadelphia  
Tuesday, October 16, 2018 - 2:00 P.M.  
Teleconference**

**DIAL-IN NUMBER: 1-888-675-6779; PARTICIPANT PASSCODE: 2050590#**

**AGENDA - PUBLIC SESSION**

Teleconference

Trustees: Ms. Suzanne Biemiller, Mr. Harold Epps, Ms. Chekemma Fulmore-Townsend, Mr. Steve Herzog, Honorable James Roebuck, Mr. Michael Soileau and Mr. Jeremiah J. White, Jr.

Administrative

Staff: Donald Generals, Ed.D., Mr. Jacob Eapen, Judith Gay, Ph.D., Mr. James P. Spiewak and Victoria Zellers, Esq.

**AGENDA – PUBLIC SESSION**

**Tierney Proposal – Marketing and Communications Consulting Services (Action Item):**

Discussion: Dr. Generals stated that with the existing vacancy of the VP of Marketing & Communications over the past several months, and the likelihood that the position will not be filled until a new search is conducted, there is a need to have a strategic review, recommendations, and ongoing support in the Marketing and Communications department. Mr. Eapen noted that in late September 2018, the College issued an RFP for marketing and communications consulting services to help the College maximize its strategic initiatives, marketing and communications efforts, public relations, and to increase enrollment and revenues. Thirteen firms were invited to participate in the RFP, four firms indicated an intent to bid and submitted questions, but the only response was received by Tierney & Partners, Inc. (dba Tierney Communications) hereinafter (“Tierney”). Tierney submitted a proposal that meets the needs of the College at a not to exceed cost of \$176,000. Dr. Generals explained that it is important to move forward with these efforts to positively affect Spring 2019 enrollments.

Dr. Generals explained that Mr. Timothy Spreitzer, Executive Vice President, of Tierney will be involved in supporting the efforts of the Tierney team. Dr. Generals further disclosed that although Mr. Spreitzer is a member of the Community College of Philadelphia Foundation Board, he is not a member of the College’s Board of Trustees and that he did not have and will not have any involvement in the decision-making regarding the award of this contract.

Mr. Soileau and Ms. Fulmore-Townsend expressed their opinions that Mr. Spreitzer should not be the project lead for the Tierney Team. Ms. Biemiller expressed concern regarding Mr. Spreitzer’s involvement in the project, the RFP timeline, and the need for the

Consulting services at this time.

In response to Board members' questions and concerns, Dr. Generals and Dr. Gay stated that the benefits of this engagement include creating a more strategic direction for the department's staff, offering creative initiatives, creating a more comprehensive social media strategy, assisting with efforts to make the College's website more productive, and offering public relations support related to various issues affecting the College. Dr. Generals noted that the Tierney team of four professionals will report to Dr. Gay and himself. The Marketing and Communications staff will continue to report to Dr. Gay and the Tierney team will not be providing direct supervision to staff. Ms. Zellers noted that the College followed the Foundation's conflict of interest policy by issuing a competitive RFP, disclosing Mr. Spreitzer's position on the Foundation Board and position with Tierney, and that Mr. Spreitzer was not and will not be involved in selecting, approving, or voting on the award of the contract. Dr. Generals also noted that, the services being conducted by Tierney are an interim short-term solution and will enable the College to review trends, best practices, opportunities, organizational structure, vendor relationships, and identify and help prioritize actions. Dr. Gay explained the need for high-level marketing expertise and strategic guidance. Mr. Eapen answered questions regarding the RFP process that took place as highlighted above.

To address the concerns raised, the staff recommended that the Business Affairs and Executive Committees of the Board of Trustees award the contract for Marketing and Consulting Services to Tierney & Partners, Inc. for an amount not to exceed \$176,000 and with the day-to-day Project Lead/Manager from Tierney to be a senior staff member from Tierney other than Mr. Spreitzer.

Action: On behalf of the Business Affairs Committee, Mr. Soileau moved and Mr. Epps seconded the motion that the Business Affairs Committee recommend that the award of the Marketing and Communications Consulting Services to Tierney & Partners, Inc. for an amount not to exceed \$176,000 with the qualification that Tierney appoint a senior staff member, other than Mr. Spreitzer, to be the day-to-day Project Lead/Manager for the contract. Mr. Herzog and Mr. White voted in favor of the motion and Ms. Biemiller opposed.

Action: On behalf of the Executive Committee, Jeremiah White moved the recommendation of the Business Affairs Committee and Chekemma Fulmore-Townsend seconded the motion that the Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees approve the awarding of the Marketing and Communications Consulting Services contract to Tierney & Partners, Inc. for an amount not to exceed \$176,000 with the qualification that Tierney appoint a senior staff member, other than Mr. Spreitzer, to be the day-to-day Project Lead/Manager for the Contract. The Honorable Mr. Roebuck voted in favor of the motion and Ms. Biemiller opposed.

**MEETING OF THE BUSINESS AFFAIRS COMMITTEE  
OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES  
Community College of Philadelphia  
Wednesday, October 24, 2018 – 10:00 A.M.**

Present: Ms. Suzanne Biemiller (presiding *via* Zoom); Mr. Steve Herzog (*via* Zoom), Mr. Joseph Martz (*via* Zoom), Dr. Donald Generals, Mr. Jacob Eapen, Dr. Samuel Hirsch, Mr. Randolph Merced, Jessica Hurst, Esq., Victoria Zellers, Esq., Mr. Gim Lim (*via* Zoom) and Mr. James P. Spiewak (*via* Zoom)

**AGENDA**

**EXECUTIVE SESSION**

**PUBLIC SESSION**

**(1) Expressive Demonstration: Time, Place and Manner Policy (Action Item):**

Discussion: Ms. Biemiller opened the meeting and thanked those in attendance to voice their positions regarding the Expressive Demonstration: Time, Place and Manner Policy. She referred to the Agenda for the meeting which noted that in the interest of public safety for the College community, and in accordance with Dr. Generals' duties as President of the College, Article XXI of the Full-Time Collective Bargaining Agreement, and the Public Employee Relations Act ("Act 195"), it is the intent of the President to implement the attached Expressive Demonstration: Time, Place, and Manner Policy. Please refer to Attachment A. As noted on the Agenda, the Business Affairs Standing Committee voted against recommending the policy and the Institution Wide Committee (IWC) voted not to deliberate on the policy. Representatives of the Business Affairs Standing Committee and the IWC were asked to place any arguments in writing to the Board of Trustees Business Affairs Committee and have their representatives argue their positions at the October 24<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Business Affairs Committee of the Board of Trustees.

Ms. Biemiller noted that a student speaker needed to attend class and invited him to speak first.

Mr. Liam Knight, Vice President of Phi Theta Kappa and a student delegate to the Business Affairs Standing Committee expressed his arguments. He argued that the policy is incorrect for the College and that the process in Article XXI of the Full-Time Faculty Collective Bargaining Agreement was not followed. He also expressed concern with whether the policy violated First Amendment rights given that the College is a public institution. He noted that the policy would not prevent hate speech on campus. He requested that the College form a committee of students, faculty and administrators to draft a new policy.

Ms. Biemiller thanked Mr. Knight for his comments.

Mr. James P. Spiewak, Associate Vice President, Budgets and Business Services, a current member of the Business Affairs Standing Committee, former Co-Chair of the Business



Affairs Standing Committee, and an Alternate on the IWC presented an argument on behalf of the Administrators on the Business Affairs Standing Committee and the IWC in support of implementing the policy. Please refer to Mr. Spiewak's memorandum dated October 19, 2018 found in Attachment B which he read to the Committee. Mr. Spiewak concluded his remarks recommending that the Board of Trustees Business Affairs Committee vote to implement the proposed policy (attached to the Board Business Affairs' Committee Agenda) effective immediately upon ratification of the full Board with guidance that the applicable Standing Committees may recommend any further changes as outlined in the applicable Collective Bargaining Agreement.

Ms. Bridget McFadden, a delegate to IWC and previous Co-Chair of IWC, thanked the Trustees for allowing the faculty and students to express their concerns regarding the policy. She stated that the Middle States Commission on Higher Education requires that each institution has a clearly developed governance structure which they consistently follow. She argued that, in order to meet the College's accreditation guidelines, it is essential that the governance process is followed correctly. She further emphasized that the student representatives were not included in Dr. General's original memorandum of October 8<sup>th</sup>. Please refer to Attachment C. She further noted that students were sent the memo and invited to the October 24<sup>th</sup> Business Affairs Committee on Monday, October 22<sup>nd</sup>, only allowing them to have two days' notice to prepare their remarks.

Ms. Margaret Stephens, a faculty delegate and Co-Chair on the Business Affairs Standing Committee thanked the Trustees for their dedication to our students. She pointed out flaws with the policy such as:

- It does not prevent or solve the problems that have occurred on campus in the past year or prevent or solve even more dangerous acts of violence that occurred elsewhere in the United States.
- The proposed policy is too expansive, too broad. The existing policy could be used to hamper or suppress legitimate, peaceful protests and demonstrations by students, staff and other groups.

She also raised concerns about the College not following the process outlined in Article XXI of the Collective Bargaining Agreement. Ms. McFadden's and Ms. Stephens' joint comments are included in Attachment D.

The last speaker, Mr. Randolph Merced, Director of Public Safety, expressed concern regarding disruptive activities that took place across the United States at Auburn University, Middlebury College, and the University of California, Berkeley. He stated that one faction accuses the other of attempting to silence speech, while the other faction in turn accuses its counterpart of hiding behind First Amendment protections to promote speech that each believe disparages the other and promotes hate and violence. He highlighted that caught in the middle are colleges and universities grappling with how to promote diversity of thoughts and the exchange of ideas without events developing into violent protests. The events that took place in Charlottesville, VA resulted in a death. An internal University of Virginia working group faulted the University for being "ill-prepared."

Mr. Merced pointed out that preparing for campus demonstrations and protests should involve four key focus areas: Education, Coordination, Communication and Policy. The capability to manage demonstrations and protests on campus must begin with the establishment of clear policies that support the college's commitment to the free expression of ideas and facilitate an environment in which civil discourse can take place lawfully and safely. The policy addresses the time, place and manner in which protests, rallies or equivalent activities occur on campus or in campus facilities. Policies must emphasize that demonstrations may take place in support or opposition to any issue, provided the demonstration does not endanger the safety or security of the College community, infringe upon the rights of others, or disrupt normal College operations. Considerations for approving a demonstration should also be clearly stated so that the campus community understands the safety and security factors that are considered when approving a speaker or demonstration. Mr. Merced requested that the Business Affairs Committee implement the policy.

Ms. Biemiller again thanked everyone for their remarks regarding the Expressive Demonstration: Time, Place and Manner Policy and asked for a motion from the Committee.

Action: Mr. Martz moved and Mr. Herzog seconded the motion that the Committee recommend to the full Board the approval of the Expressive Demonstration: Time, Place and Manner Policy appended in Attachment A.

Ms. Biemiller asked to amend the Action. Ms. Biemiller expressed that as a Trustee of the College, she has an obligation to balance public safety with policies of free speech. She emphasized that it is important to keep a policy in place. She asked for an amended motion that the Expressive Demonstration: Time, Place and Manner Policy, (Attachment A), be implemented upon ratification of the full Board with guidance that the applicable Standing Committee may recommend any further changes to the policy as outlined in Article XXI of the Full-Time Faculty Collective Bargaining Agreement. Ms. Biemiller also directed the College Administration to appoint an administrator to the subcommittee of the Business Affairs Standing Committee that will consider recommendations for changes to the policy.

Amended Action: Mr. Martz moved the amended motion as stated by Ms. Biemiller and Mr. Herzog seconded the motion that the Committee recommend the implementation, upon the full Board's ratification, of the Expressive Demonstration: Time, Place and Manner Policy (Attachment A), with guidance that the applicable Standing Committee may recommend any further changes to the policy as outlined in Article XXI of the Full-Time Faculty Collective Bargaining Agreement. The motion passed unanimously.

**(2) Ellucian Constituent Relationship Management (CRM) Recruit Product Procurement (Action Item):**

Discussion: Mr. Eapen stated that the College's Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) system is Ellucian. ERP includes the College's Student, Human Resources/Payroll, and Finance systems. In an effort to improve the intake process for all students applying to the College, staff is asking for the Committee's approval to purchase the New Ellucian CRM Recruit and Analytics products.

Dr. Hirsch mentioned that five years ago, the College acquired CRM. It served the College well until recently when its features were not compatible in today's environment. He stated that the Ellucian (CRM) Recruit product will be a cloud-based solution that will provide a strong and interactive interface for students being recruited and applying to the College. It will also allow for tracking of these students through the Ellucian Analytics tool. Not only will the CRM tool bring a new look and feel to the student application, but it will expedite the student application process.

The Hobsons' product that is currently being used will be replaced by the CRM Recruit product giving it a personalized look and feel. The College will not use the Hobsons' product starting in July 2019 resulting in an annual savings of \$45,875. This personalized web presence should be attractive to today's student and will allow the College to target content to these prospects.

The first year will be a pro-rated cost since the first full year of cloud-hosted service will be July 1, 2019 through June 30, 2020. The annual subscription fee for both products combined will be \$59,700 in FY20. Implementation costs will be a one-time fee not to exceed \$94,636.

The staff is requesting that the Committee recommend to the full Board the purchase of the New Ellucian CRM Recruit and Analytics products for an annual cost of \$59,700 and a one-time cost of \$94,636.

Action: Mr. Martz moved and Mr. Herzog seconded the motion that the Committee recommend to the full Board the purchase of the New Ellucian CRM Recruit and Analytics products for an annual cost of \$59,700 and a one-time cost of \$94,636. The motion passed unanimously

### **(3) Quad Learning (Information Item)**

Ms. Zellers reported to the Committee that College staff was informed that Wellspring International Education, LLC ("Wellspring") will be acquiring Quad Learning, Inc. (QL) through an Asset Purchase Agreement. QL markets and recruits international students for the College. She stated that there are currently 67 international students who were recruited by QL. The anticipated closing date is October 31, 2018. In accordance with the College's Agreement with QL, which was entered on December 1, 2015, QL is requesting that the College consent to assignment of the College's Agreement with QL to Wellspring. The College has reserved its right to respond under Section 9.A. of the Agreement until it has more information regarding WellSpring. The College is obtaining references for WellSpring.

### **(4) Next Meeting Date:**

The next regularly scheduled meeting of the Committee will be held on Wednesday, November 28, 2018 at 10:00 A.M. in the Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom, M2-1.

The meeting adjourned at 11:15 A.M.

## **ATTACHMENT A**

### **Expressive Demonstration: Time, Place and Manner Policy**

## **Expressive Demonstration: Time, Place, and Manner Policy**

Community College of Philadelphia recognizes that institutions of higher education are marketplaces of ideas. The College upholds the rights of freedom of assembly, expression, and speech as essential to this exchange of ideas. The College also recognizes that an individual's right to freedom of assembly, expression, and speech must be harmonized with the right of the College community to engage in College activities without disruption. In order to balance the rights of assembly, expression and speech with the rights of pursuing College activities without disruption, the College has implemented this content- and viewpoint-neutral time, place, and manner policy to govern demonstrations on College premises.

### **Scope of Policy**

This policy applies to all members of the College community, including employees, faculty, students, trustees, and College-recognized organizations, as well as guests and visitors to the College. This policy also applies to all College premises, including the Main Campus and all Regional Centers. This policy applies to demonstrations as defined below, but not to commercial speech or activity which is governed by the College's Solicitation in Campus Facilities Policy. This policy also does not address the distribution or posting of literature or other materials on College premises, which are governed by the College's Solicitation in Campus Facilities Policy and the College's Posting in College Facilities Policy, respectively.

See Related Policies:     Policy # 153 – *Policy Governing Use of College Facilities*  
                                  Policy # 158 - *Solicitation in Campus Facilities*  
                                  Policy # 159 - *Posting in College Facilities*  
                                  Policy # 161 – *Statement of Acceptable Behavior for College Guests and Visitors*

### **Responsible Offices**

The Office of the Dean of Students, Department of Public Safety, and Office of Marketing and Government Relations are responsible for the implementation of this policy.

### **Relevant Definitions**

**Demonstration:** the presence or gathering of a group of people with the primary purpose of expressive activity or the communication or expression of views or grievances in a manner that attracts attention (*e.g.*, protests, rallies, sit-ins, vigils, or similar forms of expression).

### **Time, Place, and Manner Limits**

#### ***Time***

- a) No demonstration may exceed four (4) hours in length in a 24-hour day.
- b) Demonstrations are not permitted outside of the College's normal operational hours unless authorized by the appropriate office (see **Procedures** section below).

**Place**

- a) *Outdoor Demonstrations*
  - i. Demonstrations will be permitted on College premises generally open to the public (public areas), which include public outdoor spaces in accordance with the guidelines below. Public areas do not include indoor spaces at the College.
  
- b) *Indoor Demonstrations*
  - i. Generally, indoor College spaces are not appropriate for demonstrations. However, indoor demonstrations will be permitted if they:
    - (1) involve members of the College community with valid College ID's, not guests or visitors;
    - (2) do not interfere with the operations of the indoor space or otherwise disrupt any College activity or business;
    - (3) do not block hallways, entranceways, doors, or any other path of ingress and egress;
    - (4) do not prevent others from pursuing College business or activities;
    - (5) do not involve sound amplification devices or equipment;
    - (6) do not extend beyond the business hours of the indoor space; and
    - (7) otherwise comply with this policy and all other College policies.
  
- c) Demonstrations are prohibited in the following areas:
  - i. in classrooms or near classrooms;
  - ii. in hallways adjacent to classrooms;
  - iii. in learning commons, library areas, learning labs, laboratories, or other designated quiet areas or instructional spaces; and
  - iv. within 25 feet of any entrance or exit point of a College building.
  
- d) A demonstration on the College's Main Campus should generally take place in the Freedom Circle/Winnet Courtyard area between 17<sup>th</sup> and 18<sup>th</sup> Streets if:
  - i. the demonstration is by visitors or guests to the College; or
  - ii. space for the demonstration was not reserved in advance in accordance with this policy.
  
- e) Individuals must also abide by the College's room/facility reservation policies, as applicable.

**Manner**

- a) All participants in a demonstration must comply with the reasonable, lawful instructions of College officials or other authorities and all other College policies.
- b) College premises must be left in the original condition at the conclusion of the demonstration. The College reserves the right to impose reasonable charges to enforce this requirement.
- c) Demonstrations on College premises:
  - i. May not infringe upon the legal rights of the College community or other individuals.
  - ii. May not prevent or disrupt other College activities or business.
  - iii. May not prevent or disrupt College ceremonies or events.
  - iv. May not prevent or interfere with ingress to or egress from any College facility.

- v. May not prevent or interfere with any individual's ability to pursue College activities or business.
- vi. May not impede the flow of pedestrian or vehicular traffic.
- vii. May not jeopardize the safety or security of any member of the College community or any other individual, including attempting to coerce or intimidate a person with the intent to cause that person to fear for his or her safety.
- viii. May not attract a crowd larger than the demonstration location can safely contain.
- ix. May not engage in or threaten physical harm or violence or destruction of property.
- x. May not consist of obscene or defamatory language, true threats, or fighting words; or otherwise contain expression not entitled to constitutional protection.
- xi. May not be conducted in a manner that violates federal, state, or local law or applicable fire and safety regulations.
- xii. May not be conducted in a manner that is likely to incite imminent lawless action.
- xiii. May not be conducted in a manner that violates rules, regulations, and/or policies of the College.
- xiv. May not involve firearms, explosives, knives, sticks, dangerous chemicals, weapons or other objects or devices that may be used as weapons.
- xv. May not involve camping on College premises, whether overnight or otherwise.
- xvi. May not involve the use of sound amplification devices or equipment unless previously indicated in a reservation, and then only for outdoor demonstrations to the extent such use does not disrupt other College activities or businesses.
- xvii. May not involve the erection of temporary, permanent or semi-permanent structures unless approved in advance by the Director of Public Safety and the Director of Facilities.
- xviii. May not involve the use of booths or tables unless approved in advance.

### **Procedures**

Any individual, group, or organization may reserve an outdoor demonstration area of the College for a demonstration by directing the reservation request to:

Director, Department of Public Safety  
[publicsafety@ccp.edu](mailto:publicsafety@ccp.edu)  
(215) 751-8111

Reservation requests should provide the name of the organization or contact person; phone number and email; the date, time, and location requested; the general nature of use; the expected attendance; and specify whether any equipment (*i.e.*, sound amplification, tables, booths, other structures) will be used.

Reservations are required at least two (2) business days in advance for:

- a) Demonstrations organized by visitors or guests to the College; or
- b) College-community organized demonstrations where the expected attendance for the demonstration is 25 or more individuals unless such demonstration is prompted by news or affairs coming into public knowledge less than forty-eight (48) hours prior to such event. In order to continue, immediate notice of any such spontaneous demonstration must be provided to the Department of Public Safety using the contact information above.

In all other cases, reservations are encouraged but not required. Demonstrations will be permitted without a reservation if they do not conflict with any other College-sponsored event or other previously-made reservation, and if the demonstration is in all other respects compliant with this policy.

Reservations will generally be granted on a first-come, first-served basis provided the request complies with this policy, although priority will be given to College community-sponsored events. In the event of a conflict, a reasonably comparable space will be offered to the extent available. The requestor will be notified in writing whether the request has been approved. Requests will only be denied due to scheduling conflicts or if the proposed demonstration violates this policy. Before issuing a denial, the College may suggest any remedies that may bring a proposed demonstration into compliance with this policy. A denied request may be appealed to the College's President or his designee, whose decision will be final.

Any individual, group or organization intending to conduct a demonstration is strongly encouraged to coordinate with the Department of Public Safety so that appropriate arrangements can be made.

#### **Objections to Demonstrations**

The College recognizes that members of the College community have the right to disagree with any demonstration which occurs at the College. However, individuals who disagree with the sentiments expressed in a demonstration also bear the responsibility of recognizing the rights of the demonstrators to free speech, expression, and assembly. An individual, organization or group who wishes to protest a demonstration will be subject to the same standards as the demonstrators, including the obligation to act lawfully and in compliance with College policies.



**ATTACHMENT B**

**Support for the Expressive Demonstration:  
Time, Place and Manner Policy**

**James P. Spiewak**

To: Business Affairs Committee of the Board of Trustees  
From: Jim Spiewak, Associate Vice President, Budgets and Business Services; Former Co-Chair of the Business Affairs Standing Committee and Alternate on IWC on behalf of the Administrators on the Business Affairs Committee and IWC  
Date: October 19, 2018  
Re: Support for the Expressive Demonstration: Time, Place and Matter Policy

---

The Business Affairs Standing Committee discussed the merits of the Expressive Demonstration: Time, Place and Manner Policy (TPM) at four meetings: October 2017, March 2018, April 2018 and October 2018.

In October, 2017 the Committee was addressed by Victoria Zellers, the College's General Counsel, concerning the need for the College to establish a policy which would detail the rules on where, when and in what manner expressive demonstration activities may take place at our Main Campus and Regional Centers. Ms. Zellers discussed the recent violent protests that occurred at the University of Virginia and throughout Charlottesville, Virginia in August 2017. She explained the purpose of such policies and various legal requirements. Ms. Zellers explained that a College policy would apply to students and employees as well as outside individuals and groups. She noted that the College also had concerns about not having rules in place to guide demonstrators from various outside groups that had been on campus over the last two years. She explained that a policy would be drafted and presented to the Committee for recommendation.

A proposed policy was brought before the Business Affairs Standing Committee in March, 2018 and presented by Randy Merced, the College's Director, Public Safety. Mr. Merced explained that he worked on the policy with the College's Assistant General Counsel, the then Interim Dean of Students, the Director, Communications, and others in the College community. They reviewed similar policies at other public colleges and universities as well as sample policies supported by First Amendment rights advocates. Mr. Merced provided background information on the rationale for the policy and the objectives of the policy – to protect free speech, ensure a safe environment, ensure the continuity of College operations and activities, and protect students and employees from engaging in behaviors that could result in harm to them or the demonstrators. A considerable amount of discussion took place concerning the policy. Comments made by some members of the Committee indicated that they were concerned about students' and staff's ability to conduct demonstrations inside of the College. They were also concerned that certain terms in the policy, such as "fear,"

“disruptive,” and “interfere” were too subjective. Some members did not see the need for a policy stating that other “creative things” could be done to control the environment. Student guests mentioned that, as students, they shouldn’t be subjected to the same guidelines as outside groups. The Committee agreed to request changes to some aspects of the policy that concerned certain members. Two topics that were addressed concerned the ability for employees or students to conduct “sit-ins” near administrative offices and the proposed acceptable distance from entrance-ways for expressive demonstration activities to take place.

At the April 2018 meeting, a revised policy was presented by Randy Merced which addressed some of the concerns raised by members of the Business Affairs Standing Committee. The revised policy reduced the distance from entrances at which expressive demonstration activities may occur from 35 feet to 25 feet and removed language that did not allow for demonstrations by employees/students near administrative offices. The revised policy was discussed intensely and ultimately a vote was taken. It is the opinion of the administrators on the Committee that the minutes do not reflect the Motion that was made. This is supported by conversations had after the April 2018 meeting that state “the Committee agrees on the need for a policy ....” As an aside, the administrators of the Committee agree that the method of “approving” the April, 2018 minutes was improper and not agreed to by one of the Co-Chairs of the Committee. In sum, the Business Affairs Committee voted against recommending the policy.

As co-chair of the Business Affairs Standing Committee, I provided a report to one of the Co-Chairs of the IWC regarding the Business Affairs Standing Committee’s actions related to the TPM policy for deliberation and recommendation in accordance with the Full-Time Faculty Collective Bargaining Agreement. Members of the IWC twice voted to remove consideration of the policy from the IWC’s agenda thereby preventing further deliberations or recommendations by the IWC. After two unsuccessful attempts to allow the IWC to consider the policy, with the second attempt at the IWC’s September, 2018 meeting, the President was informed of the IWC’s and Business Affairs Committee’s actions on the TPM policy.

At the October, 2018 meeting of the Business Affairs Standing Committee, the “Board of Trustee Meeting on the TPM policy” was placed on the agenda which led to discussion concerning the policy proposed in April, 2018. Among the motions made were one that stated:

“Accept the TPM policy that President General proposes implementing until such time that the recommendations of the Business Affairs Standing Committee are made and considered through the existing governance structure.” The vote for this motion was 6 against; 5 for; 1 abstention.

The administrators on the Business Affairs Standing Committee and IWC are in favor of implementing the proposed Expressive Demonstration: Time, Place, and Manner Policy in its current form for the following reasons:

- To protect freedom of assembly, expression and speech;
- To provide a safe environment for the College community;
- To prevent disruption to College activities and operations;
- To protect students and staff as well as demonstrators;
- To provide the framework under which staff, specifically Public Safety, will interact with individuals involved in expressive demonstration activities;
- To provide legal protection to the College; and
- To enable the College to seek injunctive or other legal relief as needed to ensure the safety of the College community and continuous operations.

Additionally, the administrators believe the objections by the other committee members do not fairly consider the overall potential liability to the College of not having a policy. The administrators also believe the two revisions in April 2018 addressed the two major objections to the policy.

The administrators on the Business Affairs Standing Committee and IWC recommend that the Board of Trustees Business Affairs Committee vote to implement the proposed policy (attached to the Board Business Affairs' Committee Agenda) effective immediately upon ratification of the full Board with guidance that the applicable Standing Committees may recommend any further changes as outlined in the applicable Collective Bargaining Agreement.

**ATTACHMENT C**

**Memorandum from Dr. Generals  
Dated October 8, 2018**

**Community  
College  
of Philadelphia**

1700 Spring Garden Street  
Philadelphia, PA 19130-3991  
215.751.8000 [www.ccp.edu](http://www.ccp.edu)



*Office of the President*

**TO:** Carol de Fries  
Jacob Eapen  
Judith Gay  
Samuel Hirsch  
Jody Bauer  
Simon Brown  
Mary Anne Celenza  
Jim Spiewak  
Gary Bixby  
Charletha Porter  
Carol Whitney  
Lisa Hutcherson  
Gim Lim  
Elizabeth Majewski  
Hannah McGarry

Todd Jones  
Bridget McFadden  
Rainah Chambliss  
Jalyn Warren  
Junior Brainard  
Steve Jones  
Eric Neumann  
Alexine Fleck  
Cynthia Reid  
Jessica Rossi  
Margaret Stephens  
Edward Jordan

**FROM:** Donald Generals, Ed.D.  
President

**DATE:** October 8, 2018

**SUBJECT:** Open Expression – Time Place Manner Policy

---

In the interest of public safety for our College Community, and in accordance with my duties as President of the College, Article XXI of the Full-Time Faculty Collective Bargaining Agreement, and the Public Employee Relations Act ("Act 195"), I intend to implement the attached Expressive Demonstration: Time, Place, and Manner Policy.

The policy includes two suggested revisions from the Business Affairs Standing Committee. As the Business Affairs Standing Committee voted against the policy and the IWC voted not to deliberate on the policy, I am inviting representatives of the Business Affairs Standing Committee and the IWC to have their representatives place any argument in writing to the Board of Trustees Business Affairs Committee and have their representatives argue their positions at the Board of Trustees Business Affairs Committee meeting on October 24, 2018 at 10:00 a.m., in the Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom, Room M2-1.

Please let me know which representative(s) would like to present any arguments.

**ATTACHMENT D**

**Opposition for the Expressive Demonstration:  
Time, Place and Manner Policy**

**Bridget McFadden and Margaret Stephens**

To: Business Affairs Committee of the Board of Trustees, Community College of Philadelphia

From: Faculty and Staff Federation Delegates to the Institution Wide Committee and Business Affairs Committee

Re: Memo from President Generals dated October 8, 2018 with subject "Open Expression – Time Place Manner Policy"

Date: October 24, 2018

**Statement presented at the Business Affairs Committee of the Board of Trustees  
Community College of Philadelphia  
October 24, 2018**

Good morning, my name is Bridget McFadden, and I am the previous year's faculty Co-chair of the IWC. I am here with several of my colleagues today representing the Faculty and Staff Federation delegations to the Institution Wide and Business Affairs Committees. We are here to speak to you about the subject of the memo dated October 8, 2018, sent by President Generals to administrators and Federation members of those two committees. As you know, both committees are part of the shared governance structure of the College, recognized in the Full-Time Faculty Collective Bargaining Agreement and established through longstanding precedent. The governance structure is designed to include the expertise and input of the various constituent groups of the College for each of the divisional areas in terms of setting policies and programs. The Middle States Commission on Higher Education requires that each institution has a clearly developed governance structure which they consistently follow. Therefore, in order to meet our accreditation guidelines, it is essential that the governance process is followed correctly.

As you may be aware, according to the Full-Time Faculty Collective Bargaining Agreement, students, administrators, and Employees are entitled to equal numbers of representatives on each Standing Committee. We are concerned to see that the student representatives were not included in President Generals' original memo of October 8. Students were sent a memo and invited to this meeting only on Monday, October 22, so they had only two days' notice to prepare. Certainly, we would all agree that students' participation is essential in maintaining a campus climate of safety and security for all. So failing to include students in these exchanges and in the development of any policy that so directly affects their learning environment is unwise at best. Additionally, the proposed implementation of a policy by the President not properly brought forth through the Standing Committee and IWC structure is an abrogation of the governance process. I will turn it over to my colleague, Margaret Stephens, a delegate and Co-chair on the Business Affairs Standing Committee, to explain further.

Margaret Stephens: Good morning, and thank you, members of the board, for your work on behalf of our students and for your attention now.

1) Let us be clear: This is not an "argument" or appeal to the Board's Business Affairs Committee; rather, it is a statement of fact and concern as well as an abiding concern for the integrity of the shared governance structure of the College.

Simply put, there was no recommendation of a Standing Committee to the Institution-Wide Committee about a policy on open expression. I am not a lawyer. However, Article XXI of the Full-Time Faculty Collective Bargaining Agreement, which establishes the Standing Committee



structure “through which recommendations on policies and procedures will be channeled to the President and the board” is straightforward. Each Standing Committee considers and evaluates policies and makes recommendations to the Institution Wide Committee (IWC). Section (D) states, “The recommendations or reports of any Standing Committee shall be submitted in writing to an Institution-wide Committee for deliberation and action.” It continues: “Written recommendations of the Institution-wide Committee shall be acted upon with dispatch by the President.”

To repeat: There was no recommendation from the Business Affairs Committee to the Institution Wide Committee and there was, therefore, no mechanism for deliberation or recommendation on this matter by the IWC.

Therefore, we take issue with the premise of President Generals’ memo of October 8 and with his intended implementation of a policy that was not recommended by the Standing Committees.

Implementation of a policy in this unilateral manner subverts the College’s governance structure and undermines our trust.

The administration itself originally brought up this matter to the Business Affairs Committee and called for votes in that committee and then tried to introduce the matter again in the IWC. Thus, the claim that the president can implement a policy unilaterally is contradicted by the president’s own actions.

2) We are not here today to argue for or against or debate the proposed policy itself. However, we do want to point out a few obvious flaws that would make it ineffective in its stated intentions, as we understand them.

First, the proposed policy does **not**, in fact, prevent or solve the problems that have occurred on our campus in the past year with a so-called pastor and his followers spewing hateful invectives and attempting to incite and agitate. Nor does the proposed policy prevent or solve even more dangerous acts of violence that have occurred elsewhere in the United States.

For example, the proposed policy would limit a demonstration to four hours in a 24-hour day, and it specifies that demonstrations “by visitors or guests to the College” or when space “was not reserved in advance” should “generally take place in the Freedom Circle.” Four hours is more than enough time for an outside agitator intent on creating havoc or worse to do so.

Second -- and this should be important to anyone concerned about rights of free speech and assembly -- the proposed policy is too expansive, too broad. In its current form, the proposed policy could be used to hamper or suppress legitimate, peaceful protests and demonstrations by students, Employees, or other groups. That is unacceptable to us, and should be unacceptable to all.

3) We recognize the critical importance of balancing safety and security with the rights of free speech and peaceful protest on campus. We applaud the professionalism and good work of our Director of Public Safety, Mr. Randy Merced, and all the security personnel at the College, as well as the other members of our College community who have developed creative and peaceful methods to mitigate the harm caused by agitators like the so-called pastor. It is vital to our safety

that each of us -- regardless of our rank, official capacity or affiliation -- remains vigilant and continues to cooperate with one another for our individual and collective protection.

We want to state, emphatically, that we remain willing to work with the Director of Public Safety, student representatives, colleagues on the Standing Committees, and other interested parties to develop a plan and/or policy that continues to address all these concerns effectively.

In fact, the only official actions of a Standing Committee related to this matter have been motions passed in the Business Affairs Committee in the spring semester and in our most recent meeting on October 10, 2018. The motions acknowledged our shared concerns and called for the establishment of working groups or committees to address the issue. At its October 10 meeting, the Business Affairs Committee established such a subcommittee that ought to have one member representing each group in the governance structure, namely students, administration, and the Federation. That subcommittee is to provide an interim report to the full Business Affairs Committee at its November meeting and issue a complete report with recommendations at the December meeting.

Unfortunately, as of this writing, the administration has not sent a representative to that subcommittee. We do not see how that serves the interests of public safety that President Generals cites in his memo of October 8.

4) In summary, we call upon the board and President Generals to follow the established college governance and Standing Committee processes and, specifically, to direct all appropriate offices at the College to work collaboratively and cooperate fully in a shared governance process. This means to await the recommendations of the BAC to the IWC.

Thank you for your time and consideration. We would be glad to answer any questions.

## **Addenda**

Motions passed at the Oct. 10, 2018 meeting of the Business Affairs Standing Committee:

1) MOTION: "Whereas the Business Affairs Committee (BAC):

Discussed and considered the TPM proposed last year, after which it recommended against a policy modeled on the TPM policy in order to design a policy that meets the security and educational needs of the College;

Recognized the need to address concerns raised by the presence of outside hate groups on and near campus;

Continues to follow the College's established shared governance structure and processes;

The BAC moves to convene a committee made up of Security, Student Life, Student Governing Association, Faculty and Staff Federation, and other interested parties to

propose a policy to respond to concerns associated with protest on campus and protect the right to free speech and peaceful assembly.”

2) MOTION: “The BAC will nominate one member from Administration representatives, one member from Student representatives, and one member from Federation representatives to develop a committee structure made up of equal parts Administration, Federation, and Students. That committee will report back to BAC’s November meeting and issue a complete report with recommendations to BAC’s December meeting.”

## November/December 2018 Events

### **Annual Photography, Art and Music Faculty Exhibit**

November 1-30  
Mint Building, Rotunda  
Visit the Rotunda to experience the amazing exhibits of the faculty on display

### **Election Day: Get Out the Vote**

November 6  
Join us for a series of events at the College aimed at getting the community to Get Out the Word to Get Out the Vote

### **Spring Garden Records Label Launch**

November 8 | 5-7 p.m.  
Pavilion Building, Klein Cube  
Celebrate at the official launch party for the College's new record label

### **Veterans Day Ceremony**

November 9 | 10 a.m.  
Bonnell Building, Lobby  
Join us on Veterans Day to honor our College's and nation's veterans

### **Fall Transfer Fair**

November 12 | 8 a.m.-2 p.m.  
Bonnell Building, Lobby

### **Pizza with the President**

November 12 | 3- 4 p.m.  
Winnet Student Life Building, S2-3

### **Family-Owned Business Series: Succession Planning**

November 13 | 8:30-11 a.m.  
Northeast Regional Center, Community Room  
Training for owners of family businesses hosted by the Center for Small Business

### **PTK Induction Ceremony**

November 13 | 7 p.m.  
Bonnell Building, Large Auditorium  
Phi Theta Kappa is the international honor society for two-year colleges

### **Diversity Certificate Series**

November 1, 5, 13, 14, 19 and 28  
Visit [www.mycpp.online/diversity-certificate](http://www.mycpp.online/diversity-certificate) for full event descriptions, times and locations  
The aim of the Diversity Certificate Program is to offer quality workshops, dialogues and training on issues of diversity to all employees

### **Elixir: English and Creative Writing Mixer**

November 14 | 5-8 p.m.  
Mint Building, Rotunda

### **HAPPI Talks Entrepreneurship Conference**

November 15 | 9 a.m.-12 p.m.  
Center for Business and Industry, Room C2-5  
Hosted by the Office of Institutional Advancement

### **2018 4<sup>th</sup> Annual Meet the Legislators Breakfast**

November 16 | 8-10 a.m.  
Northeast Regional Center, Community Room  
Hosted by the Greater Northeast Philadelphia Chamber of Commerce

### **Reentry Support Project Fair**

November 16 | 9 a.m.-5 p.m.  
Winnet Student Life Building, Great Hall  
An employment event in partnership with the Philadelphia criminal court system

### **Motivational Speaking Seminar Series**

November 19 | 1-3 p.m.  
Bonnell Building, Large Auditorium  
Hosted by the Student Government Association

### **Commit to Complete Kickoff**

November 26 | 9 a.m.-3 p.m.  
Bonnell Building, Lobby  
Encourages students to commit to completing a degree or credential and/or successfully transfer from the College

*The Path to Possibilities™*

**High School Law Day**

November 28 | 8 a.m.

Winnet Student Life Building, Great Hall

High school juniors and seniors will experience an interactive day exploring law and related careers

Sponsored by the Fox Rothschild Center for Law and Society and the PA Bar Association

**Student Pottery Sale**

November 29 | 9 a.m.–3 p.m.

Bonnell Building, Lobby

Stop by the Student Pottery Sale, check out the beautiful work and bring home the perfect (and affordable) holiday gift

**Fall Pathways Magazine Breakfast**

December 3 | 8:30–9:30 a.m.

Pavilion Building, Klein Cube

The Pathways Magazine breakfast event will be the publication of the Fall 2018 edition of the College's own Pathways Magazine

**Motivational Speaking Seminar Series**

December 3 | 5–8 p.m.

Bonnell Building, Large Auditorium

Hosted by the Center for Student Leadership Development

**Women Organized Against Rape Workshop**

December 5 | 10–11:30 a.m.

Center for Business & Industry, C2-28

Hosted by the Women's Outreach and Advocacy Center

**Fall Music Performances**

December 5 | 10 a.m.–3 p.m.

Mint Building, Rotunda

Listen to the vocal ensemble of Community College of Philadelphia as they sing seasonal music for your listening pleasure

Presented by the Music Department

**Student Print Sale**

December 6 | 11 a.m.–5 p.m.

Bonnell Building, Lobby

Purchase exclusive prints presented by the students of the Photographic Imaging Department

**College-Wide Holiday Celebration**

December 11 | 11 a.m.–1 p.m.

Winnet Student Life Building, Great Hall

**TRIO Upward Bound Orientation**

December 15 | 8:30 a.m.–4:30 p.m.

Pavilion Building, Klein Cube

TRIO Upward Bound is a federally funded program that aims to increase college enrollment and graduation rates for high school students from low-income households

**Winter Break**

December 25 – January 1

*The Path to Possibilities™*