



MEETING OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES
Thursday, May 4, 2017 – 3:00 p.m.
Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom

Table of Contents

(1)	Agenda	Pages 2-3
(2)	Proceedings and Minutes of Decisions and Resolutions Meeting of April 6, 2017	Pages 4-14
(3)	Gifts and Grants	Pages 15-16
(4)	Minutes of the April 6, 2017 Student Outcomes Committee	Pages 17-33

#####

MEETING OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES

AGENDA

Thursday, May 4, 2017 – 3:00 p.m.

Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom, M2-1

- (1) Executive Session
- (2) Meeting Called to Order
- (3) Public Comment
- (4) Report of the Business Affairs Committee
- (5) Report of the Student Outcomes Committee
- (6) Consent Agenda
 - (a) Proceedings and Minutes of Decisions and Resolutions
Meeting of April 6, 2017
 - (b) Gifts and Grants
- (7) Report of the Chair
- (8) Foundation Report
- (9) Report of the President
- (10) New Business
- (11) Next Meeting: Thursday, June 1, 2017 – 3:00 p.m.
Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom, M2-1

Future Committee Meetings:

Business Affairs:	Wednesday, May 17, 2017 10:00 a.m. – Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom, M2-1
Student Outcomes:	Thursday, June 1, 2017 1:30 p.m. – M2-34
Audit Committee	Thursday, June 15, 2017 12:00 p.m. – Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom, M2-1

Upcoming Events

Nurses Pinning Ceremony	Friday, May 5, 2017 10:00 a.m. - 12:00 p.m. Gymnasium
Academic Awards & Reception	Friday, May 5, 2017 6:00 p.m. - 8:00 p.m. Bonnell Building, Large Auditorium, BG-20
Commencement	Saturday, May 6, 2017 10:00 a.m. - 2:00 p.m. Temple University Liacouras Center 1776 North Broad Street
Classified/Confidential Awards Luncheon	Wednesday, May 10, 2017 12:00 p.m. - 2:00 p.m. Winnet Student Life Building, Great Hall, Room S2-19
Foundation Annual Golf Classic	Monday, July 31, 2017 11:30 a.m. Manufacturer's Golf & Country Club 511 Dreshertown Road Fort Washington, PA
ACCT Leadership Congress	September 25-28, 2017 The Cosmopolitan Hotel Las Vegas, Nevada

#####

COMMUNITY COLLEGE OF PHILADELPHIA
Proceedings of the Meeting of the Board of Trustees
Thursday, April 6, 2017– 3:00 p.m.

Present: Mr. White, presiding; Ms. Biemiller, Ms. Fulmore-Townsend, Ms. Hernández Vélez, Mr. Martz, Dr. Rényi, Representative Roebuck, Ms. Sidhu, Mr. Soileau, Judge Tsai, Dr. Generals, Ms. de Fries, Ms. Di Gregorio, Mr. Eapen, Dr. Gay, Dr. Hirsch, Ms. Hurst, Mr. Murphy, and Ms. Zellers

(1) Meeting Called to Order

Mr. White called the meeting to order and welcomed guests.

(2) Presentation by Students

Dr. Generals discussed a recent study conducted by the American Association of Community Colleges, in which the College participated, that concluded that financial insecurity affects student success. He stated that many of CCP's students face these challenges and that he wanted the Board to hear from students how the College's support services have helped them to achieve their academic goals. Dr. Generals presented the following staff members and students:

Mr. Derrick Perkins, Director, Center for Male Engagement (CME), discussed the many support services the Center provides students, specifically Black males. Student Timothy Kelly, shared his journey with the Board. Timothy will be graduating in May.

Ms. Paula Umana, Director, Single Stop USA, gave an overview of the many services that Single Stop provides students. Student DeVonna DeBeary noted how the support services she received by Single Stop helped her find work as a work-study student and secure healthcare benefits.

Ms. Kathy Smith, Professor, Paralegal Studies and Director of the Center for Law and Society, provided an overview of the Reentry Support Project. She stated that the Reentry Support Project is part of the Center for Law and Society, and the founder and coordinator of the program is Tara Timberman, Associate Professor of English. Student Christian Dennis spoke on how the College's Reentry Support Project changed his life. He is presently co-owner of Quaker City Coffee, a company that aims to help ex-cons, one cup of coffee at a time.

Ms. Kimberly Daniel, Director, KEYS Program, provided an emotional account of the many students that come to the KEYS Program office with so many challenges and hurdles. She stated that the program has helped students stay on track academically and achieve their goals. Student Renee Harris stated that she had received tremendous help and understanding from the KEYS staff. She stated that in May, she will graduate with a degree in Nursing, a highly competitive program.

Dr. Claudia Curry, Director, Women’s Center, discussed the many services that the Women’s Center provides through the Homeless Student Support Project such as life skills, workshops for finance, transitioning to college, and some financial support through tough times. Student Hilda Carrion had experienced housing insecurity during much of her college career living in several homeless shelters. Through the Homeless Student Support Project, Hilda is now in permanent housing and is continuing her studies at the College. She stated that the tough love shown by Dr. Curry had helped her focus on classes, rather than challenges.

(3) Public Comment

Mr. White explained the process for Public Comment. He stated that Public Comment at Board of Trustees meetings is an opportunity for faculty, staff, students, and members of the community to give input to Trustees on the direction of the College. Mr. White stated that today there will be nine individuals who will provide public comment. Each presenter will have three minutes to address the Board. The presenters were as follows:

Melissa Strong	Full-time faculty, English
Brian Seymour	Full-time faculty, Art
Yusefa Smith	Full-time faculty, Foundational Math
Quinn Dougherty	Student
Eric Marshall	Student
Joseph Kennedy	Student

Two individuals who requested public comment, Wafaf Labadi and Vera Green, did not appear. Ms. Strong, Mr. Seymour, and Ms. Smith presented their concerns regarding contract negotiations and proposals. Students Quinn Dougherty and Eric Marshall expressed their concerns regarding the impact of contract proposals on students. Mr. Marshall also read a letter from student Stephen Miller expressing his concerns regarding negotiations. Student Joseph Kennedy requested that the College offer more online classes for students.

Mr. White thanked the presenters for their thoughtful comments.

At this point in the meeting, the Board convened in Executive Session. The Executive Session was devoted to a discussion of legal and labor negotiations.

At 5:15 p.m., the Board reconvened in Public Session.

(4) Report of the Business Affairs Committee

Ms. Biemiller read the following Resolution of Appreciation for Mr. Todd Murphy, Assistant Vice President and Controller, for his service to the College:

WHEREAS, Mr. Todd E. Murphy has been the Assistant Vice President for Accounting and Controller of the Community College of Philadelphia for the past 14 years;

WHEREAS, Mr. Murphy provided leadership and effective management in: General Accounting, Fixed Assets Accounting, Grant Accounting, Bursar Services and Accounting, Accounts Payable, Payroll and Cash Management functions;

WHEREAS, Mr. Murphy prepared the College's annual financial statements in accordance with GASB reporting; coordinated all financial, governmental and compliance audits; and supported the implementation and effective use of financial systems in College operations and in financial and management reporting;

WHEREAS, Mr. Murphy provided leadership for ensuring the adequacy of internal controls and the integrity of College's financial records and advised the Vice President for Business and Finance on financial, accounting, and auditing matters;

WHEREAS, Mr. Murphy is honored, esteemed, and respected among all his colleagues for his exemplary performance as the Assistant Vice President for Accounting and Controller of the Community College of Philadelphia;

BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board of Trustees of Community College of Philadelphia expresses its respect, admiration, and appreciation for the dedicated and extensive commitment on the part of Mr. Murphy during his tenure as Assistant Vice President for Accounting and Controller of the Community College of Philadelphia and wish him the very best in his career.

Ms. Biemiller moved, with Ms. Hernández Vélez seconding, that the Board approve the above Resolution. The motion carried unanimously.

Ms. Biemiller thanked Mr. Murphy for his commitment and dedication during his tenure at the College and wished him the best in his new position.

Mr. Murphy thanked the Board for the recognition. He stated that it had been an honor to work at the College for 14 years, and that he especially enjoyed making a difference in students' lives. Mr. Murphy thanked the Board for all their support and wished the Board and the College the best in the future.

(5) Report of the Student Outcomes Committee

Dr. Rényi reported that the Student Outcomes Committee had a good discussion about the College's ability to reach the goals outlined in the Strategic Plan. She stated that the Committee discussed how to select critical issues for the full Board to discuss at each of its monthly meetings. Dr. Rényi said that our students' and the City's poverty drastically affects retention and student success. Part of this is the first critical issue to be presented to the Board today on the housing and food insecurity our students face.

Committee members, Dr. Hirsch and Dr. Gay, suggested the following topics for full Board in-depth discussions at future Board meetings:

Federal and State budget proposals and resources available to students. What can the Board do?

The Board's role in state and national advocacy that support the success of our students.

The value of secondary credential and our role in building a path from school to careers.

How can we help and strengthen the College's role in becoming a change agent for the City?

Ways in which we look at students: Only one-third are traditional students and two-thirds are not; What do we (Board, College, and City) do to acknowledge that and revise our actions accordingly? How do we acknowledge the vast restructuring of jobs and industries for the majority of our students?

Dr. Rényi welcomed recommendations of topics from members of the Board and the administration at any time.

(6) Report of the Audit Committee
Meeting of March 28, 2017

(6a) 2015-2016 A-133 Audit Report

Mr. White reported that the Committee met with the College's external auditor who reviewed and discussed the College's A-133 Audit Report. Mr. White stated that he was pleased to report that there were no issues and that the College had another clean audit this year.

After discussion, Dr. Rényi moved, with Mr. Herzog seconding, that the Board approve the 2015-2016 A-133 Audit Report. The motion carried unanimously.

Mr. White stated that the Committee spoke to the external auditor regarding generating additional revenues and fundraising. The auditor agreed recommended that the Board and Trustees and Foundation Board should schedule a joint meeting to discuss this issue.

(7) Consent Agenda

Mr. White presented the following Consent Agenda for Board approval:

- Proceedings and Minutes of Decisions and Resolutions
Meeting of March 2, 2017
- Gifts and Grants
- Recommendation for Integrated Library System
- ESS Library Suite: Winnet: Bursar Counter – RFP 9978

Mr. Soileau moved, with Ms. Fulmore-Townsend seconding, that the Board approve the Consent Agenda. The motion carried unanimously.

(8) Report of the Chair

(8a) Nomination Process for the Election of Board Officers

Mr. White read the Nomination Process for the Election of Board Officers. He stated that he had appointed the following Nominating Committee for Board Officers:

Ms. Lydia Hernández Vélez	Chair
Judge Stella Tsai	Member
Ms. Rosalyn McPherson	Member

Mr. White stated that the Committee is scheduled to report at the September Board of Trustees meeting.

(8b) College Conflict of Interest Policy and State Ethics Form

Mr. White reminded members of the Board to complete and return the Conflict of Interest Policy and State Ethics Form to the President’s Office at their earliest convenience. Board members in need of additional copies of the forms should contact the President’s Office.

(8c) Year-End Events

Mr. White requested Board representation at a number of year-end events. After discussion, it was agreed:

- Ms. Hernández Vélez will represent the Board at the Retirees Program on May 2, 2017 at 4:00 p.m., in the Pavilion Cube. A reception will follow in the Bonnell Building, 1st floor Library Bridge;
- Mr. Soileau – Nursing Pinning Ceremony on May 5, 2017, 10:00 a.m., Gymnasium;
- Dr. Rényi – Academic Awards & Reception, May 5, 2017, 6:00 p.m., in the Bonnell Building Large Auditorium, BG-20; and
- Ms. Fulmore-Townsend – Classified/Confidential Luncheon, May 10, 2017, 12:00 noon, Winnet Building, Great Hall.

Mr. White reported that he had appointed Mr. Michael Soileau to the Foundation Board.

Mr. White reported that he had been instrumental in bringing Dr. Hadiyah Green to the College to speak to students and faculty on Tuesday, March 28, 2017. Dr. Green, a medical physicist, is doing cutting edge cancer research. Dr. Green spoke of her personal journey that led her to develop an innovative cancer treatment. She also shared her experience and how she persisted in her early days as a student in the STEM field.

(9) Report of the President

Dr. Generals called attention to his memorandum in the Board folder regarding his activities during the month of March, and summarized the highlights.

(9a) Commission for Community Colleges Annual Meeting
April 3-4, 2017, Harrisburg

Dr. Generals reported that he had attended the Commission for Community Colleges Annual meeting on April 3-4, 2017. The All-Pennsylvania Academic Team dinner was held on April 3. Community College of Philadelphia was represented by student Cedric Jouin on the All-Pennsylvania Academic Team.

Dr. Generals reported that Lobby Day in Harrisburg took place on April 4, 2017. Students, faculty and staff participated in advocating to legislators on behalf of the College and students.

(9b) Philadelphia Citizen Panel

Dr. Generals reported that the *Philadelphia Citizen* in partnership with the Barnes Foundation is hosting a panel discussion entitled *Citizen Speaks: The University and the City* on April 20, 2017. He stated that other panelists include Dr. John Fry, President, Drexel University; Dr. Richard Englert, President, Temple University; Mr. Stephen Klasko, President and CEO, Thomas Jefferson University & Jefferson Health; and Dr. Amy Gutman, President, University of Pennsylvania. The panel will discuss the integral role each institution plays in shaping the lives of the City, and how their fostering of innovation is making Philadelphia an even greater City for all. The moderator for the discussion is Jeremy Nowak, Senior Non Resident Fellow, Brookings Institution.

(9c) College Budget Hearing

Dr. Generals reminded the Board that the College's Budget Hearing before City Council is scheduled for Monday, May 8, 2017 at 1:00 p.m. in City Council Chambers, Room 400. Dr. Generals encouraged members of the Board to attend if their calendars permit. Attendees should arrive in City Council Chambers by 12:00 noon.

Dr. Generals called the following to the Board's attention:

- An article that appeared in the *Philadelphia Inquirer* on Community College's planned expansion in West Philadelphia of the Automotive Tech Program;
- A flyer regarding the College's Job Fair Week with Comcast scheduled April 10-13, 2017 in the Winnet Building, Great Hall;
- A Document outlining CCP's programs and initiatives on combating poverty, hunger, and homelessness in the City;
- The Student Exhibition show which is scheduled April 6-24, 2017 in the Mint Building Rotunda. The opening reception for the show is scheduled for Tuesday, April 11, 2017, 4:00 – 6:00 p.m. in the Rotunda; and
- A List of College events including the 33rd Annual International Festival, *Identity Within a Global Citizenry*, April 3-10, 2017, and Diversity and Civility Week, April 10-13, 2017.

(9d) Middle States Commission on Higher Education

Dr. Generals reported that he had been asked by the Middle States Commission on Higher Education to chair the Middle States Evaluation Team Visit to Borough of Manhattan Community College.

(9e) Commencement

Dr. Generals reported that Commencement is scheduled for Saturday, May 6, 2017 at 10:00 a.m., at the Temple Liacouras Center. Mr. Marc Morial, President and CEO of the National Urban League, will be our commencement speaker. Dr. Generals thanked Rosalyn McPherson for securing such a formidable speaker for this important event.

(10) New Business

There was no new business discussed.

(11) Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Board of Trustees is scheduled for Thursday, May 4, 2017 at 3:00 p.m. in the Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom.

The meeting adjourned at 5:45 p.m.

COMMUNITY COLLEGE OF PHILADELPHIA
Meeting of the Board of Trustees
Thursday, April 6, 2017– 3:00 p.m.
MINUTES OF DECISIONS OF DECISIONS AND RESOLUTIONS

Present: Mr. White, presiding; Ms. Biemiller, Ms. Fulmore-Townsend, Ms. Hernández Vélez, Mr. Martz, Dr. Rényi, Representative Roebuck, Ms. Sidhu, Mr. Soileau, Judge Tsai, Dr. Generals, Ms. de Fries, Ms. Di Gregorio, Mr. Eapen, Dr. Gay, Dr. Hirsch, Ms. Hurst, Mr. Murphy, and Ms. Zellers

(1) Meeting Called to Order

Mr. White called the meeting to order and welcomed guests.

(2) Presentation by Students

The Board was provided with presentations from staff and students about the support services provided to students by the College to ensure student academic success.

(3) Public Comment

The following members of the faculty presented their concerns regarding contract negotiations and proposals.

Melissa Strong	Full-time faculty, English
Brian Seymour	Full-time faculty, Art
Yusefa Smith	Full-time faculty, Foundational Math

Two individuals who requested public comment, Wafaf Labadi and Vera Green, did not appear. The following students expressed their concerns regarding the impact of contract proposals. Mr. Kennedy requested that the College offer more online classes for students.

Quinn Dougherty	Student
Eric Marshall	Student
Joseph Kennedy	Student

At this point in the meeting, the Board convened in Executive Session. The Executive Session was devoted to a discussion of legal and labor negotiations.

At 5:15 p.m., the Board reconvened in Public Session.

(4) Report of the Business Affairs Committee

The Board approved a Resolution of Appreciation for Todd Murphy, Assistant Vice President and Controller, for his service to the College.

(5) Report of the Student Outcomes Committee

The Student Outcomes Committee had a good discussion about the College’s ability to reach the goals outlined in the Strategic Plan, and how to select critical issues for the full Board to discuss at each of its monthly meetings. The Committee suggested a number of topics for full Board in-depth discussions at future Board meetings.

(6) Report of the Audit Committee
Meeting of March 28, 2017

(6a) 2015-2016 A-133 Audit Report

The Board approved the 2015-2016 A-133 Audit Report. The motion carried unanimously.

(7) Consent Agenda

The Board approved the following Consent Agenda:

- Proceedings and Minutes of Decisions and Resolutions
Meeting of March 2, 2017
- Gifts and Grants
- Recommendation for Integrated Library System
- ESS Library Suite: Winnet: Bursar Counter – RFP 9978

(8) Report of the Chair

(8a) Nomination Process for the Election of Board Officers

The Board was informed about the Nomination Process for the Election of Board Officers. The following Board members will serve as Nominating Committee for Board Officers:

Ms. Lydia Hernández Vélez	Chair
Judge Stella Tsai	Member
Ms. Rosalyn McPherson	Member

(8b) College Conflict of Interest Policy and State Ethics Form

The Board was reminded to complete and return the Conflict of Interest Policy and State Ethics Form to the President’s Office at their earliest convenience.

(8c) Year-End Events

The following Board members will represent the Board at year-end events:

- Ms. Hernández Vélez will represent the Board at the Retirees Program on May 2, 2017, 4:00 p.m., in the Pavilion Cube. A reception will follow in the Bonnell Building, 1st floor Library Bridge;

- Mr. Soileau – Nursing Pinning Ceremony on May 5, 2017, 10:00 a.m., Gymnasium;
- Dr. Rényi – Academic Awards & Reception on May 5, 2017, 6:00 p.m., Bonnell Building Large Auditorium, BG-20; and
- Ms. Fulmore-Townsend – Classified/Confidential Luncheon, May 10, 2017, 12:00 noon, Winnet Building, Great Hall.

(9) Report of the President

Dr. Generals called attention to his memorandum in the Board folder regarding his activities during the month of March, and summarized the highlights.

(9a) Commission for Community Colleges Annual Meeting
April 3-4, 2017, Harrisburg

The Commission for Community Colleges Annual meeting took place on April 3-4, 2017. The All-Pennsylvania Academic Team dinner was held on April 3. Lobby Day in Harrisburg took place on April 4, 2017. Students, faculty and staff participated in advocating to legislators on behalf of the College and students.

(9b) Philadelphia Citizen Panel

Dr. Generals will be participating on a *Philadelphia Citizen Panel* entitled *Citizen Speaks: The University and the City* on April 20, 2017. Other panelists include Dr. John Fry, President, Drexel University; Dr. Richard Englert, President, Temple University; Mr. Stephen Klasko, President and CEO, Thomas Jefferson University & Jefferson Health; and Dr. Amy Gutman, President, University of Pennsylvania.

(9c) College Budget Hearing

The College's Budget Hearing before City Council is scheduled for Monday, May 8, 2017 at 1:00 p.m. in City Council Chambers, Room 400.

Dr. Generals called the following to the Board's attention:

- An article that appeared in the *Philadelphia Inquirer* on the College's planned expansion in West Philadelphia of the Automotive Tech Program;
- A flyer regarding the College's Job Fair Week with Comcast scheduled April 10-13, 2017 in the Winnet Building, Great Hall;
- A Document outlining CCP's programs and initiatives on combating poverty, hunger, and homelessness in the City;

- The Student Exhibition show which is scheduled April 6-24, 2017 in the Mint Building Rotunda. The opening reception for the show is scheduled for Tuesday, April 11, 2017, 4:00 – 6:00 p.m. in the Rotunda; and
- A List of College events including the 33rd Annual International Festival, *Identity Within a Global Citizenry*, April 3-10, 2017, and Diversity and Civility Week, April 10-13, 2017.

(9d) Middle States Commission on Higher Education

Dr. Generals will be chairing the Middle States Commission on Higher Evaluation Team Visit to the Borough of Manhattan Community College.

(9e) Commencement

Commencement is scheduled for Saturday, May 6, 2017 at 10:00 a.m. at the Temple Liacouras Center. Mr. Marc Morial, President and CEO of the National Urban League, will be our commencement speaker.

(10) New Business

There was no new business discussed.

(11) Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Board of Trustees is scheduled for Thursday, May 4, 2017 at 3:00 p.m. in the Isadore A. Shrager Boardroom.

The meeting adjourned at 5:45 p.m.

Community College of Philadelphia
Office of Institutional Advancement
Record of Grants and Gifts
for the May 2017 Meeting of the Board of Trustees

Summary by Grant Type:

	3/30/17 - 4/26/17	2017 FY
		Year-to-Date
Government/Public Grants		
Federal		\$1,875,413
State		\$3,358,196
Local		\$962,500
Private Grants		
Corporation		\$10,000
Foundation		\$287,715
Organization		\$423,865
Other Grants		
Grant Total		\$6,917,689

GIFTS

Summary by Gift Type:

Gifts to the Foundation (\$5,000+)	Amount	Purpose
PECO Energy Company	\$5,000	Event Sponsorship
Private Donor	\$25,000	Community/Public Service
Private Donor	\$10,000	Endowment
Gifts In-Kind		
Alcon Labs	\$480	Ophthalmic Technician Program Materials
ClearVision Optical	\$1,000	Ophthalmic Technician Program Materials
Knoll, Inc.	\$28,000	Storage Caseloads
Scott Lee, OD	\$600	Ophthalmic Technician Program Materials
Lombart Instruments	\$1,500	Ophthalmic Technician Program Materials
PECO Energy Company	\$20,209	Gas Course Materials
Precision Optical	\$300	Ophthalmic Technician Program Materials
Private Donor	\$4,900	Art
Salus University	\$7,650	Ophthalmic Technician Program Materials
The Daniel Veloric Foundation	See Attached	West Philadelphia Property

COMMUNITY COLLEGE OF PHILADELPHIA
Office of Institutional Advancement
Monthly Summary of Grants and Gifts
for the May 2017
Meeting of the Board of Trustees

Gift-in-Kind

On April 4, 2017, Community College of Philadelphia purchased two parcels of land (9,694 sq. ft.) adjacent to the West Regional Center near 48th and Ludlow streets. The property, held by Mohawk Community Investments, was offered to the College for a "bargain sale" rate of approximately 60% less than its estimated value. The difference between the donor's valuation and the College's payment has been recorded as a gift-in-kind from The Daniel Veloric Foundation. The property was purchased with funds from the Community College of Philadelphia Foundation.

The acquisition will allow the College to expand its current facilities and develop new, state-of-the-art facilities. This development will support enhancements of current educational activities, create the capacity for increased enrollment, eliminate rental costs, and strengthen the College's efforts to improve the educational and employment outcomes of residents in the surrounding community.

**STUDENT OUTCOMES COMMITTEE OF THE
BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

MINUTES

Thursday, April 6, 2017

1:30 p.m.

Conference Room M2-34

Presiding: Dr. Rényi

Present: Ms. de Fries, Ms. Fulmore-Townsend, Dr. Gay, Dr. General, Ms. Hernández Vélez, Dr. Hirsch, Dr. Roberts, Ms. Sidhu

Guests: Ms. Dunston, Ms. McDonnell, Mr. Raskin, Ms. Smith, Dr. Sweet

(1) Executive Session

There were no agenda items for the Executive Session.

(2) Public Session

(a) Approval of the Minutes of March 2, 2017

The minutes were accepted unanimously. Dr. Rényi discussed the key performance indicators (KPIs) discussed at the last meeting. Dr. Hirsch noted that the KPIs are not chosen by the College but rather originate from the Community College Research Center as part of the Pathways Project. Dr. Rényi is concerned that the KPIs are better indicators for students with more credits and that part-time students need to be addressed appropriately. KPIs for part-time and older students should be identified so that the College can better help them with student success outcomes (e.g., persistence, retention, completion, etc.). In the draft strategic plan, there is only one mention of adult students and part-time students, but they are two-thirds of our students and most at risk of not succeeding.

(b) Academic Program Review: Communications Studies A.A. and Mass Media A.A. Degrees

Ms. Dunston described two key findings from the audit for the two associate degree programs. Since we try to audit curricula that are aligned with the shared curricula, inconsistencies between course and program learning outcomes were found. In addition, based on the exit status of students, the programs need to improve the use of articulation agreements. The following recommendations were made: a full review of articulation agreements, including which to drop/modify and which to add; and research on students who leave the college with 12 or fewer credits, analysis and an action plan for addressing their needs. Alignment between course student learning

outcomes (SLOs) and program learning outcomes (PLOs) is required and data collection must be improved since both programs use the same courses.

Dr. Rényi asked if each program had a curriculum map. Mr. Raskin (program coordinator for the two programs) explained that ahead of Guided Pathways, the Communications Studies program had been planning revisions, in part to align better with Temple University, with which the programs do not yet have articulation agreements. He gave as an example ENG 114. Students had been taking this course as an elective but to develop a more robust articulation, the course would instead be a directed elective that would count as a 200-level course for Temple. The program was last revised in 2011, before Mr. Raskin joined the College in 2012. He said the program had too many outcomes and that they should be streamlined with better calibration between course SLOs and PLOs. The programs have worked on their curriculum maps within the context of Guided Pathways, including changes to courses and to SLOs. Mr. Raskin said there has been coordination across programs regarding electives to help students who may change programs within the academic pathway. Additionally, input regarding transfer options was useful in choosing which courses to include on the curriculum maps.

Dr. Rényi noted the drop in enrollment and the low retention rate and asked what strategies the programs plan to use. Mr. Raskin indicated that enrollment is not problematic in courses and stated there are robust program enrollments. Regarding retention, he said a directed elective course will now be an introductory course earlier in the curriculum that can be taken by students in developmental education courses. This means that students will begin taking program courses earlier than previously and can start earning credits towards the degree sooner.

Ms. Sidhu asked about maintaining articulation agreements and if there is a downside to having too many. Dr. Sweet answered that it is not detrimental to have many articulation agreements, but that the program should focus on agreements with schools to which our students regularly transfer, such as Temple University. Ms. Dunston added that the review of articulation agreements is not to reduce them but review them for currency and increase them when appropriate.

Dr. Rényi commented on the programs' plans for improved alignment of SLOs and the clarity of assessments, both of which are important after Middle States noted the need to foster a culture of assessment. Mr. Raskin stated that faculty are becoming more comfortable with Canvas technology and the rubrics tool.

Action: The Student Outcomes Committee unanimously approved the motion that approval of the Communications Studies A.A. and Mass Media A.A. programs be deferred until a progress report is submitted. In the report, the program should address articulation agreements, retention, and assessment. The progress report should be submitted by December 2017.

(c) Academic Program Review: Paralegal Studies A.A.S. Degree; Paralegal Proficiency Certificate; Electronic Discovery Proficiency Certificate

Ms. Dunston described key findings from the audit for Paralegal programs, which show robust student outcomes and program recognition. The program should determine how to use these two positive attributes to encourage growth potential. Another key finding pointed to low section enrollment; the program has a number of electives but lower enrollment in each. Ms. McDonnell noted that enrollment was around 18 per course, but should average about 25. Ms. Dunston explained that enrollment is not only about having fewer students enrolled but how to run sections at peak efficiency.

Ms. Smith, the program coordinator, described how there are more jobs in the City than students and how this provides an opportunity to increase enrollment. Ms. Hernández Vélez commented that as a lawyer, she sees this as a great opportunity for specialists in electronic research; Ms. Smith noted that the College has the only program in the City that uses both online research databases, Westlaw and Lexis. In response to a question from Ms. Hernández Vélez about certifications, Ms. Smith answered that the program could do better regarding the marketing of these certifications. Ms. McDonnell commented that the work done by Ms. Smith and the program is impressive, especially regarding assessment and community.

Dr. Rényi asked if the program had finished its curriculum map as part of Guided Pathways. Ms. Smith explained that the program needs ABA approval to make changes and that work is progressing on this. Dr. Rényi noted that the Guided Pathways map should not affect the program but rather provide more guidance to students; Ms. Smith explained that the faculty provide guidance and advisement to students and the program has been making changes, such as adding service learning.

Action: The Student Outcomes Committee unanimously approved the motion that the Paralegal Studies program should be approved for five years with the caveat of a progress report to be submitted by December 2017. In the report, the program should address recruitment and section enrollments and should include the curriculum map.

(d) New Business

Dr. Rényi led a discussion on selecting critical issues for consideration by the full Board of Trustees at each of its meetings. The critical issues can be internal or external to the College, and on a local, city, state, or national level. These issues may come up as the College tries to achieve its aspirational goals resulting from the strategic plan.

Topics for discussion that were proposed by the committee members, Dr. General, Dr. Hirsch, and Dr. Gay included the following:

- Federal and State budget proposals and resources available to students. What can the Board do?
- The Board's role in state and national advocacy that support the success of our students.
- The value of a secondary credential and our role in building a path from school to careers.
- How can we help and strengthen the College's role in becoming a change agent for the City?
- Ways in which we look at students - Only one-third are traditional students and two-thirds are not: what do we (Board, College, City) do to acknowledge that and revise our actions accordingly? How do we acknowledge the vast restructuring of jobs and industries for the majority of our students?

Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Student Outcomes Committee of the Board is scheduled for May 4, 2017 at 1:30 p.m. in Conference Room M2-34.

Attachments:

Minutes of March 2, 2017

Academic Program Review: Communication Studies A.A., Mass Media A.A.

Academic Program Review: Paralegal Studies A.A.S., Paralegal Proficiency Certificate, Electronic Discovery Proficiency Certificate

**STUDENT OUTCOMES COMMITTEE OF THE
BOARD OF TRUSTEES**

MINUTES

Thursday, March 2, 2017

1:30 p.m.

Northwest Regional Center, Room 202

Presiding: Dr. Hirsch and Dr. Rényi

Present: Mr. Armbrister, Ms. de Fries, Ms. Fulmore-Townsend, Ms. Hernández Vélez, Dr. Gay, Dr. Generals, Dr. Roberts, Rep. Roebuck, Jr., Ms. Sidhu, Ms. Zellers

(1) Executive Session

There were no agenda items for the Executive Session.

(2) Public Session

(a) Approval of the Minutes of November 3, 2016

The minutes were accepted unanimously.

(b) Program Audit Follow-Up Reports

(i) Respiratory Care Technology Audit Action Item Update

On April 7, 2016, the Student Outcomes Committee recommended that the Board of Trustees accept the Respiratory Care Program Audit with approval for five years. In addition, the Committee required a follow-up report on the status of the course revisions. Dr. Hirsch reported that per the audit recommendation, the program revision was completed and is currently going through governance. The revisions included updating the program learning outcomes and developing a new curriculum map. As a result of changes to the program learning outcomes, the program is reviewing course student learning outcomes (SLOs); necessary modifications to courses will be completed by April 30, 2017.

(ii) Health Sciences Management Audit Action Item Update

On April 7, 2016, the Student Outcomes Committee recommended that the Board of Trustees accept the Health Services Management Program Audit with approval for five years. In addition, the Committee required a follow-up report on the status of the assessment of the program learning outcomes. Dr. Hirsch reported that per the audit recommendation, the program completed assessments for fall 2015, spring 2016 and fall 2016. As a result of the assessments, the program reduced the number of program

learning outcomes and was able to better align course student learning outcomes (SLOs).

Action: The Student Outcomes Committee unanimously accepts the two follow-up reports.

(c) AACC Pathways Project – College Key Performance Indicators

Dr. Hirsch led the Committee through the key performance indicators (KPIs) related to student success. The KPIs were developed by the Community College Research Center (CCRC) (a research organization housed within Teachers College at Columbia University). The KPIs track cohorts of first-time-enrolled-in-college (FTEIC) students with no prior credits. Dual-enrolled students are not included. KPIs encompass early momentum data (i.e., number of credits completed with first term or first year); persistence and completion data (i.e., completion of college math and/or college English in first year; persistence from Term 1 to Term 2; course completion rate); and demographics data (i.e., percent of students who were college-ready; referred to developmental education in 1, 2 or 3 subjects; females; traditional college age; and full-time). Data are provided for fall semesters from 2010 to 2015; data for fall 2016 should be finalized for a future meeting. Mr. Armbrister asked if the College had specific aspirational goals. Dr. Hirsch explained that CCRC purposely did not encourage comparisons across institutions as institutions differ too much.

The College did make gains from fall 2014 to fall 2015 on the early momentum KPIs (i.e., college credits completed in the first term and first year). Regarding persistence and completion, the percentage of students completing college math and/or college English in their first year increased modestly. Because of changes in the placement exam, the College should see positive changes in future cycles. There was a slight increase in the persistence rate from fall to spring. Regarding the persistence rate, full-time students persist at a higher rate (approximately 80%) than part-time students. The ratio of completed college credits to attempted college credits has consistently been around 70%. Dr. Hirsch explained that the College has been and is developing strategies to address this, including practices relating to withdrawals, and gains are expected. The percent of cohort students who were college-ready spiked from 23.7% in fall 2014 to 28.4% in fall 2015. Students referred to developmental education courses showed an increase in the percent needing developmental education in just one subject and decreases for those referred to developmental education in two or three subjects.

Ms. Fulmore-Townsend asked about results by subject. Dr. Hirsch described how changes to the English placement exam have increased those who place as college-ready, but the opposite was seen for math, with more students placing into developmental math. Because of the math results, overall gain did not improve. Ms. Sidhu asked if there were any “hunches” regarding what might be driving changes. Dr. Hirsch explained that there may be a variety of reasons: the College is working more closely with high schools; changes to the delivery of developmental education courses such as contextualized learning and concurrent enrollment are being piloted;

and an intensive ESL program was recently approved. Dr. General explained that the work in this area is part of the new Guided Pathways, including new advisors and encouraging some students to take more credits which positively correlates with success. As these changes are implemented throughout the first year experience we should see improvement in the KPIs. The College will continue to look at more holistic methods for placement of students in developmental education, such as incorporating placement tests with non-cognitive assessments and high school transcripts.

Dr. Hirsch provided a brief overview of the Guided Pathways project for the new members of the Committee. He noted that the College is currently reaching a major milestone: program maps are nearing completion for all programs, which create more cohesive and focused curriculum guidance for students.

(d) Workforce and Economic Innovation Program Update

Ms. de Fries provided an update on the Workforce and Economic Innovation (WEI) program:

- For the Gas Distribution Pipeline Mechanic Program, the College partnered with Philadelphia Works, which is paying for the classes. The Collegiate Consortium has held two classes with 14 people at Delaware County Community College. The equipment rotates around the area community colleges. The College recently submitted a grant to purchase its own equipment.
- For Microcredentials, a pilot program took place in November, with 57 hours of basic workplace skills. Five students were in the first cohort, with 11 in the second cohort. The third cohort will target reentry students.
- Ms. de Fries also mentioned an apprenticeship program with the National Machining and Tooling Association. This program includes Blueprint Reading and Shop Math courses as part of regional offerings. In addition, the unit has developed an online non-credit Basics of Geographic Information Systems (GIS) program (to begin later in March).
- The Social Media Management Certificate was just launched; some classes are being offered this semester.
- The Wanamaker Scholars program receives funding from the Wanamaker Institute for unemployed/underemployed Philadelphia residents. The state is currently restricting funds for the CDA program, and Wanamaker agreed to fund an entire class via 20 scholarships. In addition, Wanamaker has targeted its other funding toward scholarships for Advanced Manufacturing and CAN programs. The Power Up Your Business Grant helps neighborhood-based commercial corridor businesses with \$800,000 annually from the city. The program covers a variety of zip codes. This program rotates between the Main Campus and the Regional Centers. Eighty people have taken part in workshops with 14 businesses in the current cohort.
- The Student Innovation Center assists five student entrepreneurs. These students will receive mentoring from Goldman Sachs 10,000 Small Businesses Program alumni.

- Several programs are pending. These include Comptia A+ Certification and a medical assisting program with PHA (which may start at the end of March).
- As part of Microcredentialing, the College is completing a bookkeeping certificate and considering a massage therapy program.

(e) Selecting and Scheduling Critical Issues for Discussion by the Full Board

Dr. Rényi explained that per a request from the Board of Trustees chair, Jeremiah White, she is following up on a suggestion from Mr. Armbrister’s ad hoc committee on board meeting structure that the Student Outcomes Committee compile a list of topics to forward to the Board of Trustees for discussion. This could be done by strategic pillar or could cut across the pillars. She suggested that the Committee review the next draft of the Strategic Plan and discuss important issues and opportunities that the Board as a whole will actively engage. The Committee should consider useful and timely topics, which could be calendared several months in advance. In addition to topics determined in advance, if a crisis occurs, it could also be a topic for Board discussion. Dr. Generals will provide the Committee with the updated Strategic Plan on March 24 so that members can consider topics for the April 6 meeting and see what topics could be pulled out for the May and June meetings. Dr. Rényi asked Drs. Generals, Gay and Hirsch to consider possible topics ahead of the next Committee meeting.

(f) Dashboard

There were no new updates to the Dashboard.

(g) New Business

There were no new business topics to discuss.

Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Student Outcomes Committee of the Board is scheduled for April 6, 2017 at 1:30 p.m. in Conference Room M2-34.

Attachments:

Minutes of November 3, 2016
 Respiratory Care Technology Audit Action Item Update
 Health Services Management Audit Action Item Update
 AACC Pathways Project – College Key Performance Indicators
 Workforce and Economic Innovation (WEI) 2-9-17 Presentation
 Strategic Plan Draft Unit Goals
 Dashboard – November 7, 2016

Community College *of* Philadelphia

Academic Program Review

Executive Summary Prepared

for

Student Outcomes Committee of the Board

Communication Studies A.A.

Mass Media A.A.

Author: Christine
McDonnell Krishna
Dunston

Contributors:
David Raskin
Craig Strimel

Date: Fall
2016

A. Key Findings

The Office of Assessment and Evaluation makes the following observations, with regard to the quality and viability of the program:

- a. The evaluation of assessment documents, particularly in shared curricula, indicate inconsistencies between course and program learning outcomes. Alignment could improve quality of practices and allow for the adaptation of meaningful, targeted skills assessment.
- b. Evaluation of students' exit status and low utilization of articulation agreements indicate a need for improved retention and a review of existing agreements. Clarifying or updating transfer agreements may have a positive impact on retention efforts.

B. Action Items

The Office of Assessment and Evaluation makes the following recommendations to the senior leadership and the Board in response to the information collected *Academic Program Review (APR)*:

Recommendations – include items of concern, which should be addressed and re-examined, based on the *current* plan.

1. Evaluate articulation agreements

Both Programs have numerous articulation agreements; however, many of these are not utilized and are automatically created as part of the Pennsylvania Transfer and Articulation Center. Communication has 23 articulation agreements, 15 of which were not used during the five-year period studied. Mass Media has 21 articulation agreements, 13 of which were not used during the five-year period studied. Both Programs' largest feeder institution is Temple University. However, Communication Studies does not have an articulation agreement with Temple University even though 47 students from the Program transferred to Temple over the five-year period of study. The Programs should evaluate the relevance of their articulation agreements to determine if all agreements are necessary. The Program should confirm that an alignment exists between the College and the articulating institution. The Department Heads and Program faculty should focus on creating articulation agreements that align with the institutions to which students commonly transfer. The Programs should develop and distribute internal documents that clarify transfer options for students.

Recommended Timeline: Update end of Fall 2017

Persons Responsible: Curriculum Coordinator, Department Head

2. Improve retention with a focus on students earning less than 12 credits.

Over a five-year time period, the Communication Studies program enrolled on average 254 students a year and the Mass Media Program enrolled on average

89 students a year. Of the students that enrolled in the Communication Studies Program between 2009 and 2014, 509 left the Program and College, while only 70 of those students left the Program with a degree. Over the same time period, 152 Mass Media students left the Program and College, and 25 of those students left with a degree. The largest population of students to depart the College from the Communication Studies and Mass Media Programs was those that earned less than 12 credits. Approximately 49% of the students who departed the Communication Program earned less than 12 credits and approximately 38% of those that departed the Mass Media Program earned less than 12 credits. The Programs should evaluate and improve retention, especially among students enrolled in the first 12 credits.

Recommended Timeline: Update end of Fall 2017

Persons Responsible: Curriculum Coordinator, Department Head, Dean

Requirements– include items which threaten the quality or viability of the program. If the program is to continue, such items demand action and resolution. Required actions should be implemented and evaluated on both a short term (i.e. one term or academic year) and long term (within three years.)

3. Evaluate the quality and variety of assessment measures; ensure alignment between the Program Learning Outcomes and Student Learning Outcomes; ensure faculty collaboration of assessment planning and review across the department and among programs that utilize the courses; examine the extent to which the Programs incorporate common communication and mass media education trends and necessary skills for graduates into their outcomes and let these education trends and skills inform changes to assessment.

The Programs should evaluate whether an alignment exists between the Program Learning Outcomes and the Student Learning Outcomes and ensure that this alignment is clear to faculty, students, and administration. If necessary, faculty should evaluate the need for streamlining or consolidating PLOs and building assessment into the curriculum. Faculty should determine if they gain meaningful information from the assessment that is targeted to specific skills and that those skills track throughout the curriculum. Faculty should ensure that the curriculum map accurately represents where skills are introduced, reinforced, mastered, and assessed. A multi-year calendar of assessment activities will allow the program to more effectively manage and coordinate assessment – particularly within shared curricular areas.

Recommended Timeline: Update end of Fall 2017

Persons Responsible: Curriculum Coordinator, Department Head, Dean

C. Narrative Summary

Both the Communication Studies and Mass Media Programs lead to the Associate in Arts (A.A.) degree. Effective January 2011, both Programs underwent revisions. The goal of these revisions was to keep the Programs up-to-date with national trends, prepare students for transfer and prepare students with academic and career related skills. Six courses have been revised over the past five years.

Between 2009 and 2014 enrollment in the Communication Studies Program has increased by approximately 23%, averaging 254 students annually over the last five years. During this same time period, enrollment in the Mass Media Program has increased by approximately two and a half times and has averaged 89 students each fall over the past five years.

In terms of demographics, both programs enroll a higher percentage of African Americans and Latino/a students, a younger population, a higher percentage of full-time students, and a higher percentage of students needing some developmental coursework and a lower percentage of students needing all development coursework compared to the Division and the College.

The Communication Studies and Mass Media Programs record similar outcomes compared to the Division and the College in most areas. The biggest differences between the programs are that Mass Media records stronger retention rates than Communication Studies, the average of all Associates in Arts programs, the Division, and the College; and the Communication Studies Program records higher graduation rates than the Mass Media Program, the average of all Associates in Arts programs, the Division, and the College.

Over a five-year period, 37% of students from the Communication Studies Program and 40% from the Mass Media Program transferred to two or four year institutions.

The largest populations of students to depart the Programs and the College are those that have earned fewer than 12 credits, which is consistent with the trends of other Programs. Approximately 49% of Communication Studies students that departed the College earned less than 12 credits, while approximately 38% of Mass Media Students that departed the College earned less than 12 credits. College wide, approximately 59% of those that depart their Program and the College do so having earned less than 12 credits.

Questions in Academic Council focused on why students would be leaving with fewer than 12 credits. The sense from the program is that there is a population of students whose primary goal is to transfer as early as possible. There is a desire on the part of the curricular coordinator to develop a stronger, 'funnel,' to target students toward bachelors' programs which will be a good match.

Analysis of the two curricular maps revealed some inconsistencies. While the Programs share courses, different skills are attained in the same courses for each population.

Additionally, the Programs should evaluate the need to streamline outcomes, link student learning outcomes to program learning outcomes to assignments and ensure that these depict the learning that occurs in the classroom, build assessment into the curriculum, and ensure that the curriculum maps depict where learning is introduced, reinforced, mastered and assessed.

In Academic Council, the program and Dean discussed how much progress had already been made in editing learning outcomes, and that the current focus on Communication Studies would be followed by a review of course outcomes, and alignment with Mass Media program outcomes. The work is in line with progress made in Guided Pathways mapping.

The Communication Studies and Mass Media Degrees prepare graduates to transfer into a bachelor's program and eventually work as advertising and promotion managers, public relations specialists, and writers or authors. Locally and regionally, these fields are projected to grow slower than the national average of all jobs. Conversely, national job growth in these areas is strong. It may benefit students for the program to discuss relocation as a part of career preparation. The majority of people working in these fields have either a bachelor's or graduate degree and a small proportion have an associate's degree or less. The high proportion of employees with bachelor's or graduate degrees speaks to the importance of strong transfer agreements.

Community College *of* Philadelphia

Academic Program Review

Executive Summary Prepared

for

Student Outcomes Committee of the Board

Paralegal Studies A.A.S.

Paralegal Proficiency Certificate

Electronic Discovery Proficiency Certificate

Authors: Christine
McDonnell Krishna
Dunston

Contributor:
Kathy Smith

Date: February, 2016

Executive Summary

A. Key Findings

The Office of Assessment and Evaluation makes the following observations, with regard to the quality and viability of the program:

- i. **Robust Student Outcomes** - The program records strong outcomes, including a 48.8% graduation rate (*Executive Summary*, p. 3; *APR*¹, Table 3, p. 14)
- ii. **Elite Professional Recognition** - The program is approved by the American Bar Association. Fewer than 20% of all paralegal programs nationwide are approved by the ABA. (*APR*, D. Future Directions of the Field, p. 10)
- iii. **Growth Potential** – More employment opportunities exist than graduates to fill them. The program is well positioned to expand to meet demand. (*APR*, D. Future Directions of the Field, p. 10)
- iv. **Recruitment Needs** – Coordination of institutional and program recruitment efforts; with an eye toward demographic expansion, is suggested. (B. Action Item 1; *APR*, p.4, p.10)
- v. **Low Section Enrollment** – Robust selectivity of concentration courses with substantially low enrollments point to inefficiencies in section offerings. It is suggested that the program develop a plan to offer concentration courses in a manner logical and predictable to students. (B. Action Item 2; *Executive Summary*, p.4; *APR*, Table 6, p. 17)

B. Action Items

The Office of Assessment and Evaluation makes the following suggestions to senior leadership and the Outcomes Committee of the Board, in response to information collected in the *Academic Program Review (APR)*:

Suggestions –made with regard to quality improvement, further introduction of best practices, notations on the larger educational or career field, trends, and possible opportunities.

1. Coordinated Recruitment Plan

Recently the program has experienced a decrease in enrollment, which has been compounded by the reduction in the number of times a year that the Program enrolls new students. The Academic and Student Success Council felt the program would benefit from a coordinated recruitment plan. This plan should coordinate efforts at the Program and Institutional level. Additionally, the Program enrolls a higher proportion of female students and Caucasian students compared to the Division and the College. Given that the Program demographics mimics the demographic composition of the field, the Program should reach out to its Advisory Board for suggestions and input on how these diversity challenges might be addressed as part of a comprehensive plan.

¹ *APR*, refers to the full *Academic Program Review*

2. Section offering/ enrollment

The Program requires students to choose five out of 12 concentration courses for the certificate, five for the degree program. These concentration courses are offered on various topics such as Family Law, Tort, Real Estate Law, Business Organizations, Willis, and Trusts and Estates. The courses do not appear to be clustered or sequential. Students are able to select the courses that they feel best meet their career goals. However, it is unclear how students identify the best courses to meet their needs. This robust selectivity may not be working to every student's advantage. Faculty may want to clarify for students a default pathway for various career opportunities and provide more advising for the myriad options.

Most of these twelve concentration courses are offered each semester and are run with low enrollment. For example, *Environmental Law* has not run in the past five years. It is to the students and the program's advantage to investigate ways in which these courses may be offered predictably and logically, such as a planned course rotation.

C. Narrative Summary

The College offers an Associate's Degree in Paralegal Studies A.A.S., a Paralegal Studies Proficiency Certificate, and an Electronic Discovery Proficiency Certificate. Since 2010, three Paralegal Studies courses have been revised, the two proficiency certificates were created, and the Paralegal Studies A.A.S. was revised. The Coordinator and faculty are responsive to changes in the industry and revised and created these courses and programs to meet demands in the field.

The Paralegal Proficiency Certificate was designed to meet the needs of those who have already earned a degree in a major other than paralegal studies and wish to enter the paralegal field.

The Electronic Discovery Proficiency Certificate was designed to enable current Paralegal Studies students in either the degree or certificate program to enhance their skills and marketability by acquiring knowledge in E-discovery. E-discovery skills will enable graduates to act as liaisons between the legal professional and the digital forensics professional.

Both Certificate Programs opened too recently to track enrollment, demographic, and outcome figures.

Enrollment in the Paralegal Studies Program has averaged 107 students over the last five years. The Program records stronger outcomes compared to the Division and College in most areas. Approximately half of the students departing the Program graduate, compared to 10% college wide. The Program records differing demographics compared to the Division and the College in terms of gender, ethnicity, age, full time status, and students placing at college level. Approximately 80% of Paralegal Students place at college level upon enrolling at the College.

The Programs are supported by an active advisory committee and dedicated faculty. The advisory committee has extensive ties to the local industry and has played an integral part in shaping the program and establishing the new certificates. In addition to teaching, the faculty support the students in many co-curricular activities including service learning opportunities.

Two hundred and forty seven associate's degrees have been awarded between 2010 and 2014. Ten proficiency certificates were awarded in the 2014-2015 academic year. Approximately 40% of students who leave the Program transfer; over a five year timeframe, the largest recipients of transfer students were Pierce (17), Temple (13), St. Joseph's (10), and Pennsylvania State University (5).

The main shortcoming highlighted by this audit is that Paralegal Studies has recorded inefficient section offerings over the past five years compared to the Division and the College. Courses within the Program consistently run at about half of capacity. This shortfall is in contrast to strong program outcomes (Table 3, p. 14) and growth potential (*D. Future of the Field*, p.9). Review by the Academic and Student Success Council focused on the Program's readiness to take advantage of additional institutional support to extend visibility. The Council applauded outreach efforts already underway and felt a coordinated institutional support could have substantive impact.

The Program assessed all eight PLOs and uploaded the information into SharePoint. The Program uses multiple direct and indirect measures. As a means to improve teaching and learning, the program has incorporated more assignments that involve demonstrating professional skills, soft skills, and organizational skills. The program has also created the Electronic Discover course and certificate, provided additional guidance and support to improve students writing skills, fostered the internship program, and discussed revising the course learning outcomes.